Biogeosciences, 13, 5297–5314, 2016 www.biogeosciences.net/13/5297/2016/ doi:10.5194/bg-13-5297-2016 © Author(s) 2016. CC Attribution 3.0 License.





## Clumped isotopes in near-surface atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> over land, coast and ocean in Taiwan and its vicinity

Amzad Hussain Laskar<sup>1</sup> and Mao-Chang Liang<sup>1,2,3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Research Center for Environmental Changes, Academia Sinica, Taipei, Taiwan
<sup>2</sup>Graduate Institute of Astronomy, National Central University, Taiwan
<sup>3</sup>Department of Physics, University of Houston, USA

Correspondence to: Mao-Chang Liang (mcl@rcec.sinica.edu.tw)

Received: 20 March 2016 – Published in Biogeosciences Discuss.: 18 April 2016 Revised: 3 August 2016 – Accepted: 29 August 2016 – Published: 22 September 2016

Abstract. Molecules containing two rare isotopes (e.g.,  $^{13}C^{18}O^{16}O$  in CO<sub>2</sub>), called clumped isotopes, in atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> are powerful tools to provide an alternative way to independently constrain the sources of CO<sub>2</sub> in the atmosphere because of their unique physical and chemical properties. We presented clumped isotope data ( $\Delta_{47}$ ) in near-surface atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> from urban, suburban, ocean, coast, high mountain ( $\sim$  3.2 km a.s.l.) and forest in Taiwan and its vicinity. The primary goal of the study was to use the unique  $\Delta_{47}$  signature in atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> to show the extents of its deviations from thermodynamic equilibrium due to different processes such as photosynthesis, respiration and local anthropogenic emissions, which the commonly used tracers such as  $\delta^{13}C$ and  $\delta^{18}$ O cannot provide. We also explored the potential of  $\Delta_{47}$  to identify/quantify the contribution of CO<sub>2</sub> from various sources. Atmospheric CO2 over ocean was found to be in thermodynamic equilibrium with the surrounding surface sea water. Respired CO<sub>2</sub> was also in close thermodynamic equilibrium at ambient air temperature. In contrast, photosynthetic activity result in significant deviation in  $\Delta_{47}$  values from that expected thermodynamically. The disequilibrium could be a consequence of kinetic effects associated with the diffusion of CO<sub>2</sub> in and out of the leaf stomata. We observed that  $\delta^{18}$ O and  $\Delta_{47}$  do not vary similarly when photosynthesis was involved unlike simple water-CO2 exchange. Additionally we obtained  $\Delta_{47}$  values of car exhaust CO<sub>2</sub> that were significantly lower than the atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> but higher than that expected at the combustion temperature. In urban and suburban regions, the  $\Delta_{47}$  values were found to be lower than the thermodynamic equilibrium values at the ambient temperature, suggesting contributions from local combustion emission.

## 1 Introduction

The budget of atmospheric  $CO_2$  is widely studied using the temporal and spatial variations in concentration and conventional isotopic compositions ( $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O) of CO<sub>2</sub> (Francey and Tans, 1987; Francey et al., 1995; Yakir and Wang, 1996; Ciais et al., 1995a, b, 1997; Peylin et al., 1999; Cuntz et al., 2003; Drake et al., 2011; Welp et al., 2011; Affek and Yakir, 2014).  $\delta^{13}$ C is useful to differentiate the exchange of  $CO_2$  with the ocean and land biospheres. This is due to the fact that the photosynthetic discrimination against <sup>13</sup>C during exchange with land plants is higher than that associated with the chemical dissolution of CO<sub>2</sub> in the ocean (e.g., Tans et al., 1993; Ciais et al., 1995a; Francey et al., 1995; Ito, 2003; Bowling et al., 2014). The major limitation of  $\delta^{13}$ C is that it cannot distinguish CO<sub>2</sub> produced by high-temperature combustion or low-temperature respiration (Affek and Eiler, 2006; Laskar et al., 2016a).  $\delta^{18}$ O in atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> is mainly controlled by various water reservoirs (ocean, leaf and soil). In urban locations, a significant fraction of CO<sub>2</sub> may have combustion origin possessing  $\delta^{18}$ O signature of atmospheric O<sub>2</sub> (Kroopnick and Craig, 1972; Ciais et al., 1997; Yakir and Wang, 1996).  $\delta^{18}$ O is used for partitioning net CO<sub>2</sub> terrestrial fluxes between soil respiration and that exchange with plant leaves, the exchange rate is enhanced by the presence of carbonic anhydrase in plants and soils (Francey and Tans, 1987; Farquhar and Lioyd, 1993; Yakir and Wang, 1996; Ciais et al., 1997; Peylin et al., 1999; Murayama et al., 2010; Welp et al., 2011). This is because  $\delta^{18}$ O of CO<sub>2</sub> fluxes originated from soil respiration is different from that exchanged with leaf water.  $\delta^{18}$ O in soil water reflects the  $\delta^{18}$ O value of local meteoric water while leaf water is relatively enriched due to transpiration. The  $\delta^{18}$ O values from these processes and interactions are different and hence the tracer is widely used for constraining the gross production of CO<sub>2</sub> (Francey and Tans, 1987; Ciais et al., 1997; Gillon and Yakir, 2001; Cuntz et al., 2003; Welp et al., 2011). However, due to rapid exchange of oxygen isotopes between CO<sub>2</sub> and different water reservoirs with diverse  $\delta^{18}$ O and processes such as evapotranspiration complicate its interpretation (Riley et al., 2003).

The doubly substituted isotopologues or clumped isotopes such as  ${}^{13}C^{18}O^{16}O$  in CO<sub>2</sub>, denoted by  $\Delta_{47}$ , provides an additional and independent constraint to study the atmospheric  $CO_2$  budget.  $\Delta_{47}$  in air  $CO_2$  can help to identify the mechanisms for CO<sub>2</sub> production and consumption. Unlike conventional isotopes, clumped isotope studies for the atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> are very limited mainly because of challenges to apply it to the atmospheric study (Eiler and Schauble, 2004; Affek et al., 2007; Yeung et al., 2009). The available data are not sufficient to address some key issues such as quantification of CO<sub>2</sub> from different sources and to what extent the air CO<sub>2</sub> is in thermodynamic equilibrium with leaf and surface waters, especially in regions with strong anthropogenic activities such as urban areas. Also the effect of photosynthesis on the  $\Delta_{47}$  of air CO<sub>2</sub> has not been studied rigorously.  $\delta^{18}$ O and  $\Delta_{47}$  were reported to have similar timescales for the isotope exchange between CO<sub>2</sub> and water (Affek, 2013; Clog et al., 2015), but no comparative study on their behavior in presence of other processes such as photosynthesis and respiration was done. A combined assessment from all the three aforementioned isotopic tracers can better constrain the budget of CO<sub>2</sub> and associated processes than  $\delta^{13}$ C or  $\delta^{18}$ O alone.

Theoretically it is shown that in thermodynamic equilibrium,  $\Delta_{47}$  values of CO<sub>2</sub> are temperature dependent (Eiler and Schauble, 2004; Wang et al., 2004), verified over a wide range from 10 to 1000 °C (Dennis et al., 2011). Processes that involve CO<sub>2</sub> and liquid water as medium, such as isotopic exchange with ocean water, are expected to have  $\Delta_{47}$ values close to the thermodynamic equilibrium.  $\Delta_{47}$  values in ambient air CO<sub>2</sub> should reflect a balance of CO<sub>2</sub> fluxes between biosphere-atmosphere exchange, ocean-atmosphere exchange and emissions from combustion sources. Photosynthesis involves gas-phase diffusion of CO<sub>2</sub> into leaves, fixes about one-third of the  $CO_2$  and returns the rest back to the atmosphere. CO<sub>2</sub> molecules inside a leaf are generally expected to be in thermodynamic equilibrium with leaf water because of presence of enzymatic carbonic anhydrase that greatly enhances the isotopic exchange (Cernusak et al., 2004).  $\Delta_{47}$  values of soil respired CO<sub>2</sub> is also not well constrained, though it is believed to be in thermodynamic equilibrium with the soil water (Eiler and Schauble, 2004).

Here, we present clumped and conventional isotope data in near-surface air  $CO_2$ , covering a wide variety of processes and interactions. Air samplings were made in South China Sea, two coastal stations in northern Taiwan, an urban traffic street, a suburban location, a forest site, a greenhouse, the top of a high mountain and car exhaust. The study was designed and aimed to show the extents of the deviations of near-surface atmospheric  $CO_2$  from thermodynamic equilibrium with local surface water. Possible influences from other processes such as anthropogenic emission, respiration and photosynthesis on clumped isotopes were explored.

#### 2 Materials and methods

Stable isotopic compositions of CO<sub>2</sub> including mass 47 were measured using a Finnigan MAT 253 stable gas source isotope ratio mass spectrometer configured to measure ion beams corresponding to m/z 44 through 49. The instrument registers the major ion beams (44, 45 and 46) through resistors  $10^8$ ,  $3 \times 10^{10}$  and  $10^{11}$  Ohm, respectively, and minor ion beams (47, 48 and 49) through  $10^{12}$  Ohm. All the measurements were carried out at Research Center for Environmental Changes, Academia Sinica, Taiwan.

Air samples were collected in 2 L flasks and compressed to 2 bar atmospheric pressure using a membrane pump. The flasks, equipped with two stopcocks, were first flushed with the ambient air for  $\sim 10$  min before starting the sample collection. We then closed the downstream end stopcock, allowed the pressure to build to 2 bar and then isolated by closing the other stopcock. The air pumping for flushing and sampling was carried out through a column packed with magnesium perchlorate to remove moisture. The moisture content was reduced from the ambient value of 70–90 % to less than 1 % relative humidity, checked using a LI-COR infrared gas analyzer (model 840A, LI-COR, USA). See, for example, Liang and Mahata (2015) for more details of air sampling.

To show how photosynthesis and respiration affect the abundances of CO<sub>2</sub> isotopologues and to demonstrate what different information the  $\Delta_{47}$  can give from the other isotopologues, we performed analyses for CO2 collected in a controlled greenhouse with cemented floor located in the top (third) floor of the Greenhouse Building, Academia Sinica. The size of the greenhouse was about 8 m long, 5 m wide and 5 m high. It was closed at least 1 day before each experiment and the ventilation was kept off. More than 70 % of the ground area inside the greenhouse was occupied with Cin*namomum cassia* plants, each of  $\sim 2 \,\mathrm{m}$  height kept in pots. Samples were collected at intervals of less than half an hour to a few hours on 3 sunny days and 1 cloudy day to investigate the influence of photosynthesis and respiration on the isotopologues of  $CO_2$ . Inside the room relative humidity was  $\sim$  50–70 % for the 3 sunny days and was above 90 % for the cloudy day.



**Figure 1.** Left panel: map of Taiwan and South China Sea with the locations of marine air sampling stations (**a**–**e**). The coastal stations 1 and 2 are Fugui Cape and Keelung and 3 is the high mountain station Hehuan ( $\sim$  3.2 km a.s.l.). Right panel: part of Taipei city with sampling stations Roosevelt Road (RR), grassland in the National Taiwan University (NTU) Campus, suburban site inside the campus of Academia Sinica (AS) and forest site.

