Biogeosciences Discuss., 10, 19701–19730, 2013 www.biogeosciences-discuss.net/10/19701/2013/ doi:10.5194/bgd-10-19701-2013 © Author(s) 2013. CC Attribution 3.0 License.



This discussion paper is/has been under review for the journal Biogeosciences (BG). Please refer to the corresponding final paper in BG if available.

## The role of ocean acidification in *Emiliania huxleyi* coccolith thinning in the Mediterranean Sea

K. J. S. Meier<sup>1,\*</sup>, L. Beaufort<sup>1</sup>, S. Heussner<sup>2,3</sup>, and P. Ziveri<sup>4,5</sup>

 <sup>1</sup>CEREGE, Aix-Marseille Université – CNRS, BP80 cedex 4, 13545 Aix en Provence, France
 <sup>2</sup>CNRS, CEFREM, UMR5110, 66860 Perpignan, France
 <sup>3</sup>Univ. Perpignan Via Domitia, CEFREM, UMR5110, 66860 Perpignan, France
 <sup>4</sup>Institute of Environmental Science and Technology (ICTA), Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona (UAB), Bellaterra 08193, Spain
 <sup>5</sup>Cluster Earth & Climate, Department of Earth Sciences, FALW, VU Amsterdam, 1081HV Amsterdam, the Netherlands
 <sup>\*</sup>now at: Christian-Albrechts-Universität zu Kiel, Institute of Geosciences, Ludewig-Meyn-Str.

10, 24118 Kiel, Germany

Received: 21 November 2013 - Accepted: 3 December 2013 - Published: 16 December 2013

Correspondence to: K. J. S. Meier (smeier@gpi.uni-kiel.de)

Published by Copernicus Publications on behalf of the European Geosciences Union.





## Abstract

Ocean acidification is a result of the uptake of anthropogenic  $CO_2$  from the atmosphere into the ocean and has been identified as a major environmental and economic threat. The release of several thousands of petagrams of carbon over a few hundred years will

- overwhelm the capacity of the surface ocean reservoirs to absorb carbon. The recorded and anticipated changes in seawater carbonate chemistry will presumably affect the global oceanic carbonate production. Coccolithophores as the primary calcifying phytoplankton group, and especially *Emiliania huxleyi* as the most abundant species have shown a reduction of calcification at increased CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations for the majority
- <sup>10</sup> of strains tested in culture experiments. A reduction of calcification is associated with a decrease in coccolith weight. However, the effect in monoclonal cultures is relatively small compared to the strong variability displayed in natural *E. huxleyi* communities, as these are a mix of genetically and sometimes morphologically distinct types. Average coccolith weight is likely influenced by the variability in seawater carbonate chemistry
- in different parts of the worlds' oceans and on glacial/interglacial time scales due to both physiological effects and morphotype selectivity. An effect of the ongoing ocean acidification on *E. huxleyi* calcification has so far not been documented in situ. Here, we analyze *E. huxleyi* coccolith weight from the NW Mediterranean Sea in a 12 yr sediment trap series, and surface sediment and sediment core samples using an auto-
- <sup>20</sup> mated recognition and analyzing software. Our findings clearly show (1) a continuous decrease in the average coccolith weight of *E. huxleyi* from 1993 to 2005, reaching levels below pre-industrial Holocene and industrial 20th century values recorded in the sedimentary record, and (2) seasonal variability in coccolith weight that is linked to the coccolithophore production. The observed long-term decrease in coccolith weight is
- <sup>25</sup> most likely a result of the changes in the surface ocean carbonate system. Our results provide first indications of an in situ impact of ocean acidification on coccolithophore weight in a natural *E. huxleyi* population even in the highly alkaline Mediterranean Sea.





## 1 Introduction

A key question in global climate change research is how the uptake of anthropogenic CO<sub>2</sub> from the atmosphere into the ocean will affect the ocean ecosystem in the near future (Bindoff et al., 2007; Kleypas et al., 2006; Kroeker et al., 2013). Model projections
<sup>5</sup> have shown that the global carbonate system will undergo substantial changes with a drastic decline in pH and calcium carbonate saturation by the end of the century (Orr et al., 2005; Zeebe, 2012). Calcifying organisms are most likely to be negatively affected by the process commonly called "ocean acidification" (OA), and a series of studies have demonstrated the sensitivity of calcification in response to OA for a variety of different organism groups (Kleypas, 1999; Lischka et al., 2011; Moy et al., 2009; Riebesell et al., 2000; van de Waal, 2013). Coccolithophores are the major calcifying phytoplankton group, and a reduction in coccolithophore calcium carbonate production would influence the global carbonate cycle and reduce organic carbon export (Gehlen

- et al., 2007; Wilson et al., 2012). Various culturing studies have demonstrated that the most abundant coccolithophore species *Emiliania huxleyi* reacts to increased CO<sub>2</sub> with
- <sup>15</sup> most abundant coccollitophore species *Emiliania huxleyi* reacts to increased  $CO_2$  with a decrease in calcification, but the response is highly variable between strains (de Bodt et al., 2010; Langer et al., 2009; Riebesell et al., 2000). The genetic diversity among *E. huxleyi* (Read et al., 2013) even harbors a haplotype that can heavily calcify under elevated  $CO_2$  and is environmentally restricted to high latitudes and upwelling regions
- (Beaufort et al., 2011; Smith et al., 2012). This haplotype is probably responsible for previous reports on an increase in *E. huxleyi* weight in response to ocean acidification (Beaufort et al., 2011; Grelaud et al., 2009; Iglesias-Rodriguez et al., 2008), but has not been reported from the Mediterranean thus far (Beaufort et al., 2011).