Forest air CO<sub>2</sub> was collected from a dense natural forest at the west end of the Academia Sinica Campus. The vegetation mainly consists of medium to big size trees with canopy heights varying between 10 and 20 m. The samples were collected  $\sim 100$  m inside the forest on a small plateau at a height of  $\sim 30$  m from the ground in the slope of a hill; the dense vegetation allowed little sunlight penetrating to the surface. The relative humidity at the site was 80-90 % during the sampling days and wind speed was nearly zero due to presence of hills on three sides of the sampling spot. Marine air was collected during a cruise in the South China Sea (for the cruise track see Fig. 1) at a height of  $\sim 10 \text{ m a.s.l.}$  and from two coastal stations: Keelung (25°09'6" N, 121°46'22" E) and Fugui Cape  $(25^{\circ}18' \text{ N}, 121^{\circ}32' \text{ E})$  (Fig. 1) at a height of  $\sim 5$ and  $\sim 20$  m a.s.l., respectively. Sea surface temperatures were measured at the time of sampling. Urban air was collected at a bus stop on Roosevelt Road, a busy street in Taipei. Suburban air was collected from an open roof ( $\sim 30 \,\text{m}$  above ground) of Institute of Earth Science Building, Academia Sinica (AS; 25°2'41" N, 121°36'52" E); grassland air was collected from a grass field in front of the Department of Atmospheric Science, National Taiwan University Campus (NTU; 25°1′ N, 121°30′ E), Taipei. In addition, we collected air from the summit of the Hehuan mountain (24°8'15" N, 121°16′32″ E; 3.2 km a.s.l.) (Fig. 1) on 9 October 2013. All air samplings were made when there was no rain to avoid direct interaction with the rainwater. Car exhaust was collected from a Mazda 3000 cc TRIBUTE and a Mitsubishi 2400 cc New Outlander, using evacuated 2L glass flasks from  $\sim 20$  cm inside the exhaust pipes through a column of magnesium perchlorate.

 $CO_2$  was extracted from air using a glass vacuum line connected to a turbo molecular pump by cryogenic technique. The vacuum line as well as the sample flask connection assembly including its head space was pumped to high vacuum before starting the  $CO_2$  extraction. Air in the flask was pumped through a series of five coiled traps, with the first two immersed in dry ice-acetone slush (-77 °C) for trace moisture removal followed by three in liquid nitrogen  $(-196 \,^{\circ}\text{C})$ . CO<sub>2</sub> was collected from the traps immersed in liquid nitrogen by repeated freeze-thaw technique at liquid nitrogen and dry ice temperatures for further removal of traces of water (see Mahata et al., 2012; Liang and Mahata, 2015 for details). The air was pumped for 40–45 min at a controlled rate of  $\sim 90 \,\mathrm{mL}\,\mathrm{min}^{-1}$  using a mass flow controller; the pressure on the post-mass-flow controller side of the vacuum line was  $\sim$  10 mm of Hg. No measurable isotopic fractionation caused by mass flow controller at this flow rate was observed when checked using several aliquots of air from a high-volume compressed air cylinder ( $\sim 40$  L at 2000 psi). For car exhaust, an aliquot of exhaust air was transferred to a 60 mL bottle and CO2 was fully extracted cryogenically following the same protocol as discussed above (but with mass flow controller step skipped).

CO<sub>2</sub> was further purified from other condensable species like N<sub>2</sub>O, CH<sub>4</sub> and hydrocarbons by means of gas chromatography (Agilent 6890N, with a  $3.0 \text{ m} \times 0.3 \text{ cm}$  stainless steel column packed with PorapakQ 80/100 mesh, supplied by Supelco Analytical, Bellefonte, PA, USA) with the column kept at -10 °C. High-purity helium (> 99.9999 % supplied by Air Products and Chemicals, Inc.) at  $20 \,\mathrm{mL}\,\mathrm{min}^{-1}$ was used as carrier gas. CO2 was eluted first, followed forthwith by N<sub>2</sub>O, and CH<sub>4</sub>, hydrocarbons and traces of water came out much later. To get an optimized condition for CO<sub>2</sub>, we checked the separation of CO<sub>2</sub> from N<sub>2</sub>O with varying proportions and at various temperatures (25 to -20 °C) and found a temperature of  $-10^{\circ}$ C at which column separated CO<sub>2</sub> from N<sub>2</sub>O perfectly (see Laskar et al., 2016b, for details). The column was baked at 200 °C for more than 2h prior to use. The conditioned column is good for purifying three samples. At the end of the day, long baking (8–10h) was performed. At the initial phase the working gas was taken from a high-purity commercial CO2 called AS-2 ( $\delta^{13}$ C = -32.54 ‰ with respect to VPDB and  $\delta^{18}$ O =



**Figure 2.** Diurnal variation of (a) concentration, (b)  $\delta^{13}$ C and (c)  $\delta^{18}$ O of CO<sub>2</sub> sampled in the greenhouse. Keeling plots for (d)  $\delta^{13}$ C and (e)  $\delta^{18}$ O and (f) scatter plot of  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O to show their covariance.

36.61 ‰ with respect to VSMOW) procured from a local supplier (Air Products and Chemicals, Inc.). As the difference between the isotopic compositions of samples and AS-2 was high, we later changed the reference to Oztech CO<sub>2</sub> ( $\delta^{13}C = -3.59$  and  $\delta^{18}O = 24.96\%$ ) (Oztech Trading Corporation, USA) from December 2014 onward. No detectable difference in isotopic compositions including  $\Delta_{47}$  was observed between the analyses from different working references. All  $\delta^{13}C$  values presented in this work are expressed in VPDB scale and  $\delta^{18}O$  in VSMOW scale, unless specified otherwise.  $\Delta_{47}$  is calculated following Affek and Eiler (2006):

$$\Delta_{47} = \begin{bmatrix} \frac{R^{47}}{2R^{13}R^{18} + 2R^{17}R^{18} + R^{13}(R^{17})^2} \\ R^{46} & R^{45} \end{bmatrix}$$
(1)

$$-\frac{R^{45}}{2R^{18}+2R^{13}R^{17}+(R^{17})^2}-\frac{R^{45}}{R^{13}+2R^{17}}+1\right]\times 1000$$

where  $R^{13}$  and  $R^{18}$  (ratios  ${}^{13}\text{C}/{}^{12}\text{C}$  and  ${}^{18}\text{O}/{}^{16}\text{O}$ ) are obtained by measuring the conventional masses 44, 45 and 46 in the same CO<sub>2</sub> sample and  $R^{17}$  is calculated assuming a mass-dependent relation with  $R^{18}$  given by  $R^{17} = R_{\text{VSMOW}}^{17} \left( R^{18}/R_{\text{VSMOW}}^{18} \right)^{\lambda}$ , where exponent  $\lambda = 0.5164$  is used for all  $\Delta_{47}$  calculations (Affek and Eiler, 2006). The value of  $\lambda$  varies between 0.516 and 0.523 (Hoag et al., 2005; Barkan and Luz, 2012; Hofmann et al., 2012; Thiemens et al., 2014). The variation in  $\Delta_{47}$  was less than 0.01% at 25 °C when the exponent was varied over the aforementioned range. This variation was comparable to the measurement uncertainty and hence not considered here; all the calculations were based on  $\lambda = 0.5164$ .  $\Delta_{47}$  is obtained by measuring CO<sub>2</sub> with respect to which the isotopes among various CO<sub>2</sub> isotopologues are distributed randomly ( $\Delta_{47} \sim 0\%$ ). Practically, this random distribution is approached by heating CO<sub>2</sub> at 1000 °C for more than 2 h (Eiler and Schauble, 2004; Affek and Eiler, 2006). Measurements were made with a stable  $\sim 12$  V signal at mass 44, with peak centering, background scanning and pressure balancing before each acquisition started. Each sample was analyzed for 10 acquisitions, 10 cycles each, at an integration time of 8 s; the total analysis time was approximately 2.5 h. Masses 48 and 49 were monitored to check isobaric interferences due to contamination of hydrocarbons (Ghosh et al., 2006). Details about the corrections due to nonlinearity related to  $\Delta_{47}$  measurements in the mass spectrometer and reference frame equation for expressing the measured  $\Delta_{47}$  values in absolute reference frame (ARF) were discussed in Laskar et al. (2016b). To obtain the temperature from the  $\Delta_{47}$  values, we used the following relation (Dennis et al., 2011):

$$\Delta_{47} = 0.003 \left(\frac{1000}{T}\right)^4 - 0.0438 \left(\frac{1000}{T}\right)^3$$
(2)  
+ 0.2553  $\left(\frac{1000}{T}\right)^2 - 0.2195 \left(\frac{1000}{T}\right) + 0.0616.$ 

The reproducibility (1  $\sigma$  standard deviation) for air CO<sub>2</sub> measurements was established from three aliquots of CO<sub>2</sub> extracted from a compressed air cylinder with CO<sub>2</sub> concentration ([CO<sub>2</sub>]) of ~ 388 ppmv. The 1  $\sigma$  standard deviations were 0.07, 0.08 and 0.01 % for  $\delta^{13}$ C,  $\delta^{18}$ O and  $\Delta_{47}$ , respectively (Table S1 in the Supplement). The long-term reproducibility in  $\Delta_{47}$  measurements was found to be 0.014%

**Table 1.** Diurnal variation of  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O and clumped isotopes ( $\Delta_{47}$ ) for greenhouse CO<sub>2</sub>. Temperatures estimated using  $\Delta_{47}$  values and actual air temperatures inside the greenhouse at the time of sampling are also presented.

Date	Time	Conc. (ppmv)	δ <sup>13</sup> C (‰) (VPDB)	δ <sup>18</sup> O (‰) (VSMOW)	δ <sup>47</sup> (‰)	SE	Δ <sub>47</sub> (‰) (ARF)	SE	Δ <sub>48</sub> (‰)	Estimated temp. (°C)	Air temp. (°C)
	04:50	481	-11.60	39.61	6.99	0.02	0.927	0.016	0.2	24	25.5
2015	06:00	462	-10.90	39.92	8.16	0.02	0.936	0.018	0.6	21	26
	07:06	435	-9.80	40.54	9.71	0.02	0.911	0.017	0.2	28	29
ul 2	08:10	428	-9.60	40.92	10.38	0.02	0.883	0.014	-0.2	33	33.5
8 JI	09:15	416	-9.06	41.36	11.30	0.01	0.908	0.011	0.2	24	39
0	10:15	422	-9.55	40.82	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
	12:40	407	-8.77	41.58	11.75	0.01	0.898	0.010	0.2	27	48
	05:00	522	-12.72	38.66	5.10	0.01	0.926	0.015	0.3	24	26
	06:00	512	-12.37	38.95	5.94	0.01	0.926	0.014	0.5	25	26
	07:00	451	-10.08	40.36	9.39	0.02	0.923	0.011	0.4	25	28
15	08:15	405	-8.82	40.98	11.25	0.02	0.912	0.020	0.4	28	33
20	09:10	412	-9.12	41.07	11.26	0.02	0.880	0.020	0.6	34	37.5
Jul	10:00	414	-9.35	40.83	11.52	0.01	0.906	0.010	0.6	23	43.5
31	11:20	411	-9.26	40.99	11.12	0.02	0.896	0.025	0.5	31	48
	15:00	432	-9.90	40.36	9.55	0.02	0.877	0.015	0.5	34	41.5
	17:25	423	-9.22	41.07	12.48	0.02	0.929	0.013	0.7	25	32
	21:30	462	-10.92	39.99	7.90	0.01	0.911	0.012	0.4	28	27
	04:50	465	-11.03	40.37	8.41	0.01	0.936	0.012	0.27	23	24
	05:50	455	-10.82	40.26	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
	06:28	448	-10.27	41.00	10.01	0.02	0.931	0.017	0.7	24	25.5
	06:50	439	-9.90	41.32	10.10	0.02	0.942	0.009	0.6	22	26
15	07:15	420	-9.34	41.22	11.05	0.01	0.914	0.013	0.6	28	28.5
; 20	07:40	419	-9.18	41.22	11.05	0.01	0.927	0.011	0.3	25	30
Aug	08:10	405	-8.55	41.56	12.79	0.02	0.900	0.015	0.6	31	32.5
4	09:45	427	-9.75	40.73	10.81	0.02	0.870	0.023	0.3	36	40
	14:00	414	-9.20	41.01	11.02	0.01	0.896	0.011	0.6	31	46
	16:15	414	-9.09	41.11	11.11	0.01	0.944	0.014	0.7	22	36.5
	19:15	413	-9.01	41.38	13.28	0.01	0.921	0.010	0.9	26	29.2
	22:30	450	-10.58	40.61	9.34	0.02	0.924	0.022	0.4	25	26.5
	05:45	418	-9.30	40.87	10.80	0.01	0.934	0.013	0.5	23	22
)15	07:00	413	-9.08	41.18	10.95	0.02	0.940	0.021	0.4	22	22
t 2(	10:00	390	-7.78	41.66	13.00	0.02	0.918	0.014	0.6	26	25
00	11:50	388	-7.84	41.71	15.25	0.01	0.919	0.010	0.6	26	27
12	14:30	382	-7.82	42.24	14.27	0.02	0.891	0.017	0.4	31	28
	20:10	418	-9.17	40.61	10.85	0.02	0.933	0.017	0.5	23	23

(Laskar et al., 2016b) and the accuracy in  $\Delta_{47}$  values in terms of temperature, based on CO<sub>2</sub> equilibrated with water at known temperatures were better than 3 °C (see Table S2 in Supplement).

For  $[CO_2]$  measurements, flasks of volume 350 cc were used. These small flasks were connected in series with the larger flasks used for isotopic measurements.  $[CO_2]$  was measured using a LI-COR infrared gas analyzer (model 840A, LI-COR, USA) at 4 Hz, smoothed with 20 s moving average. The analyzer was calibrated against a working standard (air compressed in a cylinder) with a nominal  $[CO_2]$  of 387.7 ppmv and a CO<sub>2</sub>-free N<sub>2</sub> cylinder. The reproducibility of LI-COR was better than 1 ppmv. The working standard was calibrated using a commercial Picarro analyzer (model G1301, Picarro, USA) by a series of NOAA/GMD certified tertiary standards with  $[CO_2]$  of 369.9, 392.0, 409.2 and 516.3 ppmv, with a precision (1  $\sigma$  standard deviation) of 0.2 ppmv. The  $[CO_2]$  in car exhaust was estimated by gravimetric technique using an MKS Baratron gauge.

Ambient temperatures were taken from the nearest governmental weather stations (operated by Central Weather Bureau, Taiwan): Nankang (for AS; station code: C0A9G0; 25°03′27 N, 121°35′41 E; 42 m a.s.l.), Taipei (for NTU; station code: C1A730; 25°00′58 N, 121°31′53 E; 22 m a.s.l.), Hehuan mountain (station code: C0H9C1; 24°08′41 N, 121°15′51 E; 3240 m a.s.l.) and Keelung coast (for the two



**Figure 3.** Diurnal variation of the  $\Delta_{47}$  and  $\delta^{18}$ O values in the greenhouse for samples collected on 4 days of 2015: (a) 28 July, (b) 31 July, (c) 4 August and (d) 12 October. The first 3 days (**a**-**c**) were bright sunny days and the last was (d) a cloudy day with covered rooftop (see texts for details). The error bars are 1 standard error associated with the measurements.

coastal sites; station code: 466940; 25°08′05 N, 121°43′56 E; 26.7 m a.s.l.).

#### 3 Results

#### 3.1 Greenhouse CO<sub>2</sub>

Diurnal variation in the concentration and isotopic compositions of  $CO_2$  inside the controlled greenhouse is shown in Fig. 2. The lowest CO<sub>2</sub> concentration [CO<sub>2</sub>] and highest  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O values were observed during late morning hours, while highest [CO<sub>2</sub>] and lowest  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O values were observed during nighttime and early morning before sunrise (Table 1 and Fig. 2a-c), indicating that respiration and photosynthesis played the major role in controlling the variations of the [CO<sub>2</sub>] and isotopic compositions. A Keeling plot, a graphical approach plotted between isotopic composition and the inverse of the concentration, is used to determine the isotopic composition of the source (Pataki et al., 2003). It is valid for a mixing of two components; the intercept of the plot gives the source isotopic composition. Respiration was the main source of CO<sub>2</sub> here added to the background CO<sub>2</sub>. Keeling analysis for  $\delta^{13}$ C had an intercept of  $-26.32 \pm 0.40$  % (Fig. 2d), a value expected for C<sub>3</sub> plant respired CO<sub>2</sub>. The Keeling plot for  $\delta^{18}$ O had an intercept of  $30.68 \pm 0.73 \%$  (Fig. 2e), which could be explained by a combined effect of respired CO<sub>2</sub> equilibrated with soil water and kinetic fractionation associated with the diffusion of CO<sub>2</sub> from soil to the air. A Keeling plot for  $\delta^{13}$ C with the early morning and nighttime greenhouse data, when photosynthesis was absent, was found to have same intercept as observed with all the data, only the correlation was better for the latter ( $R^2 = 0.999$ , not shown). The tight correlations among [CO<sub>2</sub>],  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O (Fig. 2d–f) suggest that photosynthesis and respiration were the dominant processes controlling their variations, while mixing with ambient air and anthropogenic contribution of CO<sub>2</sub> were insignificant.

In contrast,  $\Delta_{47}$  shows different patterns of diurnal variability due to the effect of photosynthesis and respiration. Figure 3a–d detail diurnal variations in  $\Delta_{47}$  in the greenhouse  $CO_2$  on 4 different days. The first three were bright sunny days with photosynthesis as the dominant process while the last one was a dark cloudy day affected more by respiration. To further reduce photosynthetic activity on the last day, two layers of black cloth that cut down the incident sunlight by  $\sim$  50 % were deployed. The measured  $\Delta_{47}$  values were also compared with the thermodynamic equilibrium values. The maximum value of  $\Delta_{47}$  was observed in the morning before  $\sim$  08:00 and at night and the values were similar to the thermodynamic equilibrium values at the ambient temperatures. This indicates that the respired CO<sub>2</sub> was in close thermodynamic equilibrium with the leaf and soil water. The daytime (from 09:00 to 17:00)  $\Delta_{47}$  values for the 3 sunny days were higher than the thermodynamic equilibrium values. The  $\Delta_{47}$  values were observed to decrease steadily in the early



Figure 4. Correlation between the observed and thermodynamic equilibrium  $\Delta_{47}$  values for greenhouse CO<sub>2</sub> samples collected when (a) photosynthesis was weak and respiration was strong and (b) photosynthesis was strong and respiration was weak.

**Table 2.** Stable carbon and oxygen isotopic composition and clumped isotopes ( $\Delta_{47}$ ) for car exhaust CO<sub>2</sub>. Temperatures estimated using  $\Delta_{47}$  values and lowest possible combustion temperatures are given.

Car model	Conc. (ppm)	δ <sup>13</sup> C (‰) (VPDB)	δ <sup>18</sup> O (‰) (VSMOW)	$\delta^{47}$ (‰)	SE	Δ <sub>47</sub> (‰) (ARF)	SE	Δ <sub>48</sub> (‰)	Estimated temp. (°C)	Combustion temp. (°C)
Mazda 3000 cc TRIBUTE	39 400	-27.73	25.43	-22.20	0.01	0.251	0.013	-0.4	300	800
Mitsubishi 2400 cc New Outlander	39 300	-27.67	25.27	-23.08	0.02	0.294	0.007	-0.3	265	800
Average $\pm 1\sigma$	$39350\pm50$	$-27.70\pm0.03$	$25.35\pm0.07$	$-22.64\pm0.44$		$0.273\pm0.021$			$283\pm18$	

morning before ~09:00 and increase afterwards (Fig. 3). By comparing the  $\Delta_{47}$  values acquired on the sunny days with that on the cloudy day, we noticed that when photosynthesis was weak, the  $\Delta_{47}$  value was close to the thermodynamic equilibrium with soil and leaf water (Fig. 4). The correlation between  $\Delta_{47}$  and [CO<sub>2</sub>],  $\delta^{13}$ C or  $\delta^{18}$ O (Fig. 3d) was observed only when the photosynthesis was weak. This suggests that  $\Delta_{47}$  carries information different from concentration and conventional isotopic composition when photosynthesis occurs. See Sect. 4.1 for detailed discussion.

#### 3.2 Car exhaust

The [CO<sub>2</sub>],  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O values of car exhaust CO<sub>2</sub> were 39 350 ± 50 ppmv, -27.70 ± 0.03 and 25.35 ± 0.07‰, respectively (Table 2).  $\delta^{13}$ C value was similar to that reported elsewhere (Newman et al., 2008; Popa et al., 2014), the  $\delta^{18}$ O was slightly higher than the atmospheric O<sub>2</sub> (~23.5‰), and the source of O<sub>2</sub> for combustion. The average value of  $\Delta_{47}$  for the exhaust from the two cars was 0.273 ± 0.021‰, which gave a temperature of 282 ± 17 °C (Table 2). This temperature is much lower than the fuel combustion temperatures (> 800 °C). The possible reason for higher values of  $\delta^{18}$ O and  $\Delta_{47}$  in the exhaust CO<sub>2</sub> than expected was postcombustion partial exchange with water and other gaseous species, released during combustion, inside the catalytic converter and the exhaust pipe (see discussion in Sect. 4.2).

#### 3.3 Atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> over ocean and coasts

Isotopic compositions including  $\Delta_{47}$  values obtained for CO<sub>2</sub> over ocean and coasts are presented in Table 3. The averaged [CO<sub>2</sub>] over ocean between latitudes 18°03' and 21°17′ N was 395  $\pm$  7 ppmv, and the values of  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O were  $-8.43 \pm 0.19$  and  $40.72 \pm 0.20\%$ , respectively (Table 3). In the coastal stations, the averaged values of  $[CO_2], \delta^{13}C$  and  $\delta^{18}O$  were  $397 \pm 10 \text{ ppmv}, -8.48 \pm 0.11$ and  $40.70 \pm 0.29$  %, respectively. Both the [CO<sub>2</sub>] and  $\delta^{13}$ C values over the ocean and coasts were similar to those observed at Mauna Loa during the sampling period, suggesting little contribution from local/regional anthropogenic sources. The Keeling analysis for  $\delta^{13}$ C gave an intercept of -13.61%(Fig. 5a) for the air CO<sub>2</sub> collected over the ocean and coasts.  $\delta^{18}$ O of air CO<sub>2</sub> over the ocean was close to the isotopic equilibrium values with the surface sea water at the sea surface temperatures (see Sect. 4.3). The  $\Delta_{47}$  values varied between 0.880 and 0.946 % for the marine and coastal CO<sub>2</sub> (Table 3, Fig. 5b), similar to that predicted at thermodynamic equilibrium at sea surface temperatures (obtained using Eq. 2). Therefore, both  $\delta^{18}$ O and  $\Delta_{47}$  values suggest that the air CO<sub>2</sub> over the ocean was in close thermodynamic equilibrium with the underlying sea water.

**Table 3.** Stable isotopic composition including  $\Delta_{47}$  for atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> collected over South China Sea and two coastal stations (see Fig. 1 for sampling locations). Temperatures estimated using  $\Delta_{47}$  values and the sea surface temperatures at the time of samplings are also presented.