The in situ response to OA is more difficult to investigate, as physiological mea-<sup>25</sup> surements on coccolithophore calcification are not feasible over extended time periods in the field. Coccolith weight increases under conditions that are favorable for coccolithophore calcification and therefore is an indicator for the calcification rate of the coccolithophore cell (Bach et al., 2012; Beaufort et al., 2011). A global study on





the variations of coccolith weight over the natural range of CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations in the world's oceans has shown that coccolith weight decreases with increasing CO<sub>2</sub>, and this effect can also be traced back in sedimentary archives of the last glaciation under natural CO<sub>2</sub> variations (Beaufort et al., 2011). In summary, coccolith weight decreases in laboratory experiments mimicking future OA scenarios, it decreases during periods

of natural  $CO_2$  increase during the last glacial termination, and it is nowadays lower in oceanic regions with naturally elevated  $CO_2$  concentrations.

In this study we tested whether the ongoing ocean acidification has already affected the weight of *E. huxleyi* in the NW Mediterranean Sea. We carried out weight measure-

ments on *E. huxleyi* coccoliths from a sediment trap series deployed in the Gulf of Lions from 1993 to 2005, and compared them to environmental data in order to determine which environmental factors may have driven changes in coccolithophore calcification. We also investigated sediment records from the region representing the 20th century and the Holocene (the last 10 000 yr) in order to test if coccolith weight has decreased
 since the beginning of the industrial period.

## 2 Site description

The Mediterranean Sea is known to be highly supersaturated with respect to carbonate throughout the entire basin from the surface to depth (Alvarez et al., 2013; Schneider et al., 2010, 2007). At the same time, it serves as a sink for anthropogenic CO<sub>2</sub>, which
is absorbed in the surface layers and transported into the deeper parts of the basin by mixing (Ait-Ameur and Goyet, 2006; Bethoux et al., 2005). The absolute values of anthropogenic carbon in the Mediterranean Sea are exceptionally high, and a decrease in pH between 0.061 and 0.148 since the pre-industrial era has been suggested (Schneider et al., 2010; Touratier and Goyet, 2011; Touratier et al., 2012). These unique
oceanographic features make the Mediterranean a natural laboratory to study the effect of anthropogenic acidification on calcifying organisms.





A key area that combines all of these aspects is the northwestern part of the Mediterranean. A natural annual variation in pCO<sub>2</sub> driven mainly by temperature can be observed in the surface water column with the highest values occurring in the upper 50 m in summer under well-stratified conditions (Copin-Montégut et al., 2004). In winter the water column becomes unstable at temperatures below ~ 13°C and the surface water 5 mixes with the underlying intermediate waters that are rich in dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC). This leads to an increase in  $pCO_2$  in surface waters in autumn and early winter when biological production is low. However, mixing also brings nutrients into the photic zone resulting in phytoplankton blooms beginning in late winter and early spring, which lead to a pCO<sub>2</sub> decrease (Copin-Montégut and Bégovic, 2002; Copin-Montégut 10 et al., 2004).

Long-term algal pigment observations at the DYFAMED site in the NW Mediterranean Sea have shown that haptophytes (including coccolithophores) are generally the dominant algal class throughout the year (Marty and Chiaverini, 2010; Marty et al.,

2002). Production of haptophytes is highest in February/March and mostly takes place 15 between 20 and 50 m water depth (Marty et al., 2002). This annual cycle is controlled by a seasonal change between nitrate limitation during winter and phosphate limitation during summer (Marty et al., 2002).

A prominent hydrological change has been observed in the NW Mediterranean Sea in 2006, with a warming of the deeper water masses due to mixing of the entire water 20 column during winter (Marty and Chiaverini, 2010). This event was presumably preconditioned by drought years from 2003 to 2005, leading to a salinity increase and subsequently more intense mixing in winter. After these intense mixing events, nutrient levels were higher than usual, leading to diatoms becoming more abundant during the

following spring blooms (Marty and Chiaverini, 2010). 25



#### 3 Material and methods

The sediment trap material investigated here originates from the Gulf of Lions, NW Mediterranean Sea  $(43^{\circ}02' \text{ N}, 5^{\circ}11' \text{ E}, 1030 \text{ m} \text{ water depth}, \text{ Fig. 1})$ . A sediment trap was continuously deployed over 6 month periods from 1993 to 2005 in the Planier

- <sup>5</sup> Canyon at 500 m water depth and 530 m above bottom. No samples were available for the periods February–April 1994, June 1996 to January 1997, June–September 2000 and May–September 2004. The collected particles used here were filtered and picked to remove microzooplankton from the samples. The trap details and the description of the original sample processing have been published before (Heussner et al., 2006).
- <sup>10</sup> Trap cups were filled with a formalin solution and neutralized with sodium borate, and pH was monitored before deployment and before processing to verify and ensure carbonate preservation.

Splits of the original sediment trap samples were brought into homogenous suspension in water. An aliquot representing between 0.2 and 2 mg of trap particles was

taken from the suspension with a glass pipette and placed on a 47 mm diameter and 0.45 μm pore size cellulose nitrate filter. The filter was oven dried at 50 °C over night and embedded in Canada balsam on a glass slide to make the filter transparent.

All slides were analyzed with a polarizing microscope (LEICA DMRBE) with a 2 Megapixel Spot Insight camera. Routine checks on the assemblage showed that *E*.

- huxleyi dominated the assemblage throughout the record. 40 fields of view were taken automatically and analyzed with the automated recognition software SYRACO (Beaufort and Dollfus, 2004). Image analysis was performed on the output files for *Emiliania huxleyi* to obtain length and weight of the individual coccoliths. In total 35 602 coccoliths were identified. Only those data points within the inner fence of a box and whisker
- <sup>25</sup> plot of coccolith length and weight were included in the analysis, i.e. values larger than 4.22 µm length and 12.28 pg weight were eliminated (1035 data points). For methodological details see previous studies (Beaufort, 2005; Beaufort et al., 2011, 2008).