Marine air CO <sub>2</sub>												
Date	Time	Conc. (ppm)	δ <sup>13</sup> C (‰) (VPDB)	δ <sup>18</sup> O (‰) (VSMOW)	$\delta^{47}~(\%)$	SE	Δ <sub>47</sub> (‰) (ARF)	SE	Δ <sub>48</sub> (‰)	Estimated temp. (°C)	Sea surface temp. (°C)	
South China Se	a*											
15 Oct 2013	08:15 (A)	403	-8.42	40.85	28.752	0.016	0.901	0.017	1.9	30	28.3	
	13:15 (B)	400	-8.46	40.80	28.441	0.012	0.919	0.011	2.6	26	28.3	
	18:00 (C)	406	-8.75	40.54	28.133	0.013	0.933	0.013	2.2	24	28.3	
16 Oct 2013	07:00 (D)	391	-8.76	40.53	27.916	0.024	0.903	0.023	3.9	29	28.2	
	12:05 (E)	397	-8.44	40.86	28.535	0.015	0.910	0.015	3.3	28	28.2	
	14:00 (E)	391	-8.30	40.96	28.922	0.021	0.934	0.021	3.0	23	28.2	
	17:20 (E)	395	-8.31	41.02	28.944	0.017	0.908	0.016	1.9	29	28.1	
	20:20 (E)	388	-8.19	40.52	28.909	0.018	0.930	0.018	3.8	24	28.1	
17 Oct 2013	08:40 (E)	383	-8.26	40.41	28.194	0.018	0.925	0.018	4.3	25	28.1	
Average $\pm 1\sigma$	$395\pm7$	$-8.43\pm0.19$	$40.72\pm0.20$	$28.52\pm0.36$		$0.918\pm0.012$			$27\pm2$	$28.2\pm0.1$		
Keelung												
3 Oct 2013	11:30	380	-8.31	40.31	28.053	0.020	0.896	0.021	3	31	27.5	
	12:30	384	-8.40	40.92	29.089	0.017	0.917	0.016	1.9	27	27.5	
13 Nov 2013	11:00	401	-8.45	40.62	29.645	0.015	0.946	0.016	4.0	21	27.5	
21 Nov 2013	12:30		-8.47	40.78	29.866	0.017	0.890	0.010	1.1	32	27.5	
28 Nov 2013	12:00	410	-8.60	40.21	28.992	0.011	0.908	0.010	2.2	28	27.5	
Average $\pm 1\sigma$	$394\pm12$	$-8.45\pm0.09$	$40.57\pm0.26$	$29.12\pm0.63$		$0.911\pm0.020$			$28\pm 4$	27.5		
Fugui Cape												
13 Nov 2013	13:30	401	-8.47	40.76	29.56	0.02	0.916	0.016	1.1	27	27.5	
21 Nov 2013	15:30	399	-8.41	40.89	29.37	0.01	0.880	0.012	2.5	34	27.5	
28 Nov 2013	15:00	407	-8.70	41.16	30.11	0.01	0.886	0.010	3.1	33	27.5	
Average $\pm 1\sigma$	$402\pm3$	$-8.53\pm0.12$	$40.94\pm0.16$	$29.68\pm0.29$		$0.894\pm0.015$			$31 \pm 3$	27.5		

\* Sampling Stations (see Fig. 1 for locations in South China Sea)



**Figure 5.** (a) Carbon Keeling plot for air CO<sub>2</sub> collected over South China Sea (blue symbol) and coastal stations (pink symbol) (Keelung and Fugui Cape). (b)  $\Delta_{47}$  values observed over the South China Sea and coastal stations. The error bars are the 1 standard error associated with the measurements. Lines show  $\Delta_{47}$  values for the CO<sub>2</sub> in thermodynamic equilibrium at ambient temperatures.

#### 3.4 Atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> over land

To show how anthropogenic emission affects the isotopic composition especially the  $\Delta_{47}$  values, we analyzed atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> samples collected near Roosevelt Road, a busy street in downtown Taipei. The averaged values of [CO<sub>2</sub>],  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O obtained were 500 ± 50 ppmv, -11.05 ± 0.90

and  $39.32 \pm 0.94\%_{o}$ , respectively (Table 4). A significantly higher [CO<sub>2</sub>] and lower  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O values compared to the marine CO<sub>2</sub> showed signatures of a significant contribution from vehicular emissions.  $\Delta_{47}$  values near Roosevelt Road were found to be in the range of 0.754 to 0.833%<sub>o</sub>, with an average of 0.807 ± 0.028%<sub>o</sub> (Table 4). The values were lower by ~ 0.15%<sub>o</sub> compared to the thermodynamic equi-

Date	Time	Conc. (ppm)	δ <sup>13</sup> C (‰) (VPDB)	δ <sup>18</sup> O (‰) (VSMOW)	$\delta^{47}$ (‰)	SE	Δ <sub>47</sub> (‰) (ARF)	SE	Δ <sub>48</sub> (‰)	Estimated temp. (°C)	Air temp. (°C)
Urban CO <sub>2</sub> : Ro	oosevelt	Road, Taipei	City								
30 Dec 2015	12:30	510	-10.41	40.00	25.26	0.014	0.823	0.010	2.3	46	20
	15:00	478	-11.50	38.49	22.63	0.012	0.754	0.008	0.9	62	19.5
	17:00	461	-9.69	40.70	26.74	0.017	0.833	0.013	0.9	44	17
	18:00	594	-12.30	38.14	21.56	0.014	0.819	0.015	1.5	47	16
	20:00	457	-11.34	39.24	23.61	0.022	0.806	0.022	3.1	50	15
Average $\pm 1\sigma$		$500\pm50$	$-11.05\pm0.90$	$39.31\pm0.94$	$23.96 \pm 1.84$		$0.807\pm0.028$			$50\pm 6$	$17\pm2$
Suburban air CO <sub>2</sub>											
Academia Sini	ca Camp	us									
17 Oct 2013	10:00	400	-7.83	40.44	28.47	0.015	0.899	0.008	3.7	30	25
	14:30	402	-8.05	40.25	28.07	0.017	0.889	0.008	2.2	32	25
	17:20	409	-8.44	39.90	27.26	0.019	0.877	0.020	2.3	34	22
30 Oct 2013	10:00	395	-8.48	40.57	28.47	0.012	0.876	0.010	2.8	35	25.2
	14:30	400	-8.25	41.08	29.03	0.016	0.893	0.016	3.9	31	27.4
4 Nov 2013	10:30	411	-8.78	40.51	28.67	0.011	0.902	0.009	2.7	29	22.5
	14:30	406	-8.64	40.62	28.97	0.017	0.895	0.016	2.2	31	22
	18:30	415	-9.02	40.38	28.33	0.013	0.907	0.009	2.8	28	22.5
9 Nov 2013	10:30	405	-8.34	41.09	29.79	0.019	0.917	0.015	1.9	27	28.5
	14:00	407	-8.25	41.25	30.63	0.015	0.919	0.009	1.6	26	30.6
	18:30	425	-9.43	40.32	27.49	0.020	0.923	0.019	2.1	25	28
19 Nov 2013	10:00	419	-8.74	40.60	29.27	0.012	0.927	0.011	3.7	25	19.5
	14:00	418	-8.71	40.52	29.59	0.019	0.881	0.012	1.2	33	19.6
	18:00	414	-8.91	40.56	28.58	0.012	0.872	0.006	1.1	35	18.5
27 Jan 2014	10:30	403	-8.52	41.32	30.13	0.008	0.897	0.010	2.9	30	19.2
	15:20	400	-8.68	41.23	30.03	0.011	0.914	0.010	0.7	27	19.6
	18:00	404	-8.64	41.32	29.29	0.017	0.923	0.010	4.6	25	18.5
3 Feb 2014	11:00	408	-8.80	41.20	29.67	0.015	0.957	0.017	1.7	19	24.5
	14:30	409	-8.86	41.39	NA		NA		NA		
	19:30	409	-8.95	41.41	30.57	0.011	0.972	0.010	3.0	16	19.3
17 Feb 2014	10:30	445	-10.30	40.40	27.60	0.016	0.878	0.010	3.0	34	22.4
	14:30	408	-8.74	41.53	30.58	0.014	0.895	0.011	0.6	31	25
	18:30	437	-9.92	41.07	28.49	0.012	0.893	0.008	1.3	31	22
19 Feb 2014	10:00	418	-9.12	40.61	29.12	0.020	0.895	0.018	0.9	31	13.3
	18:00	424	-9.38	40.40	28.49	0.020	0.895	0.013	2.4	31	12.4
20 Feb 2014	14:30	410	-8.81	40.96	29.68	0.023	0.866	0.010	1.9	37	12.9
	18:00	417	-9.02	40.66	29.59	0.018	0.863	0.014	1.6	37	12.5
22 Feb 2014	12:15	401	-8.44	41.49	30.63	0.013	0.872	0.013	0.6	35	17.5
	17:00	402	-8.36	41.51	30.63	0.013	0.853	0.012	4.2	40	17.1
24 Feb 2014	17:30	406	-8.63	41.57	30.70	0.014	0.863	0.013	3.8	37	22
Average $\pm 1\sigma$		$411 \pm 11$	$-8.78\pm0.50$	$40.87\pm0.46$	$29.23 \pm 1.00$		$0.897 \pm 0.027$			$30 \pm 5$	21±5
Grassland: NTU Campus											
14 Nov 2013	10:10	353	-7.95	40.96	30.18	0.02	0.885	0.013	0.4	33	23
	14:05	366	-8.02	41.31	30.79	0.01	0.906	0.014	0.4	29	26
	19:20	462	-9.94	38.33	25.64	0.02	0.907	0.019	0.2	29	24
15 Nov 2013	10:40	416	-9.12	39.42	29.51	0.01	0.954	0.013	0.6	20	22
	14:10	421	-9.19	39.36	29.78	0.02	0.942	0.018	0.3	22	21
	19:12	438	-9.92	38.28	28.08	0.04	0.989	0.009	0.0	13	20
16 Nov 2013	10:50	412	-8.78	40.03	28.54	0.02	0.948	0.018	1.8	21	21
	17:10	408	-8.70	40.26	26.06	0.02	0.969	0.021	1.6	17	20
Average $\pm 1\sigma$		$409 \pm 33$	$-8.95\pm0.70$	$39.74 \pm 1.00$	$28.57 \pm 1.77$		$0.937 \pm 0.030$			$23\pm 6$	$22\pm 2$

**Table 4.** Stable isotopic composition including clumped isotopes ( $\Delta_{47}$ ) for air CO<sub>2</sub> collected in urban and suburban stations, grassland, forest and high mountain environments. Temperatures estimated using  $\Delta_{47}$  values and air temperatures are also presented.

Fable 4. Continued.	
---------------------	--

Date	Time	Conc. (ppm)	δ <sup>13</sup> C (‰) (VPDB)	δ <sup>18</sup> O (‰) (VSMOW)	δ <sup>47</sup> (‰)	SE	Δ <sub>47</sub> (‰) (ARF)	SE	Δ <sub>48</sub> (‰)	Estimated temp. (°C)	Air temp. (°C)	
Forest site near Academia Sinica Campus												
7 July 2015	10:30	411	-9.07	41.43	11.54	0.01	0.890	0.017	0.3	32	32	
14 Jul 2015	10:30	458	-10.43	39.74	9.01	0.02	0.890	0.017	0.4	32	31	
28 Jul 2015	10:40	441	-9.99	40.86	10.07	0.02	0.887	0.015	0.2	32	30	
11 Aug 2015	10:40	448	-10.46	40.09	9.50	0.01	0.920	0.009	0.5	26	30	
18 Aug 2015	10:30	433	-9.99	39.80	8.99	0.02	0.888	0.016	0.4	32	30	
Average $\pm 1\sigma$		$438\pm16$	$-9.99\pm0.50$	$40.39\pm0.66$	$9.82\pm0.94$		$0.895\pm0.012$			$31\pm2$	$31 \pm 1$	
High mountain: Hehuan												
9 Oct 2013	13:20	364	-8.21	40.89	28.79	0.02	0.895	0.016	3.2	31	10	
	17:00	NA	-8.25	40.28	28.41	0.01	0.914	0.014	2.9	27	10	
Average $\pm 1\sigma$		364	$-8.23\pm0.02$	$40.59\pm0.30$	$28.60\pm0.19$		$0.904\pm0.009$			$30\pm 2$	10	



Figure 6. Carbon Keeling plots for air  $CO_2$  collected over (a) suburban Academia Sinica Campus and (b) grassland at National Taiwan University Campus.

librium value at 20 °C, the ambient temperature around the sampling time, indicating a significant fraction of  $CO_2$  produced at higher temperatures, i.e., of combustion origin.

In the suburban location (Academia Sinica Campus), [CO<sub>2</sub>] averaged over 4 months was  $410 \pm 10$  ppmv (Table 4), which was ~ 15 ppmv higher than that observed over the South China Sea and that at Mauna Loa Observatory during the time of sampling. The higher [CO<sub>2</sub>] suggests contribution from local anthropogenic emissions.  $\delta^{13}$ C values varied between -7.83 and -10.30‰, with an average of -8.78 ± 0.50‰. Keeling analysis for  $\delta^{13}$ C gave an intercept of -26.16 ± 1.58‰ (Fig. 6), indicating source of CO<sub>2</sub> from C<sub>3</sub> plant respiration and/or combustion.  $\Delta_{47}$  values here varied between 0.853 and 0.972‰ (Table 4) with an average of 0.897 ± 0.027‰, which were significantly less than the thermodynamic equilibrium values (assuming water bodies had the same temperature as the ambient) (Fig. 7).