The selected surface and the Holocene sediment samples were collected during R/V *Meteor* cruise M40/4 (1998). Multicorer station #82 from the Gulf of Lions (42°18.51′ N, 3°46.4′ E, 1078 m water depth, 0–1 cm) spans approximately the last 40 to 80 yr, assuming approximate sedimentation rates of 0.1 to 0.15 cm yr<sup>-1</sup> (Miralles et al., 2005)

- and a bioturbation depth of 5–8 cm for the position. The gravity core station #87 taken near the Balears (38°59.28' N, 04°01.38' E, 1913 m water depth, 0–30 cm, sampled every cm) covers the time span of about 200 to 10 800 yr BP (Emeis et al., 2003). Smear slides were prepared using standard protocols, and coccolith measurements were carried out as described above.
- Environmental data covering the time span of the analyzed trap samples were collected from the DYFAMED database (http://www.obs-vlfr.fr/dyfBase/index.php), the Ocean Productivity homepage (http://www.science.oregonstate.edu/ocean.productivity/index.php), and the OceanColor webpage (http://oceancolor.gsfc.nasa.gov). Detailed carbonate system parameters, temperature, salinity and nutrient measurements are only available for the DYFAMED site, which is located about 200 km
- east of the trap position (43°25′ N, 7°52′ E), i.e. upstream with respect to the general E–W circulation of the Northern Current along the slope (Fig. 1). It has been shown before that this data can be used for comparison with the sediment trap data (Heussner et al., 2006). Carbonate system measurements (i.e. alkalinity and DIC) are only avail-
- <sup>20</sup> able for the years 1998 to 2000 and 2003 to 2005. Data were obtained for the upper 200 m of the water column. Missing measurements were replaced with values obtained from linear regression of the measurements from above and below. [CO<sub>2</sub>] and pH were calculated from the measured total alkalinity and dissolved inorganic carbon measurements with the CO<sub>2</sub>SYS macro (Lewis and Wallace, 1998) using the CO<sub>2</sub> dissociation
- <sup>25</sup> constants by Mehrbach et al. (1973) refit by Dickson and Millero (1987), KHSO<sub>4</sub> by Dickson (1990) and the seawater scale for pH. This data based on carbonate system measurements was then compared to theoretical carbonate system parameters calculated by the CO<sub>2</sub>SYS macro as described above, by using atmospheric [CO<sub>2</sub>] and alkalinity calculated from salinity (Schneider et al., 2007) for the entire timespan.



Primary productivity (npp) (Behrenfeld and Falkowski, 1997) and particulate inorganic carbon data (PIC) are derived from SeaWiFS satellite ocean color measurements taken as close as possible to the trap location (43° N, 5°10′ E, 10′ resolution).

- A singular spectrum analysis (SSA) was carried out on the coccolith weight and 5 the environmental datasets in order to decompose trends from seasonal signals. For this, an evenly spaced time series without gaps (monthly values) was produced from the data. Monthly averages were calculated in those cases where traps were sampled twice in one month. Small gaps (1 to 3 months) were filled by linear interpolation between the values before and after the gap. Longer gaps were filled using the monthly averages from all years, in order to avoid the loss of the seasonal signal in the gap.
- These values were adjusted for the specific year, in order to compensate for colder or warmer years compared to the long-term average. For this, the difference between the actual measurement and the monthly average was calculated for the months before and after the gap. A linear interpolation between these two differences led to the adjustment values for the monthly averages. 15

#### **Results and discussion** 4

#### E. huxleyi coccolith weight and length 4.1

Seasonality and long-term trends are clearly shown in the weight and length of E. huxleyi coccoliths collected by the sediment trap investigated here (Fig. 2). The mean weight of *E. huxleyi* coccoliths shows maxima from February to May and minima from 20 August to November during most parts of the record. The annual amplitude in average weight is about 1 pg. There are two periods in the record during which maxima occur twice a year. From 2001 to 2002, and from late 2004 to late 2005 maxima occur around January and June (Fig. 2a and b). Average coccolith length shows little seasonal variability with an amplitude of about 0.1 µm (Fig. 2c and d). 25





The inter-annual variability in weight and length of *E. huxleyi* is relatively small, but a long-term decrease can be observed from 1993 to 2005 (Fig. 2a and c), with a more pronounced decrease starting in 2001 and a further decrease only in weight from September 2004 onwards. Annual mean weight values decrease from about 5 pg in the first part of the record to less than 4 pg towards the end, equaling approximately 5 a 20% reduction in average weight (Fig. 2a and c). Annual mean length values show the same trend, but decrease only from 3.16 to 3.06 µm, which is a reduction of about 3%. Theoretically, a reduction in length could be responsible for a decrease in weight without changing how well the coccolith is calcified. Coccolith weight has been shown to be approximately linearly correlated to the cube of coccolith length (Young and Ziveri, 10 2000). This means that a 3% reduction in length (i.e. a reduction to 97%) equals approximately a 9% loss in weight ( $0.97^3 \approx 0.91$ ), which is considerably less than the observed weight decrease of about 20%. Therefore, coccolith weight decreases more than can be expected based on the length reduction, indicating that coccoliths become

20

less calcified. 15

> There are four intervals in the 1993–2005 trap deployment during which exceptionally low weight and length values of about 2 to 3 pg and less than 3 µm have been observed (Fig. 2). These are November 1993 to April 1994, June to November 2000, May to August 2004, and September to December 2005. As these extremely low measurements are not randomly spread over the record but last over periods of several months, it is likely that they represent a mechanism that leads to decreased coccolith weight. Carbonate dissolution during or after sample preparation is unlikely to have

occurred, as all samples have been treated in the same way, and previous studies did not show a decrease in the carbonate content during these periods (Heussner et al.,

2006). In most of these samples very few coccoliths were detected (Fig. 2), which 25 suggests that E. huxleyi production could have been lower. The years 2000, 2004 and 2005 were characterized by intense mixing events during late winter (Marty and Chiaverini, 2010). In late winter and early spring of these years E. huxleyi is still abundant, but in the following months numbers decrease to a minimum (Fig. 2). As diatoms





have a tendency to be more abundant during years following mixing events (Marty and Chiaverini, 2010), the decrease in *E. huxleyi* production may be related to a different phytoplankton community structure. In addition, in the years 2000 and 2004 coccolith weight changes from a one maximum per year to a two maxima per year signal after
these coccolith-poor periods (Fig. 2). This may indicate, that the normal seasonal development of the *E. huxleyi* population was disturbed following intense winter mixing. The unusual seasonality can last for extended periods. After the change in late 2000 it took the system until 2003 before a normal seasonal signal established again in *E. huxleyi* weight (Fig. 2). The exact mechanism leading to these periods with extremely
low coccolith weight and length values remains unclear, but it seems very likely that they represent exceptional phases that are different from the normal seasonal signal in the record. Therefore, measurements from these periods have been excluded from all analyses.