The averaged [CO<sub>2</sub>],  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O over the grassland (inside National Taiwan University Campus) were  $410 \pm 33$  ppmv,  $-8.95 \pm 0.70$  and  $39.74 \pm 1.00\%$ , respectively. The Keeling plot for  $\delta^{13}$ C gave an intercept of  $-16.98 \pm 1.02\%$  (Fig. 6), indicating that a significant fraction of CO<sub>2</sub> originated from C<sub>4</sub> vegetation. This is not surprising as the CO<sub>2</sub> was sampled over a C<sub>4</sub>-dominated grassland (area:  $\sim 50 \text{ m} \times 50 \text{ m}$ ). Unlike greenhouse CO<sub>2</sub>, no statistically significant correlation between  $\delta^{18}$ O and 1/ [CO<sub>2</sub>] in air CO<sub>2</sub> in these sites was observed (not shown), probably due to the influence of multiple sources and processes on oxygen isotopes of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. Figure 7c shows the  $\Delta_{47}$  values in air CO<sub>2</sub> over the grassland at National Taiwan University Campus. A large variation in  $\Delta_{47}$  was observed (0.885–0.989‰) with an average of 0.937 ± 0.030‰. Some of the values were close to the thermodynamic equilibrium while the others deviated significantly.

In a small and dense forest near Academia Sinica Campus (Fig. 1), average values of [CO<sub>2</sub>],  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O in air CO<sub>2</sub> were 438 ± 16 ppmv, -9.99 ± 0.50 and 40.39 ± 0.63 ‰, respectively (Table 4) during summer (July–August) of 2015. A significantly higher [CO<sub>2</sub>] and lower  $\delta^{13}$ C values than the background indicate strong contribution of CO<sub>2</sub> from local respiration.  $\Delta_{47}$  values fall in the range of 0.887 to 0.920 ‰, with an average of 0.895 ± 0.012 ‰ (Table 4). The values were similar to that expected at thermodynamic equilibrium (Fig. 7d) except on 11 August, when a significant increase in



**Figure 7.**  $\Delta_{47}$  values in the near-surface atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> from (a) urban site near Roosevelt Road on 30 December 2015, (b) suburban station (Academia Sinica Campus), (c) grassland in the National Taiwan University Campus and (d) forest site near the Academia Sinica Campus. The error bars are the 1 standard error associated with the measurements. Lines show  $\Delta_{47}$  values for the CO<sub>2</sub> at thermodynamic equilibrium at ambient temperatures.

 $\Delta_{47}$  was observed. The deviation was probably due to the influence of a super typhoon, which passed over the region on previous days, mixing and transporting air masses regionally.

Over the top of the Hehuan mountain (~ 3.2 km a.s.l), [CO<sub>2</sub>],  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O values in air CO<sub>2</sub> samples collected on 9 October 2013 were 364 ppmv,  $-8.23 \pm 0.02$  and  $40.59 \pm 0.30 \%$ , respectively (Table 4). The lower [CO<sub>2</sub>] and higher  $\delta^{13}$ C than Mauna Loa suggest photosynthetic uptake, which was also seen at grassland site and inside greenhouse on a few occasions. Here the averaged value of  $\Delta_{47}$  was  $0.904 \pm 0.009 \%$ , slightly less than that expected at the ambient temperature (Table 4).

#### 4 Discussion

A detailed discussion of the results obtained from different locations is presented below.

#### 4.1 Greenhouse air CO<sub>2</sub>

To minimize anthropogenic alteration and air mixing/transport and to maximize the variations of CO<sub>2</sub> isotopologues by biological processes, a controlled greenhouse provides an ideal environment. Diurnal variation was observed in [CO<sub>2</sub>],  $\delta^{13}$ C,  $\delta^{18}$ O (Fig. 2) and  $\Delta_{47}$  (Fig. 3) in the greenhouse. Good correlations between [CO<sub>2</sub>],  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O suggest common processes affecting all of them, and they were photosynthesis and respiration. Giving 31 July as an example, we estimated the rates of nighttime respiration and daytime photosynthetic uptake using the conventional isotopic compositions (analysis of  $\Delta_{47}$  is discussed separately below). The dimension of the greenhouse room was  $8 \times 5 \times 5$  m (length, width and height). The nighttime respiration rate was then estimated to be about  $\sim 10 \text{ ppmv h}^{-1}$ (considering change of [CO<sub>2</sub>] from 17:30 to 21:30; Fig. 2a), or  $\sim 4 \times 10^{13}$  molecules cm<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>. Using simple isotopic mass balance, this increase of [CO<sub>2</sub>] could be satisfactorily explained assuming C<sub>3</sub> respiration as the main source of CO<sub>2</sub> ( $\delta^{13}$ C  $\approx -26\%$ ; intercept in Fig. 2d) added to the background (-8.5%). Similarly, the same conclusion could be derived by analyzing  $\delta^{18}$ O considering  $\delta^{18}$ O of respired and background CO<sub>2</sub> of 30.68 % (intercept in Fig. 2e) and  $\sim$  40 %, respectively. Thus, we conclude that the main factor that affected the changes in concentration as well as the isotopic compositions in nighttime was respiration.

The daytime net uptake rate can be estimated by taking the changes from early morning to noontime; the [CO<sub>2</sub>] reduced by 110 ppmv,  $\delta^{13}$ C increased by 3.46% and  $\delta^{18}$ O by 2.23% in about 6 h. We calculated the number of molecules and their changes inside the greenhouse assuming simple gas laws. The estimated net photosynthetic uptake was  $\sim 1 \times 10^{14}$  molecules cm<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> assuming constant respiration rate that was observed in the night. The photosynthetic discrimination can be calculated using the Rayleigh distillation model

$$R = R_0 f^{\alpha - 1} \tag{3}$$

where  $R_0$  and R are the initial and modified  ${}^{13}C/{}^{12}C$  or  $^{18}O/^{16}O$  ratios (due to photosynthetic activity), respectively, f is the fraction of the material left, and  $\alpha$  is the fractionation factor. The estimated discrimination in <sup>13</sup>C defined by  $(\alpha - 1)$ , following Eq. (3), was -16.5%, which was slightly higher than that expected for C<sub>3</sub> type vegetation ( $\sim -20\%$ ) (Farquhar et al., 1989). For <sup>18</sup>O, in addition to photosynthetic uptake, one has to consider an additional effect due to temperature-dependent water-CO2 equilibrium fractionation. That is, the process decreases  $\delta^{18}$ O by  $\sim 0.2\%$  for an increase of 1 °C in temperature (Brenninkmeijer et al., 1983); from morning to noontime, the temperature effect reduced  $\delta^{18}$ O by 4.4 ‰. Adding this factor to the observed change in  $\delta^{18}$ O yielded a discrimination factor of -12.0%; the value becomes -7.0%, if this additional temperature-dependence is ignored. The value (-12.0%) observed considering the additional exchange with the soil water was slightly higher than that observed previously (-14.4%) (Flanagan et al., 1997). Here the  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O values of the respired components were assumed to be -26 and 30%, respectively (see Sect. 3.1).

We assume that ca. one-third of the  $CO_2$  molecules in stomata are fixed photosynthetically and the remaining retrodiffuse back to the atmosphere (Farguhar and Lloid, 1993) implying that the CO2-water isotopic exchange rate was  $\sim 2 \times 10^{14}$  molecules cm<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>. Also we assume that the CO<sub>2</sub> molecules that enter into the leaf stomata get isotopically equilibrated with the leaf water before diffusing back to the atmosphere. This implies an approximately 8 h of oxygen isotope exchange time for  $CO_2$  in the greenhouse room. As a result, we do not expect that CO<sub>2</sub> reached to complete isotopic equilibrium with the substrate water in a few hours inside the room.  $\Delta_{47}$  values in the leftover CO<sub>2</sub> could be used to check the disequilibrium. The respired CO<sub>2</sub> was found to be in thermodynamic equilibrium at the ambient temperature, shown by the  $\Delta_{47}$  values of CO<sub>2</sub> in the early morning and nighttime (Fig. 3a-c) and that collected on a cloudy day with suppressed photosynthetic activity (Fig. 3d). The close thermodynamic equilibrium at reduced photosynthetic condition is also shown in Fig. 4a that deviation in  $\Delta_{47}$  from that expected at ambient temperature is small. On sunny days, the [CO<sub>2</sub>],  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O values change by 50–115 ppm, 2– 4 and 1.1–2.2 %, respectively, in a time period of  $\sim$  5 h in the morning (Fig. 2). Figure 3 shows that the  $\Delta_{47}$  values retained the thermodynamic equilibrium values in the morning hours (until 09:00) and then deviate from the thermodynamic equilibrium later of the day. The maximal reduction in the  $\Delta_{47}$ values during these morning hours was  $\sim 0.05 \%$  (Fig. 3a–c) which is significant, as this value is much higher than the uncertainty of the measurements. An increase in  $\Delta_{47}$  values after  $\sim 09:00$  was observed. We attribute these changes in the  $\Delta_{47}$  values of the residual CO<sub>2</sub> to photosynthesis as it is seen when photosynthesis is strong. Also we note that there was no significant correlation/anti-correlation between  $\delta^{18}$ O and  $\Delta_{47}$  when photosynthesis was strong (Fig. 3a–c), but it became significant when the photosynthesis was weak (Fig. 3d). Therefore, the plant photosynthesis decouples  $\Delta_{47}$ and  $\delta^{18}$ O, in contrast to pure water–CO<sub>2</sub> isotopic exchange where the two behave similarly as far as isotopic equilibration is concerned (Affek, 2013; Clog et al., 2015).

Strong influence of photosynthesis on  $\Delta_{47}$  was also reported by Eiler and Schauble (2004). They observed a decrease in the  $\Delta_{47}$  values of the residual CO<sub>2</sub> due to photosynthetic assimilation though the effect observed was different for different species. Here we observed a decrease in  $\Delta_{47}$ value of the residual CO<sub>2</sub> initially (first 2 h) due to photosynthesis similar to that observed by Eiler and Schauble (2004), although it later started increasing in response to the photosynthesis. Photosynthesis as a source of disequilibrium was also shown recently by analyzing the clumped isotopes of O<sub>2</sub> (Yeung et al., 2015). Though enzymatic carbonic anhydrase catalyzes the water-CO<sub>2</sub> isotopic exchange toward equilibrium (Peltier et al., 1995; Cernusak et al., 2004) its activity varies. A large variation in the activity of carbonic anhydrase in different vegetation types  $(C_3, C_4)$  or within the same type was noted previously (see Gillon and Yakir, 2001, and references therein). Therefore, the reaction may be incomplete, which is limited by the enzymatic activity inside leaves. Furthermore, a box modeling by Eiler and Schauble (2004) demonstrated that gas diffusion through leaf stomata during photosynthesis fractionates the remaining air  $CO_2\Delta_{47}$  value, deviating it from the thermodynamic equilibrium set by leaf water. Mixing of more than one component can also cause change in  $\Delta_{47}$  when  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O of the components are different (Affek and Eiler, 2006; Laskar et al., 2016a), but this can easily be ruled out as it was not observed when photosynthesis was not very strong (Fig. 3d). More rigorous investigations with controlled experiments using different plants with diverse carbonic anhydrase activities are needed to resolve the issue.