#### 4.2 Sediment transport

- <sup>15</sup> Seasonal changes in sediment resuspension plays an important role in particle transfer on the Gulf of Lions margin (Canals et al., 2006; Heussner et al., 2006). In a previous multi sediment trap study including the trap investigated here, a linear increase of the carbonate content in the sediment trap material with increasing mass flux has been observed (Heussner et al., 2006). In the samples used here the influence of biological
   <sup>20</sup> production on the sedimentation was shown to be highest compared to other settings in
- the Gulf of Lions (Heussner et al., 2006). This is likely because the trap was deployed in relatively shallow water (500 m water depth, mid-water column) and was located in the eastern part of the Gulf of Lions where the influence of resuspended material transported is smallest (Heussner et al., 2006). The lack of a linear relationship be-
- tween total mass flux and the number of *E. huxleyi* coccoliths per gram of particles in our trap is shown in Fig. 3. This indicates that the majority of *E. huxleyi* coccoliths are likely to reflect the actual export production rather than resuspension, as has also been observed for silicoflagellates in the same trap (Rigual-Hernández et al., 2010).





#### 4.3 Environmental controls

Oceanographic features of the NW Mediterranean Sea are well reflected in the weight and length of *E. huxleyi* coccoliths collected by the sediment trap investigated here (Fig. 4). Possible causes for the observed seasonal and long-term variations in *E. huxleyi* weight and length are changes in *E. huxleyi* production, morphotype selectivity

huxleyi weight and length are changes in *E. huxleyi* production, morphotype selectivity related to environmental factors or changes in *E. huxleyi* calcification due to natural carbonate system variability (seasonal) or ocean acidification (long-term).

# 4.3.1 Seasonal variation in temperature, nutrients, salinity, and the carbonate system

- *Emiliania huxleyi* coccolith weight and length have been shown to vary with different environmental parameters. The seasonal variability in temperature, salinity, nutrient concentration, and the carbonate system parameters is clearly expressed in both the raw measurements and the SSA extraction of the seasonal signal (Figs. 4 and 5).
- *E. huxleyi* morphotypes show a distinct temperature preference in the NW Pacific, with a morphotype below 4.1 μm length preferentially found in warmer waters, and larger morphotypes characteristic of colder water masses (Hagino et al., 2005). In paleoceanographic studies, *E. huxleyi* coccoliths > 4 μm are frequently used as a coldwater indicator (Flores et al., 2010). In our record there is no detectable seasonal variability in *E. huxleyi* length, and the vast majority of coccoliths measured here are below
- <sup>20</sup> 4 µm in length, implying that the length variation observed in our data cannot result from *E. huxleyi* morphotype temperature selectivity. In addition, a direct influence of temperature on coccolith weight has not been found in culturing experiments (de Bodt et al., 2010) or to be statistically significant in a recently published global study (Beaufort et al., 2011). In our study, however, *E. huxleyi* coccolith weight has its maximum
- in February to May when temperatures are still relatively low, and decreases during summer when temperatures reach a maximum of about 16 to 20 °C in the upper 40 m (Figs. 4 and 5). Therefore, the possibility that the temperature increase during the year





contributes to decreased average weight in *E. huxleyi* cannot be ruled out entirely. As mentioned above, the seasonal temperature variability also causes changes in the carbonate system (Copin-Montégut et al., 2004), which in turn could be responsible for coccolith calcification changes.

Salinity has been suggested to influence *E. huxleyi* morphometry, which has been consequently proposed as an indicator for past sea surface salinity (Bollmann et al., 2009; Fielding et al., 2009). However, a recent global survey has shown that the calcification state of *E. huxleyi* is not related to salinity (Beaufort et al., 2011), which is confirmed by our data. The salinity variability is too small (Figs. 4 and 5) to account for
 a substantial change in coccolith length (Bollmann et al., 2009), and therefore not one of the main factors controlling weight and length of *E. huxleyi* here.

Nutrient availability influences calcification in *E. huxleyi* in two ways: increased coccolith weight has been observed in cells grown under higher nutrient conditions and produced during coccolithophore blooms (Beaufort et al., 2007), but also under phos-

- <sup>15</sup> phate limitation despite slower growth (Kayano and Shiraiwa, 2009; Müller et al., 2008; Satoh et al., 2009). At the trap site both effects may play a role. Satellite derived primary production data shows a seasonal productivity cycle with maxima occurring in late winter/early spring, and phosphate limitation occurs in summer (Figs. 4 and 5). Absolute nutrient values are highest in winter (December to February) with about 6µmolL<sup>-1</sup>
- nitrate and 0.2 µmol L<sup>-1</sup> phosphate, and then decrease to extremely low values in summer. The lower part of the photic zone also shows little seasonal variability but generally slightly higher values with up to 8 µmol L<sup>-1</sup> nitrate and 0.4 µmol L<sup>-1</sup> phosphate (Figs. 4 and 5). Coccolith weight of *E. huxleyi* shows a seasonal cycle that is in good accordance with the nutrient and productivity pattern (Figs. 4 and 5), whereas coccolith
- <sup>25</sup> length shows no prominent seasonality. The general productivity pattern in the Gulf of Lions seems therefore to be responsible for an increase of *E. huxleyi* coccolith weight in February to May. If the P-limitation in summer has an effect, it is not strong enough to level out the seasonal signal in *E. huxleyi* weight, but may be one of the reasons for the reduced seasonal signal in *E. huxleyi* coccolith length. A less pronounced seasonality





in nitrate and phosphate concentrations in 2001 and 2002 is paralleled by a reduced seasonal signal of *E. huxleyi* coccolith weight (Fig. 4), which is a further indication for the importance of nutrient supply for *E. huxleyi* calcification. Interestingly, the PIC data does not follow the productivity and coccolith weight trends (Fig. 4). As recently shown (Daniels et al., 2012) this may be due to suspended particles that are common in coastal regions.