Considering the discrimination for  $\delta^{13}$ C,  $\delta^{18}$ O and variation in the concentration it is possible to model the observed isotopic profile. The Rayleigh model (Eq. 3) in terms of  $\delta$ notation can approximately be written as  $\delta = \delta_0 + \varepsilon \times \ln(f)$ , where  $\delta_0$  is the initial  $\delta$  value, f is the fraction of material left and  $\varepsilon$  is the enrichment factor. Figure 8a shows the concentration profiles for 31 July 2015 inside the greenhouse. With the calculated discrimination factors ( $\varepsilon$ ) of -16.5 and -12.0% for  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O, the modeled isotopic profiles along with actual data are shown in Fig. 8b and c. The model data are generated using Rayleigh fractionation relation. Assuming this relation valid for  $\Delta_{47}$ , a discrimination factor of 0.065 % due to photosynthesis was observed in the morning hours of 31 July 2015. Figure 8d shows the  $\Delta_{47}$  profile for the same day along with the actual observed values. The observed data match well with the model plots. Unlike  $\delta s$ ,  $\Delta_{47}$ 



Figure 8. (a) CO<sub>2</sub> concentration inside greenhouse on 31 August 2015: observed concentration (star) and decrease in concentration by photosynthesis after subtracting the respiration (solid circle) are also shown. Comparison of observed (b)  $\delta^{13}$ C, (c)  $\delta^{18}$ O and (d)  $\Delta_{47}$  values with that modeled using discrimination factors of -16.5, -12.0 and 0.065% for  $\delta^{13}$ C,  $\delta^{18}$ O and  $\Delta_{47}$ , respectively.

is not a linear quantity as discussed later, the discrimination factor calculated may slightly change when nonlinearity is taken into account. More data, probably at leaf level, will allow us to estimate the photosynthetic discrimination for  $\Delta_{47}$ .

#### 4.2 Car exhaust CO<sub>2</sub>

Ideally, the  $\Delta_{47}$  value of car exhaust CO<sub>2</sub> should reflect the temperature of fuel combustion inside the combustion chamber, which is  $> 800 \,^{\circ}$ C. However, the temperature estimated from  $\Delta_{47}$  was found to be  $283 \pm 18$  °C. It is likely that interaction of the sample CO<sub>2</sub> with the exhaust gases and water inside the catalytic converter and exhaust pipe modified the  $\Delta_{47}$  values. The catalytic converter, which oxidizes CO and hydrocarbons to CO<sub>2</sub>, probably reset the clumped signatures at relatively lower temperature. During combustion water vapor is also released. We observed that the exhaust gas contained a large amount of water vapor, part of which was condensed on the exhaust pipe and the front part of the magnesium perchlorate column. Partial equilibration with the stream of the exhaust gas and water inside catalytic converter and the exhaust pipe was the likely cause for higher  $\Delta_{47}$  values than that expected. This was also supported by the higher  $\delta^{18}$ O values than atmospheric O<sub>2</sub>, the source of O<sub>2</sub> for water and CO<sub>2</sub> here. Normally isotopes in CO<sub>2</sub> do not exchange with water vapor, but exchange may take place at higher temperature in presence of catalyst. Inside the catalytic converter, exchange could take place on the surface of the catalyst at elevated temperatures of 200-400 °C (Farrauto and Heck, 1999; Kašpar et al., 2003; Klingstedt et al., 2006). Affek and Eiler (2007) also observed elevated  $\Delta_{47}$ values for car exhaust and estimated a temperature of CO<sub>2</sub> production to be  $\sim 200$  °C. The temperature estimated here (283 °C) is significantly higher than that observed by Affek and Eiler (2007). Difference could be due to different car models and the variations in the temperatures of the catalytic converters from car to car.

#### Marine and coastal air CO<sub>2</sub> 4.3

Carbon Keeling plot for marine and coastal air CO<sub>2</sub> gave an intercept of  $-13.61 \pm 1.14\%$  (Fig. 5a), the source signature. The South China Sea is net source of  $CO_2$  to the atmosphere (Zhai et al., 2005). The CO<sub>2</sub> released over ocean is mainly originated from the remineralization of organic matter in the deeper ocean (Francois et al., 1993; Goericke and Fry, 1994). The  $\delta^{13}$ C value of such organic matter ranges between -20and -30% in the tropical to subtropical oceans, the intercept observed here (-13.6%) is much higher than this range, though the associated uncertainty is high due to a small span of isotopic values of the samples. A possibility is that the remineralized CO<sub>2</sub> gets equilibrated with the dissolved inorganic carbon before releasing to the atmosphere. Again, a complete equilibration of the CO<sub>2</sub> with the dissolved inorganic carbon would lead to a  $\delta^{13}$ C value of released CO<sub>2</sub> to be -9 to -10% (Mook, 1986; Boutton, 1991; Zhang et al., 1995; Affek and Yakir, 2014); the observed value of the intercept (-13.6%) was significantly less than this. Therefore, we infer that the CO<sub>2</sub> produced in the deeper ocean is partially equilibrated with the dissolved inorganic carbon before releasing to the atmosphere.

The  $\delta^{18}$ O values of the surface sea water in the South China Sea region in summer (July-September) and winter (December–February) were about -1.7 and -0.6% (Ye et al., 2014). The sea surface temperatures in the summer and winter are about 28 and 24 °C, and the equilibrated  $\delta^{18}$ O values of the atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> should be 38.9 and 40.7 %, respectively, assuming fractionation factors at the respective temperatures (Brenninkmeijer et al., 1983). Our observed values lie in the range of 40.4-41.0% (Table 3), consistent with the isotopic equilibrium values with the surface water. Therefore, we conclude that oxygen isotopes in near-surface air CO<sub>2</sub> over ocean are close to the isotopic equilibrium with the surface sea water. This conclusion was further supported by the observed  $\Delta_{47}$  values which were found to be close to thermodynamic equilibrium with the underlying sea surface water at the sea surface temperature (Fig. 5b). This is due to the same water-CO<sub>2</sub> exchange time for the two species (Affek, 2013; Clog et al., 2015). Comparing this observation with the greenhouse data above, we conclude that  $\delta^{18}$ O and  $\Delta_{47}$  behave similarly when equilibrium is achieved by simple water-CO<sub>2</sub> exchange but respond differently when photosynthesis is the main governing factor. Though carbonic anhydrase is also present in the surface ocean and marine phytoplankton does photosynthesize,  $\delta^{18}$ O and  $\Delta_{47}$  in air  $CO_2$  over the ocean show the values at thermodynamic equilibrium unlike the case of greenhouse  $CO_2$ . The degree of deviation from thermodynamic equilibrium probably increases with the increase in photosynthetic activity. Normally photosynthesis by oceanic plants is much less compared to their terrestrial counterparts; the deviation from thermodynamic equilibrium by the oceanic photosynthesis, if present, is probably not detectable with the present measurement precision. Compared to  $\delta^{18}O$ ,  $\Delta_{47}$  is process sensitive and is not affected by the isotopic composition of substrate water. Given that the surface air temperature is better measured, we believe the clumped isotopes potentially provide good tracers for global carbon flux study involving CO<sub>2</sub>, complementing the commonly used species like [CO<sub>2</sub>],  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O.

In the coastal stations,  $\Delta_{47}$  values were similar to the thermodynamic equilibrium with the sea surface water at the temperature of ~ 27 °C (Fig. 5b). The recoded air temperature during the sampling period over the coasts varied between 14 and 24 °C and was not reflected in the  $\Delta_{47}$  values. We note that the samples were collected from two open spaces in the coasts where strong north and northeasterly winds overwhelmed, carrying air masses from the oceans towards the sampling locations (see Table S3 in Supplement). Therefore, we expect the major contribution was marine air with little influence from local processes, which could occasionally cause deviation from the thermodynamic equilibrium values.

### 4.4 Urban and suburban air CO<sub>2</sub>

A significant fraction of anthropogenic CO<sub>2</sub> was present in the air CO<sub>2</sub> over the urban site, indicated by the [CO<sub>2</sub>] as well as isotopic compositions including  $\Delta_{47}$ . Anthropogenic contribution can be estimated following two-component mixing:  $\delta = f_{anth} \times \delta_{anth} + (1 - f_{anth}) \times \delta_{bgd}$ , where  $\delta$  can be  $\delta^{13}$ C,  $\delta^{18}$ O or  $\Delta_{47}$ , f is the corresponding weighting factor, and subscripts "anth" and "bgd" refer to anthropogenic and background, respectively. We take the "anthropogenic" end member as the isotopic compositions of the car exhaust values (Table 2) and "background" end member as values observed over the ocean (for  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O, Table 3) and thermodynamic equilibrium value at the mean ambient temperature of  $\sim 20 \,^{\circ}\text{C}$  (0.95 % for  $\Delta_{47}$ ) at the site during sampling. Assuming that the excess in [CO<sub>2</sub>] above the background was originated from vehicular emission, the values of  $\delta^{13}$ C,  $\delta^{18}$ O and  $\Delta_{47}$  in the urban site obtained using the mixing equation were -12.26, 37.68 and 0.809%, respectively, which were similar to those observed (Table 4).  $\Delta_{47}$  is not a conserved quantity and a linear mixing is not valid when the  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O of the components are widely different (Affek and Eiler, 2006; Laskar et al., 2016a). In the present case, the isotopic compositions of the two components were not drastically different and fraction of anthropogenic CO<sub>2</sub> was much less (< 1/4) than the background CO<sub>2</sub>, and hence the error due to linear approximation was small (comparable to the uncertainty of measurement). Anthropogenic CO<sub>2</sub> can also be quantified using radiocarbon (<sup>14</sup>C) as fossil fuels are highly depleted in <sup>14</sup>C (Miller et al., 2012); however, it cannot distinguish difference between CO2 from two sources with modern carbon.

No systematic diurnal or temporal trend was observed in the  $\Delta_{47}$  values in the suburban CO<sub>2</sub> during the sampling period (Fig. 7b). However, a weak trend was seen in  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O (not shown) in response to the seasonal variation of the carbon assimilation and oxygen isotopes in the rainwater (Peng et al., 2010; Laskar et al., 2014). This furthermore demonstrates that  $\Delta_{47}$  behaves differently from [CO<sub>2</sub>],  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O. Almost all measured  $\Delta_{47}$  values were lower than that expected at the ambient temperature except 2 days: 9 November 2013 and 3 February 2014.  $\delta^{13}$ C values were also slightly lower than the background values. The reduced values of  $\Delta_{47}$  could be due to contribution of CO<sub>2</sub> from combustion processes which produced CO<sub>2</sub> with low  $\Delta_{47}$  values as discussed in Sect. 4.2. We estimated the contribution of local anthropogenic emission in  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\Delta_{47}$  using the twocomponent mixing discussed above. The components were the background air CO<sub>2</sub> and car exhaust. The expected  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\Delta_{47}$  values of the mixture were -9.1 and 0.92%, respectively. The observed  $\Delta_{47}$  value was significantly different from that estimated from simple two component mixing, though it was not different for  $\delta^{13}$ C. After subtracting the local anthropogenic contribution from the observed  $\Delta_{47}$  values, a difference of  $\sim 0.026\%$  between the observed and estimated remains for suburban station and it disappeared for urban station (see Table S4 in the Supplement). This was not obvious in  $\delta^{13}$ C probably due to larger variation. The lower  $\Delta_{47}$  values in suburban station could possibly be due to kinetic effect during photosynthetic assimilation, partial contribution of marine air or a combination of them. It could also be due to underestimation of the anthropogenic  $CO_2$  at the sampling spot. The regional background  $[CO_2]$  here could be lower than that assumed and the actual anthropogenic fraction of  $CO_2$  could be higher. The marine air in the vicinity of Taiwan, which was at thermodynamic equilibrium with the surface sea water as discussed earlier, might have contributed partially to the air CO<sub>2</sub> at the sampling site. Varying contribution of marine air could explain the lower  $\Delta_{47}$  values to some extent. The most plausible cause for observed deviation in the  $\Delta_{47}$  values that cannot be accounted for by anthropogenic and marine alterations was photosynthesis, as discussed earlier for greenhouse CO<sub>2</sub>. This is not unreasonable, as the Academia Sinica Campus is surrounded by thick greeneries.

On 9 November 2013 and 3 February 2014, the  $\Delta_{47}$  values were close to that expected at thermodynamic equilibrium (Fig. 7b). The  $\Delta_{47}$  values on 9 November were not very different from the values reported for the previous or next days. However, the calculated thermodynamic equilibrium values on that day were relatively low due to high ambient temperatures; air CO<sub>2</sub> probably did not get enough time to equilibrate. On 3 February 2014, the  $\Delta_{47}$  values were higher and comparable to the thermodynamic equilibrium values expected at ambient temperatures. A likely explanation is that the air on that day was a mixture of two components at the sampling region. A relatively strong wind from the southern land (Table S3 in the Supplement) contributed the air CO<sub>2</sub> and the higher  $\Delta_{47}$  values were probably due to mixing of the local air with that transported from the south of Taipei.