A recently published conceptual model for the effects of the carbonate chemistry on coccolithophore calcification describes that calcification follows an optimum curve response to gradients in pH and dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC) (Krug et al., 2011).

- <sup>10</sup> Calcification will decrease outside the optimum conditions, i.e. with decreasing pH and increasing DIC in the case of OA. An experimental design to test the effect of individual parameters of the carbonate system has confirmed that pH,  $[HCO_3^-]$  and  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  are the main factors controlling coccolith morphology and weight (Bach et al., 2012).  $[CO_3^{2-}]$ was also the statistically most significant factor controlling coccolith weight in a global set of sediment and water samples (Beaufort et al., 2011).
  - In the data presented here, the seasonal signal can be observed on the carbonate system (e.g.  $[CO_2]$ , pH,  $[CO_3^{2^-}]$ , calcite saturation) in the water column at the DYFAMED site (Figs. 4 and 5). The upper part (0–50 m water depth) shows stronger seasonal variability with elevated  $[CO_2]$  and decreased  $[CO_3^{2^-}]$  in late winter and early spring. The
- <sup>20</sup> lower part (70–200 m water depth) shows the opposite and weaker signal (Fig. 4). The upper and lower parts of the water column have similar  $[CO_2]$  and  $[CO_3^{2-}]$  values during winter and early spring when the water column is well mixed (Fig. 4). The temperature increases only in the upper 50 m of the water column during the year (Fig. 4) indicating stratified conditions in summer and autumn. This leads to a decrease in  $[CO_2]$  and an
- <sup>25</sup> increase in  $[CO_3^{2^-}]$  in the upper 50 m of the water column (Copin-Montégut and Bégovic, 2002), whereas the lower part is relatively stable. The largest average coccolith weight of *E. huxleyi* over the year is reached in February to May despite the elevated  $[CO_2]$  and low  $[CO_3^{2^-}]$  values. As shown above, this is probably due to the increase in





coccolithophore production (Figs. 4 and 5), in agreement with the global survey published recently (Beaufort et al., 2011).

#### 4.3.2 Long-term trends

The Mediterranean Sea has undergone acidification since the onset of human industrialisation, and the effect is largest in the NW Mediterranean Sea (up to 0.14 pH units, Touratier and Goyet, 2011; Touratier et al., 2012). Between the two time periods for which direct measurements of the carbonate system are available, [CO<sub>2</sub>] increases about 1  $\mu$ molkg<sup>-1</sup>, pH drops about 0.02 units, [CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>] decreases by 7  $\mu$ molkg<sup>-1</sup>, and the calcite saturation decreases by 0.14 units when comparing the time periods from 1998 to 2000 and 2003 to 2005 (Fig. 6). The calculated carbonate system parameters 10 for the entire record are in the same range and show the same seasonal amplitude as the direct measurements (Fig. 4). The SSA analysis conducted on this data, coccolith weight and other environmental data reveals significant trends only for coccolith weight and the carbonate system parameters, whereas temperature, nutrients, and salinity present a limited variability (Fig. 7). Therefore, the most likely cause for the observed 15 mass loss of E. huxleyi coccoliths is the observed change in surface water carbonate chemistry.

Further support for a reduction of coccolithophore calcification due to the influence of ocean acidification comes from the comparison of preindustrial Holocene and industrial

- 20 20th century records of coccolith weight with the sediment trap data. From 1994 to 2000, the scale of the observed weight variability in *E. huxleyi* coccoliths from the sediment trap is within the range of that recorded in pre-industrial Holocene sediments (Fig. 8). From 2001, annual averages lie in the range of the industrial surface sediments of the Gulf of Lions, that cover an approximate range of about 40–80 yr before the sampling in 1998. From 2004 they fall below these industrial average weight values
- 25 Sampling in 1998. From 2004 they fail below these industrial average weight values (Fig. 8). Even if long-term sediment records that average over a considerable amount of time (40–80 yr in the industrial surface sediment, and a few hundred years in the Holocene record) may not be directly comparable to the interannual trend from the





sediment trap, two conclusions can be drawn: (1) coccolith weight is lower in sediments from the industrial period than in the pre-industrial Holocene, and (2) during recent years the average weight of *E. huxleyi* coccoliths has sunk to values unprecedented in the last 10 000 yr.

#### 5 5 Conclusions

Our study demonstrates that long-term and seasonal variability in the average weight of E. huxleyi coccoliths in the Gulf of Lions has different causes. In the long-term run the seawater carbonate system displays the strongest change of all environmental parameters. Change in the surface water carbonate chemistry is the most likely parameter that has caused the decrease of E. huxleyi coccolith average weight below Holocene 10 and industrial values in the western Mediterranean Sea. Productivity has a large influence on E. huxleyi weight on the seasonal scale, and future changes in the nutrient regime may have additional influence on CaCO<sub>3</sub> quota in coccolithophores. This study supports findings that have so far only been observed in laboratory experiments. Still it is only a first step in understanding what the effects of ocean acidification on coc-15 colithophore calcification will be in the future. Recent evidence suggests resilience to lower pH environments for a genetically distinct type within the common species E. huxleyi (Beaufort et al., 2011; Read et al., 2013), indicating that the community response of coccolithophores to OA may be different from what can be observed in laboratory experiments on just one strain. Our study deals with a natural assemblage, and it is 20

- very likely that the coccoliths measured here represent more than just one genetic type within *E. huxleyi* (Read et al., 2013). This natural *E. huxleyi* assemblage shows a response to OA. This may be due to both physiological responses, i.e. a decrease in calcification, and morphotype selectivity within *E. huxleyi*. Future work should there-
- <sup>25</sup> fore try to disentangle these two processes of coccolithophore community calcification response to ocean acidification for reliable projections of the future global carbonate production.





Supplementary material related to this article is available online at http://www.biogeosciences-discuss.net/10/19701/2013/ bgd-10-19701-2013-supplement.pdf.

Acknowledgements. We thank N. Buchet and N. Delsaut for sample preparation. This work
 has been made possible thanks to the partial support from the European Science Foundation (ESF) under the EUROCORES Programme EuroCLIMATE, through contract No. ERAS-CT-2003-980409 of the European Commission, DG Research, FP6 (project MERF), from the Agence Nationale de la Recherche under project ANR-12-B06-0007 (CALHIS), and from the European Community's Seventh Framework program under grant agreement 265103 (Project MedSeA).

#### References

15

- Ait-Ameur, N. and Goyet, C.: Distribution and transport of natural and anthropogenic CO<sub>2</sub> in the Gulf of Cadiz, Deep-Sea Res. Pt. II, 53, 1329–1343, doi:10.1016/j.dsr2.2006.04.003, 2006.
  Álvarez, M., Sanleón-Bartolomé, H., Tanhua, T., Mintrop, L., Luchetta, A., Cantoni, C., Schroeder, K., and Civitarese, G.: The CO<sub>2</sub> system in the Mediterranean Sea: a basin wide perspective, Ocean Sci. Discuss., 10, 1447–1504, doi:10.5194/osd-10-1447-2013, 2013.
  Bach, L. T., Bauke, C., Meier, K. J. S., Riebesell, U., and Schulz, K. G.: Influence of changing carbonate chemistry on morphology and weight of coccoliths formed by *Emiliania huxleyi*, Biogeosciences, 9, 3449–3463, doi:10.5194/bg-9-3449-2012, 2012.
- Beaufort, L.: Weight estimates of coccoliths using the optical properties (birefringence) of calcite, Micropaleontology, 51, 289–297, doi:10.2113/gsmicropal.51.4.289, 2005.
   Beaufort, L. and Dollfus, D.: Automatic recognition of coccoliths by dynamical neural networks, Mar. Micropaleontol., 51, 57–73, doi:10.1016/j.marmicro.2003.09.003, 2004.
   Beaufort, L., Probert, I., and Buchet, N.: Effects of acidification and primary production on
- coccolith weight: implications for carbonate transfer from the surface to the deep ocean, Geochem. Geophy. Geosy., 8, Q08011, doi:10.1029/2006GC001493, 2007.





Beaufort, L., Couapel, M., Buchet, N., Claustre, H., and Goyet, C.: Calcite production by coccolithophores in the south east Pacific Ocean, Biogeosciences, 5, 1101–1117, doi:10.5194/bg-5-1101-2008, 2008.

Beaufort, L., Probert, I., de Garidel-Thoron, T., Bendif, E. M., Ruiz-Pino, D., Metzl, N., Goyet, C.,

<sup>5</sup> Buchet, N., Coupel, P., Grelaud, M., Rost, B., Rickaby, R. E. M., and de Vargas, C.: Sensitivity of coccolithophores to carbonate chemistry and ocean acidification, Nature, 476, 80–83, doi:10.1038/nature10295, 2011.

Behrenfeld, M. and Falkowski, P.: Photosynthetic rates derived from satellite-based chlorophyll concentration, Limnol. Oceanogr., 42, 1–20, 1997.

Bethoux, J., Boukhary, El, M., Ruiz-Pino, D., Morin, P. and Copin-Montégut, C.: Nutrient, Oxygen and Carbon Ratios, CO<sub>2</sub> Sequestration and Anthropogenic Forcing in the Mediterranean Sea, in: The Mediterranean Sea, Hdb. Env. Chem., 5K, edited by: Saliot, A., 67–86, Springer-Verlag, Berlin Heidelberg, 2005.

Bindoff, N. L., Willebrand, J., Artale, V., Cazenave, A., Gregory, J., Gulev, S., Hanawa, K.,

- LeQuéré, C., Levitus, S., Nojiri, Y., Shum, C. K., Talley, L. D., and Unnikrishnan, A.: Observations: oceanic climate change and sea level, in: Climate Change 2007: The Physical Science Basis, Contribution of Working Group I to the Fourth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, edited by: Solomon, S., Qin, D., Manning, M., Chen, Z., Marquis, M., Averyt, K. B., Tignor, M., and Miller, H. L., Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK and New York, NY, USA, 2007.
  - Bollmann, J., Herrle, J. O., Cortés, M. Y., and Fielding, S. R.: The effect of sea water salinity on the morphology of *Emiliania huxleyi* in plankton and sediment samples, Earth Planet. Sc. Lett., 284, 320–328, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2009.05.003, 2009.

Canals, M., Puig, P., de Madron, X. D., Heussner, S., Palanques, A., and Fabres, J.: Flushing submarine canyons, Nature, 444, 354–357, doi:10.1038/nature05271, 2006.

25

- Copin-Montégut, C. and Bégovic, M.: Distributions of carbonate properties and oxygen along the water column (0–2000 m) in the central part of the NW Mediterranean Sea (Dyfamed site): influence of winter vertical mixing on air-sea CO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>2</sub> exchanges, Deep-Sea Res. Pt. II, 49, 2049–2066, 2002.
- <sup>30</sup> Copin-Montégut, C., Bégovic, M., and Merlivat, L.: Variability of the partial pressure of CO<sub>2</sub> on diel to annual time scales in the Northwestern Mediterranean Sea, Mar. Chem., 85, 169–189, 2004.





Daniels, C. J., Tyrrell, T., Poulton, A. J., and Pettit, L.: The influence of lithogenic material on particulate inorganic carbon measurements of coccolithophores in the Bay of Biscay, Limnol. Oceanogr., 57, 145–153, doi:10.4319/lo.2012.57.1.0145, 2012.