#### 4.5 Grassland, forest and high mountain air CO<sub>2</sub>

In the grassland station in Taipei city, the Keeling plot intercept for  $\delta^{13}$ C (-17.0±1.0%) (Fig. 5d) indicated some sources of CO<sub>2</sub> with higher  $\delta^{13}$ C values compared to the most expected sources, namely C<sub>3</sub> vegetation and vehicle emission with a  $\delta^{13}$ C value of ~ -27%. Though the sampling station was located in an urban region, the sampling spot was at least ~ 150 m away from traffic streets, such as Keelung road, along with ~ 60 m wide, ~ 10 m high C<sub>3</sub> trees in between. As a result, anthropogenic signals were not very prominent. The samples were collected just above the surface of the grasses. Tropical warm grasses are mainly C<sub>4</sub> type with  $\delta^{13}$ C in the range of -9 to -19% and a global average of -13% (Deines, 1980). We measured  $\delta^{13}$ C values

of a few grass samples and found values in the range of -15to -17%. The soil and grass respired CO<sub>2</sub> with higher  $\delta^{13}$ C contributed significantly to the near-surface CO<sub>2</sub>, resulting in a higher value of intercept (-17%). The concentration was observed to be less than the background level sometimes, probably due to strong CO<sub>2</sub> uptake by plants. The temperature gradually decreased from 26 to 20 °C during the consecutive 3 days and clumped isotope followed similar trend, reflecting the influence of temperature on  $CO_2\Delta_{47}$  and rapid equilibration with the leaf and surface waters. One low value observed on the second day was probably due to plumes of vehicle exhaust, also supported by the elevated level of [CO<sub>2</sub>] and depletion in  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O (Table 4). Effect of photosynthesis on the CO<sub>2</sub> was also expected specifically due the collection of samples at the grass level. However, in an open system, it is difficult to assess this with limited data points.

An elevated CO<sub>2</sub> concentration and low  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{18}$ O values indicated significant contribution of respiration and/or anthropogenic  $CO_2$  in the forest station (Table 4) near the Academia Sinica Campus. Though the samples were collected at 10:00–11:00 under bright sunlight, the vegetation was so dense that little sunlight reached the ground. Probably photosynthetic activity was not very strong at the ground level in the morning hours and the dominant process was respiration. Also, poor circulation of air due to presence of high heels on the three sides of the sampling spot made the site nearly isolated from the surroundings. As a result the  $\Delta_{47}$ values were observed to be similar to the thermodynamic equilibrium expected at the ambient temperatures except on 11 August 2015 (Fig. 7f). This also supports our hypothesis, made in the case of greenhouse  $CO_2$ , that respired  $CO_2$  is in close thermodynamic equilibrium with the substrate water. On 11 August 2015 a significantly higher  $\Delta_{47}$  value was observed. The higher value was likely due to the influence of the super Typhoon "Soudelor" which passed over Taipei during 8–10 August 2015, causing a decrease in temperature by 3–4 °C and air masses mixing in a larger spatial scale.

For high mountain CO<sub>2</sub>, the observed  $\Delta_{47}$  values (Table 4) were lower than that expected at ~ 10 °C, the ambient temperature at the top of the mountain site during sampling. The  $\Delta_{47}$  values were similar to that observed in the plain and over the ocean. We note that during the sampling period, the site was affected significantly by winter monsoons. HYSPLIT 24 h back trajectory showed marine origin of air (not shown) during the sampling time. The air CO<sub>2</sub> on the mountain probably did not get sufficient time to isotopically equilibrate with the local surface and leaf water but showed the signature of the marine CO<sub>2</sub>.

The deviations in  $\Delta_{47}$  from the thermodynamic equilibrium values in different atmospheric environments and processes are summarized in Fig. 9. It is obvious that the urban and suburban CO<sub>2</sub> deviate the most towards lower  $\Delta_{47}$  values, mainly contributed by CO<sub>2</sub> originated from high-temperature combustions, i.e., vehicular emissions. The respired CO<sub>2</sub> are in close thermodynamic equilibrium at the



Figure 9. A summary of  $\Delta_{47}$  values in near-surface air CO<sub>2</sub> obtained at different environments and compared with the thermodynamic equilibrium values. Combustion temperature for car exhaust is assumed to be 800 °C (minimum value). Greenhouse CO<sub>2</sub> are divided into two categories: photosynthesis dominated (green open circle) and respiration dominated (green open triangle).

ambient temperature. In contrast, CO<sub>2</sub> affected by strong photosynthesis shows significant increase in the  $\Delta_{47}$  values compared to the thermodynamic equilibrium values.

#### 5 Summary

We presented a compilation of  $\Delta_{47}$  analyses for car exhaust, greenhouse and air CO2 over a wide variety of interactions in tropical and subtropical regions including marine, coastal, urban, suburban, forest and high mountain environments. Nearsurface marine air CO<sub>2</sub> is in close thermodynamic equilibrium with the underlying surface water at the sea surface temperature. Car exhaust, urban, suburban and greenhouse air CO<sub>2</sub> significantly deviate from the thermodynamic equilibrium values. While respired CO<sub>2</sub> is in thermodynamic equilibrium with leaf and soil surface waters, photosynthesis significantly deviates the  $\Delta_{47}$  values from the thermodynamic equilibrium or more precisely increases the  $\Delta_{47}$  values probably due to kinetic effect associated with the diffusion of CO2 out of leaf stomata. The  $\Delta_{47}$  values in urban and suburban air  $CO_2$  are lower than that expected at thermodynamic equilibrium at the ambient temperature. The deviation is mainly due to contributions from fossil fuel emissions and to some extent due to photosynthesis, especially in regions with dense vegetation.

We showed that  $\Delta_{47}$  can serve as an independent tracer for studying photosynthesis. Though the deviation from equilibrium during photosynthesis is also observed in oxygen clumped isotopes, CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>2</sub> are affected and produced from different processes and sources; the former is affected seriously by water (water–CO<sub>2</sub> isotopic exchange) while the latter is derived from water. We believe the analyses of the clumped isotopes for both CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>2</sub> are of great importance in the atmospheric carbon cycling study, providing a new angle for tackling the chemistry chain in photosynthesis. More systematic study in controlled environments including leaf level experiments will help to better understand the role of photosynthesis on  $\Delta_{47}$ .

#### 6 Data availability

All the data used in the manuscript are also presented in the form of tables.

# The Supplement related to this article is available online at doi:10.5194/bg-13-5297-2016-supplement.

Acknowledgements. We thank Chung-Ho Wang for providing waters with different  $\delta^{18}$ O, Institute of Earth Sciences, Academia Sinica, for providing laboratory space, Jia-Lin Wang and Chang-Feng Ou-Yang for calibrating compressed air cylinder, Hao-Wei Wei for collecting air at the campus of National Taiwan University and Wei-Kang Ho and Guei-Bin Chang for collecting oceanic CO<sub>2</sub> and helping in laboratory setups. We also thank Frank Lin and greenhouse core facility of Academia Sinica for allowing to perform greenhouse experiments. Special thanks to S. K. Bhattacharya and Sasadhar Mahata for helpful discussion. This work is supported by the Ministry of Science and Technology (MOST-Taiwan) grants 105-2111-M-001-006-MY3 to Academia Sinica and 105-2119-M-002-001 to National Taiwan University.

Edited by: Y. Kuzyakov Reviewed by: three anonymous referees

#### References

- Affek, H. P.: Clumped isotopic equilibrium and the rate of isotope exchange between CO<sub>2</sub> and water, Am. J. Sci., 313, 309–325, 2013.
- Affek, H. P. and Eiler, J. M.: Abundance of mass 47 CO<sub>2</sub> in urban air, car exhaust, and human breath, Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta, 70, 1–12, 2006.
- Affek, H. P. and Yakir, D.: The stable isotopic composition of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, Treaties of Geochemistry, 5, 179–212, 2014.
- Affek, H. P., Xu, X., and Eiler, J. M.: Seasonal and diurnal variations of <sup>13</sup>C<sup>18</sup>O<sup>16</sup>O in air: Initial observations from Pasadena CA, Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta, 71, 5033–5043, 2007.
- Barkan, E. and Luz, B.: High precision measurements of  ${}^{17}\text{O}/{}^{16}\text{O}$  and  ${}^{18}\text{O}/{}^{16}\text{O}$  ratios in H<sub>2</sub>O, Rapid Commun. Mass Spectrom., 19, 3737–3742, 2005.
- Brenninkmeijer, C. A. M., Kraft, P., and Mook, W. G.: Oxygen isotope fractionation between CO<sub>2</sub> and H<sub>2</sub>O, Isot. Geosci., 1, 181– 190, 1983.
- Boutton, T. W.: Stable carbon isotope ratios of natural materials, II: Atmospheric, terrestrial, marine, and freshwater environments, in Carbon Isotope Techniques, edited by: Coleman, D. C. and Fry, B., Academic Press, New York, 173–185, 1991.
- Bowling, D. R., Ballantyne, A. P., Miller, J. B., Burns, S. P., Conway, T. J., Menzer, O., Stephens, B. B., and Vaughn, B. H.: Ecological processes dominate the <sup>13</sup>C land disequilibrium in a Rocky Mountain subalpine forest, Global Biogeochem. Cy., 27, 352–370, doi:10.1002/2013GB004686, 2014.
- Cernusak, L. A., Farquhar, G. D., Wong, S. C., and Williams, H. S.: Measurement and Interpretation of the Oxygen Isotope Composition of Carbon Dioxide Respired by Leaves in the Dark, Plant. Physiol., 136, 3350–3363, 2004.
- Ciais, P., Tans, P. P., Trolier, M., White, J. W. C., and Francey, R. J.: A large northern-hemisphere terrestrial  $CO_2$  sink indicated by the  ${}^{13}C/{}^{12}C$  ratio of atmospheric  $CO_2$ , Science, 269, 1098–1102, 1995a.
- Ciais, P., Tans, P. P., White, J. W. C., Trolier, M., Francey, R. J., Berry, J. A., Randall, D. R., Sellers, P. J., Collatz, J. G., and Schimel, D. S.: Partitioning of ocean and land uptake of  $CO_2$  as inferred by  $\delta^{18}O$  measurements from the NOAA Climate Monitoring and Diagnostics Laboratory Global Air Sampling Network, J. Geophys. Res., 100, 5051–5070, 1995b.
- Ciais, P., Denning, A. S., Tans, P. P., Berry, J. A., Randall, D. A., Collatz, G. J., Sellers, P. J., White, J. W. C., Trolier, M., Meijer, H. A. J., Francey, R. J., Monfray, P., and Heimann, M.: A threedimensional synthesis study of δ<sup>18</sup>O in atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, 1: Surface fluxes, J. Geophys. Res.-Atmos., 102, 5857–5872, 1997.
- Clog, M., Stolper, D., and Eiler, J. M.: Kinetics of CO<sub>2</sub>(g)–H<sub>2</sub>O(1) isotopic exchange, including mass 47 isotopologues, Chem. Geol., 395, 1–10, 2015.
- Cuntz, M., Ciais, P., Hoffmann, G., Allison, C. E., Francey, R. J., Knorr, W., Tans, P. P., White, J. W. C., and Levin, I.: A comprehensive global three-dimensional model of  $\delta^{18}$ O in atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>: 2. Mapping the atmospheric signal, J. Geophys. Res., 108, 4527, doi:10.1029/2002jd003153, 2003.
- Deines, P.: The isotopic composition of reduced organic carbon, in: Handbook of Environmental Isotope Geochemistry, 1. The Terrestrial Environment, edited by: Fritz, P. and Fontes, J. C., Elsevier, 329–406, 1980.