De Bodt, C., Van Oostende, N., Harlay, J., Sabbe, K., and Chou, L.: Individual and interacting

- effects of pCO<sub>2</sub> and temperature on *Emiliania huxleyi* calcification: study of the calcite production, the coccolith morphology and the coccosphere size, Biogeosciences, 7, 1401–1412, doi:10.5194/bg-7-1401-2010, 2010.
  - Dickson, A. and Millero, F.: A comparison of the equilibrium constants for the dissociation of carbonic acid in seawater media, Deep-Sea Res., 34, 1733–1743, 1987.
- Dickson, A. G.: Standard potential of the reaction: AgCl(s) + 12H<sub>2</sub>(g) = Ag(s) + HCl(aq), and and the standard acidity constant of the ion HSO<sub>4</sub><sup>-</sup> in synthetic sea water from 273.15 to 318.15 K, J. Chem. Thermodyn., 22, 113–127, 1990.
  - Emeis, K.-C., Schulz, H., Struck, U., Rossignol-Strick, M., Erlenkeuser, H., Howell, M., Kroon, D., Mackensen, A., Ishizuka, S., Oba, T., Sakamoto, T., and Koizumi, I.: Eastern
- Mediterranean surface water temperatures and δ<sup>18</sup>O composition during deposition of sapropels in the late Quaternary, Paleoceanography, 18, 1005, doi:10.1029/2000PA000617, 2003.
   Fielding, S., Herrle, J., and Bollmann, J.: Assessing the applicability of *Emiliania huxleyi* coccolith morphology as a sea-surface salinity proxy, Limnol. Oceanogr., 54, 1475–1480, 2009.
   Flores, J.-A., Colmenero-Hidalgo, E., Mejia-Molina, A. E., Baumann, K.-H., Henderiks, J., Lars-
- son, K., Prabhu, C. N., Sierro, F. J., and Rodrigues, T.: Distribution of large *Emiliania huxleyi* in the Central and Northeast Atlantic as a tracer of surface ocean dynamics during the last 25,000 years, Mar. Micropaleontol., 76, 53–66, doi:10.1016/j.marmicro.2010.05.001, 2010.
   Gehlen, M., Gangstø, R., Schneider, B., Bopp, L., Aumont, O., and Ethe, C.: The fate of pelagic CaCO<sub>3</sub> production in a high CO<sub>2</sub> ocean: a model study, Biogeosciences, 4, 505–510. doi:10.5104/bg.4.505-2007.
- <sup>25</sup> 519, doi:10.5194/bg-4-505-2007, 2007.
  - Grelaud, M., Beaufort, L., Cuven, S., and Buchet, N.: Glacial to interglacial primary production and El Nino-Southern Oscillation dynamics inferred from coccolithophores of the Santa Barbara Basin, Paleoceanography, 24, PA1203, doi:10.1029/2007PA001578, 2009.
  - Hagino, K., Okada, H., and Matsuoka, H.: Coccolithophore assemblages and morphotypes
- <sup>30</sup> of *Emiliania huxleyi* in the boundary zone between the cold Oyashio and warm Kuroshio currents off the coast of Japan, Mar. Micropaleontol., 55, 19–47, 2005.
  - Heussner, S., de Madron, X. D., Calafat, A., Canals, M., Carbonne, J., Delsaut, N., and Saragoni, G.: Spatial and temporal variability of downward particle fluxes on a continental slope:





lessons from an 8-yr experiment in the Gulf of Lions (NW Mediterranean), Mar. Geol., 234, 63–92, 2006.

- Iglesias-Rodriguez, M. D., Halloran, P. R., Rickaby, R. E. M., Hall, I. R., Colmenero-Hidalgo, E., Gittins, J. R., Green, D. R. H., Tyrrell, T., Gibbs, S. J., Dassow, von, P., Rehm, E., Arm-
- <sup>5</sup> brust, E. V., and Boessenkool, K. P.: Phytoplankton calcification in a high-CO<sub>2</sub> world, Science, 320, 336–340, doi:10.1126/science.1154122, 2008.
  - Kayano, K. and Shiraiwa, Y.: Physiological regulation of coccolith polysaccharide production by phosphate availability in the coccolithophorid *Emiliania huxleyi*, Plant Cell Physiol., 50, 1522–1531, doi:10.1093/pcp/pcp097, 2009.
- <sup>10</sup> Kleypas, J. A.: Geochemical consequences of increased atmospheric carbon dioxide on coral reefs, Science, 284, 118–120, doi:10.1126/science.284.5411.118, 1999.
  - Kleypas, J. A., Feely, R. A., Fabry, V. J., Langdon, C., Sabine, C. L., and Robbins, L. L.: Impacts of ocean acidification on coral reefs and other marine calcifiers, a guide for future research, Report of a workshop sponsored by NSF, NOAA & USGS, 88 pp., 2006.
- <sup>15</sup> Kroeker, K. J., Kordas, R. L., Crim, R., Hendriks, I. E., Ramajo, L., Singh, G. S., Duarte, C. M., and Gattuso, J. P.: Impacts of ocean acidification on marine organisms: quantifying sensitivities and interaction with warming, Glob. Change Biol., 19, 1884–1896, doi:10.1111/gcb.12179, 2013.

Krug, S. A., Schulz, K. G., and Riebesell, U.: Effects of changes in carbonate chemistry specia-

- tion on *Coccolithus braarudii*: a discussion of coccolithophorid sensitivities, Biogeosciences, 8, 771–777, doi:10.5194/bg-8-771-2011, 2011.
  - Langer, G., Nehrke, G., Probert, I., Ly, J., and Ziveri, P.: Strain-specific responses of *Emiliania huxleyi* to changing seawater carbonate chemistry, Biogeosciences, 6, 2637–2646, doi:10.5194/bg-6-2637-2009, 2009.
- Lewis, E. and Wallace, D.: Program developed for CO<sub>2</sub> System Calculations, ORNL/CDIAC-105, available at: http://cdiac.ornl.gov/oceans/co2rprt.html (last access: 18 July 2012), Carbon Dioxide Inf. Anal. Cent., Oak Ridge Natl. Lab., US Dep. of Energy, Oak Ridge, Tenn., 1998.