- Dennis, K. J., Affek, H. P., Passey, B. H., Schrag, D. P., and Eiler, J. M.: Defining an absolute reference frame for "clumped" isotope studies of CO<sub>2</sub>, Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta, 75, 7117–7131, 2011.
- Drake, J. E., Gallet-Budynek, A., Hofmockel, K. S., Bernhardt, E. S., Billings, S. A., Jackson, R. B., Johnsen, K. S., Lichter, J., Mc-Carthy, H. R., McCormack, M. L., Moore, D. J., Oren, R., Palmroth, S., Phillips, R. P., Pippen, J. S., Pritchard, S. G., Treseder, K. K., Schlesinger, W. H., Delucia, E. H., and Finzi, A. C.: Increases in the flux of carbon belowground stimulate nitrogen uptake and sustain the long-term enhancement of forest productivity under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>, Ecol. Lett., 14, 349–357, 2011.
- Eiler, J. M. and Schauble, E.: <sup>18</sup>O<sup>13</sup>C<sup>16</sup>O in Earth's atmosphere, Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta, 68, 4767–4777, 2004.
- Farquhar, G. D. and Lloyd, J.: Carbon and oxygen isotope effects in the exchange of carbon dioxide between plants and the atmosphere, in: Stable isotopes and plant carbon-water relations, edited by: Ehleringer, J. R., Hall, A. E., and Farquhar, G. D., Academic Press, New York, 47–70, 1993.
- Farquhar, G. D., Ehleringer, J. R., and Hubick, K. T.: Carbon isotope discrimination and photosynthesis, Annu. Rev. Plant. Physiol. Plant Mol. Biol., 40, 503–537, 1989.
- Farrauto, R. J. and Heck, R. M.: Catalytic converters: state of the art and perspectives, Catal. Today, 51, 351–360, 1999.
- Flanagan, L. B., Brooks, J. R., Varney, G. T., and Ehleringer, J. R.: Discrimination against C<sup>18</sup>O<sup>16</sup>O during photosynthesis and the oxygen isotope ratio of respired CO<sub>2</sub> in boreal forest ecosystems, Global Biogeochem. Cy., 11, 83–98, 1997.
- Francey, R. J. and Tans, P. P.: Latitudinal variation in O-18 of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, Nature, 327, 495–497, 1987.
- Francey, R. J., Tans, P. P., Allison, C. E., Enting, I. G., White, J. W. C., and Trolier, M.: Changes in oceanic and terrestrial carbon uptake since 1982, Nature, 373, 326–330, 1995.
- Francois, R., Altabet, M. A., Goericke, R., McCorckle, D. C., Brunet, C., and Poisson, A.: Changes in the  $\delta^{13}$ C of surface water particulate organic matter across the subtropical convergence in the SW Indian Ocean, Global Biogeochem. Cy., 7, 627–644, 1993.
- Ghosh, P., Adkins, J., Affek, H. P., Balta, B., Guo, W., Schauble, E., Schrag, D., and Eiler, J. M.: <sup>13</sup>C–<sup>18</sup>O bonds in carbonate minerals: a new kind of paleothermometer, Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta, 70, 1439–1456, 2006.
- Gillon, J. and Yakir, D.: Influence of carbonic anhydrase activity in terrestrial vegetation on the <sup>18</sup>O content of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, Science, 291, 2584–2587, 2001.
- Goericke, R. and Fry, B.: Variations of marine plankton  $\delta^{13}$ C with latitude, temperature, and dissolved CO<sub>2</sub> in the world ocean, Global Biogeochem. Cy., 8, 85–90, 1994.
- Hoag, K. J., Still, C. J., Fung, I. Y., and Boering, K. A.: Triple oxygen isotope composition of tropospheric carbon dioxide as a tracer of terrestrial gross carbon fluxes, Geophys. Res. Lett., 32, L02802, doi:10.1029/2004GL021011, 2005.
- Hofmann, M. E. G., Horváth, B., and Pack, A.: Triple oxygen isotope equilibrium fractionation between carbon dioxide and water, Earth Planet. Sci. Lett., 319–320, 159–164, 2012.
- Ito, A.: A global-scale simulation of the CO<sub>2</sub> exchange between the atmosphere and the terrestrial biosphere with a mechanistic model including stable carbon isotopes, 1953–1999, Tellus B, 55, 596–612, 2003.

- Kašpar, J., Fornasiero, P., and Hickey, N.: Automotive catalytic converters: current status and some perspectives, Catal. Today, 77, 419–449, 2003.
- Klingstedt, F., Arve, K., Eränen, K., and Murzin, D. Y.: Toward Improved Catalytic Low-Temperature  $NO_x$  Removal in Diesel-Powered Vehicles, Acc. Chem. Res., 39, 273–282, 2006.
- Kroopnick, P. and Craig, H.: Atmospheric oxygen Isotopic composition and solubility fraction, Science, 175, 54–55, 1972.
- Laskar, A. H., Huang, J. C., Hsu, S. C., Bhattacharya, S. K., Wang, C. H., and Liang, M. C.: Stable isotopic composition of near surface atmospheric water vapor and rain–vapor interaction in Taipei, Taiwan, J. Hydrol, 519, 2091–2100, 2014.
- Laskar, A. H., Mahata, S., and Liang, M. C.: Identification of anthropogenic CO<sub>2</sub> using triple oxygen and clumped isotpes, Environ. Sci. Tech., in review, 2016a.
- Laskar, A. H., Yui, T. F., and Liang, M. C.: Clumped Isotope Composition of Marbles from the Backbone Range of Taiwan, Terra Nova, 28, 265–270, doi:10.1111/ter.12217, 2016b.
- Liang, M. C. and Mahata, S.: Oxygen anomaly in near surface carbon dioxide reveals deep stratospheric intrusion, Scientific Reports, 5, 11352, doi:10.1038/srep11352, 2015.
- Mahata, S., Bhattacharya, S. K., Wang, C. H., and Liang, M. C.: An improved CeO<sub>2</sub> method for high-precision measurements of <sup>17</sup>O /<sup>16</sup>O ratios for atmospheric carbon dioxide, Rapid Commun. Mass Spectrom., 26, 1909–1922, 2012.
- Miller, J. B., Lehman, S. J., Montzka, S. A., Sweeney, C., Miller, B. R., Karion, A., Wolak, C., Dlugokencky, E. J., Southon, J., Turnbull, J. C., and Tans, P. P.: Linking emissions of fossil fuel CO<sub>2</sub> and other anthropogenic trace gases using atmospheric <sup>14</sup>CO<sub>2</sub>, J. Geophys. Res., 117, D08302, doi:10.1029/2011JD017048, 2012.
- Mook, W. G.: <sup>13</sup>C in atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, Neth. J. Sea Res., 20, 211–223, 1986.
- Murayama, S., Takamura, C., Yamamoto, S., Saigusa, N., Morimoto, S., Kondo, H., Nakazawa, T., Aoki, S., Usami, T., and Kondo, M.: Seasonal variations of atmospheric  $CO_2$ ,  $\delta^{13}C$ , and  $\delta^{18}O$  at a cool temperate deciduous forest in Japan: Influence of Asian monsoon, J. Geophys. Res., 115, D17304, doi:10.1029/2009JD013626, 2010.
- Newman, S., Xu, X., Affek, H. P., Stolper, E., and Epstein, S.: Changes in mixing ratio and isotopic composition of CO<sub>2</sub> in urban air from the Los Angeles basin, California, between 1972 and 2003, J. Geophys. Res., 113, D23304, doi:10.1029/2008JD009999, 2008.
- Pataki, D. E., Ehleringer, J. R., Flanagan, L. B., Yakir, D., Bowling, D. R., Still, C. J., Buchmann, N., Kaplan, J. O., and Berry, J. A.: The application and interpretation of Keeling plots in terrestrial carbon cycle research, Global Biogeochem. Cy., 17, 1022, doi:10.1029/2001GB001850, 2003.
- Popa, M. E., Vollmer, M. K., Jordan, A., Brand, W. A., Pathirana, S. L., Rothe, M., and Röckmann, T.: Vehicle emissions of greenhouse gases and related tracers from a tunnel study:  $CO:CO_2$ ,  $N_2O:CO_2$ ,  $CH_4:CO_2$ ,  $O_2:CO_2$  ratios, and the stable isotopes <sup>13</sup>C and <sup>18</sup>O in CO<sub>2</sub> and CO, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 14, 2105–2123, doi:10.5194/acp-14-2105-2014, 2014.

- Peltier, G., Cournac, L., Despax, V., Dimon, B., Fina, L., Genty, B., and Rumeau, D.: Carbonic anhydrase activity in leaves as measured in vivo by <sup>18</sup>O exchange between carbon dioxide and water, Planta, 196, 732–739, 1995.
- Peng, T., Wang, H. C., and Huang, C.: Stable isotopic characteristic of Taiwan's precipitation: a case study of western Pacific monsoon region, Earth Planet. Sci. Lett., 289, 357–366, 2010.
- Peylin, P., Ciais, P., Denning, A. S., Tans, P. P., Berry, J. A., and White, J. W. C.: A 3-dimensional study of  $\delta^{18}$ O in atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>: contribution of different land ecosystems, Tellus B, 51, 642–667, 1999.
- Riley, W. J., Still, C. J., Helliker, B. R., Ribas-Carbo, M., and Berry, J. A.: <sup>18</sup>O composition of CO<sub>2</sub> and H<sub>2</sub>O ecosystem pools and fluxes in a tallgrass prairie: simulations and comparisons to measurements, Glob. Change Biol., 9, 1567–1581, 2003.
- Tans, P. P., Berry, J. A., and Keeling, R. F.: Oceanic <sup>13</sup>C /<sup>12</sup>C observations: A new window on ocean CO<sub>2</sub> uptake, Global Biogeochim. Cy., 7, 353–368, 1993.
- Thiemens, M. H., Chakraborty, S., and Jackson, T. L.: Decadal  $\Delta^{17}$ O record of tropospheric CO<sub>2</sub>: Verification of a stratospheric component in the troposphere, J. Geophys. Res., 119, 6221–6229, 2014.
- Wang, Z., Schauble, E. A., and Eiler, J. M.: Equilibrium thermodynamics of multiply substituted isotopologues of molecular gases, Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta, 68, 4779–4797, 2004.
- Welp, L. R., Keeling, R. F., Meijer, H. A. J., Bollenbacher, A. F., Piper, S. C., Yoshimura, K., Francey, R. J., Allison, C. E., and Wahlen, M.: Interannual variability in the oxygen isotopes of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> driven by El Niño, Nature, 477, 579–582, 2011.
- Yakir, D. and Wang, X. F.: Fluxes of CO<sub>2</sub> and water between terrestrial vegetation and the atmosphere estimated from isotope measurements, Nature, 380, 515–517, 1996.
- Ye, F., Deng, W., Xie, L., Wei, G., and Jia, G.: Surface water  $\delta^{18}$ O in the marginal China seas and its hydrological implications, Coast. Est. S., 147, 25–31, 2014.
- Yeung, L. Y., Affek, H. P., Hoag, K. J., Guo, W. F., Wiegel, A. A., Atlas, E. L., Scaauffler, S. M., Okumura, M., Boering, K. A., and Eiler, J. M.: Large and unexpected enrichment in strato-spheric <sup>16</sup>O<sup>13</sup>C<sup>18</sup>O and its meredional variation, P. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA, 106, 11496–11501, 2009.
- Yeung, L. Y., Ash, J. L., and Young, E. D.: Biological signatures in clumped isotopes of O<sub>2</sub>, Science, 348, 431–434, 2015.
- Zhai, W., Dai, M., Cai, W. J., Wang, Y., and Hong, H.: The partial pressure of carbon dioxide and air-sea fluxes in the northern South China Sea in spring, summer and autum., Mar. Chem., 96, 87–97, 2005.
- Zhang, J., Quay, P. D., and Wilbur, D. O.: Carbon isotope fractionation during gas-water exchange and dissolution of CO<sub>2</sub>, Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta, 59, 107–114, doi:10.1016/0016-7037(95)91550-d, 1995.