Lischka, S., Büdenbender, J., Boxhammer, T., and Riebesell, U.: Impact of ocean acidification

and elevated temperatures on early juveniles of the polar shelled pteropod *Limacina helicina*: mortality, shell degradation, and shell growth, Biogeosciences, 8, 919–932, doi:10.5194/bg-8-919-2011, 2011.





- Discussion 2117-2128, doi:10.5194/bg-7-2117-2010, 2010. Marty, J., Chiaverini, J., Pizay, M., and Avril, B.: Seasonal and interannual dynamics of nutrients and phytoplankton pigments in the western Mediterranean Sea at the DYFAMED time-series Paper station (1991–1999), Deep-Sea Res. Pt. II, 49, 1965–1985, 2002.
- Mehrbach, C., Culberson, C., Hawley, J., and Pytcowicz, R.: Measurement of the apparent dissociation constants of carbonic acid in seawater at atmospheric pressure, Limnol. Oceanogr., 18.897-907.1973.

5

25

Marty, J. C. and Chiavérini, J.: Hydrological changes in the Ligurian Sea (NW Mediterranean,

DYFAMED site) during 1995–2007 and biogeochemical consequences, Biogeosciences, 7,

- Millot, C.: Circulation in the Western Mediterranean Sea, Oceanol, Acta, 10, 143–149, 1987. 10 Miralles, J., Radakovitch, O., and Aloisi, J.-C.: <sup>210</sup>Pb sedimentation rates from the Northwestern Mediterranean margin, Mar. Geol., 216, 155-167, 2005.
  - Moy, A. D., Howard, W. R., Bray, S. G., and Trull, T. W.: Reduced calcification in modern Southern Ocean planktonic foraminifera, Nat. Geosci., 2, 276-280, doi:10.1038/ngeo460, 2009.
- Müller, M. N., Antia, A. N., and LaRoche, J.: Influence of cell cycle phase on calcification in the 15 coccolithophore Emiliania huxleyi, Limnol. Oceanogr., 53, 506-512, 2008.
  - Orr, J. C., Fabry, V. J., Aumont, O., Bopp, L., Doney, S. C., Feely, R. A., Gnanadesikan, A., Gruber, N., Ishida, A., Joos, F., Key, R. M., Lindsay, K., Maier-Reimer, E., Matear, R., Monfray, P., Mouchet, A., Najjar, R. G., Plattner, G.-K., Rodgers, K. B., Sabine, C. L., Sarmiento, J. L.,
- Schlitzer, R., Slater, R. D., Totterdell, I. J., Weirig, M.-F., Yamanaka, Y., and Yool, A.: Anthro-20 pogenic ocean acidification over the twenty-first century and its impact on calcifying organisms, Nature, 437, 681-686, doi:10.1038/nature04095, 2005.
  - Pinardi, N. and Masetti, E.: Variability of the large scale general circulation of the Mediterranean Sea from observations and modelling: a review, Palaeogeogr. Palaeocl., 158, 153-174, 2000.
  - Read, B. A., Kegel, J., Klute, M. J., Kuo, A., Lefebvre, S. C., Maumus, F., Mayer, C., Miller, J., Monier, A., Salamov, A., Young, J., Aguilar, M., Claverie, J.-M., Frickenhaus, S., Gonzalez, K., Herman, E. K., Lin, Y.-C., Napier, J., Ogata, H., Sarno, A. F., Shmutz, J., Schroeder, D., de Vargas, C., Verret, F., Dassow, von, P., Valentin, K., Van de Peer, Y., Wheeler, G., Allen, A. E.,
- Bidle, K., Borodovsky, M., Bowler, C., Brownlee, C., Mark Cock, J., Elias, M., Gladyshev, V. N., 30 Groth, M., Guda, C., Hadaegh, A., Debora Iglesias-Rodriguez, M., Jenkins, J., Jones, B. M., Lawson, T., Leese, F., Lindquist, E., Lobanov, A., Lomsadze, A., Malik, S.-B., Marsh, M. E., Mackinder, L., Mock, T., Mueller-Roeber, B., Pagarete, A., Parker, M., Probert, I., Ques-



**Discussion** Paper

Discussion Paper

**Discussion** Pape

14

Back



Full Screen / Esc

Close

neville, H., Raines, C., Rensing, S. A., Riaño-Pachón, D. M., Richier, S., Rokitta, S., Shiraiwa, Y., Soanes, D. M., van der Giezen, M., Wahlund, T. M., Williams, B., Wilson, W., Wolfe, G., Wurch, L. L., Dacks, J. B., Delwiche, C. F., Dyhrman, S. T., Glöckner, G., John, U., Richards, T., Worden, A. Z., Zhang, X., and Grigoriev, I. V.: Pan genome of the phytoplankton *Emiliania* underpins its global distribution, Nature, 499, 209–213, doi:10.1038/nature12221, 2013.

Riebesell, U., Zondervan, I., Rost, B., Tortell, P., Zeebe, R. E., and Morel, F.: Reduced calcification of marine plankton in response to increased atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, Nature, 407, 364–367, 2000.

5

Rigual-Hernández, A., Bárcena, M., Sierro, F., Flores, J., Hernández-Almeida, I., Sanchez-Vidal, A., Palanques, A., and Heussner, S.: Seasonal to interannual variability and geographic distribution of the silicoflagellate fluxes in the Western Mediterranean, Mar. Micropalaeontol., 77, 46–57, 2010.

Satoh, M., Iwamoto, K., Suzuki, I., and Shiraiwa, Y.: Cold stress stimulates intracellular calcifi-

cation by the coccolithophore, *Emiliania huxleyi* (Haptophyceae) under phosphate-deficient conditions, Mar. Biotechnol., 11, 327–333, doi:10.1007/s10126-008-9147-0, 2009.

Schneider, A., Wallace, D. W. R., and Körtzinger, A.: Alkalinity of the Mediterranean Sea, Geophys. Res. Lett., 34, 1–5, doi:10.1029/2006GL028842, 2007.

Schneider, A., Tanhua, T., Körtzinger, A., and Wallace, D. W. R.: High anthropogenic

- <sup>20</sup> carbon content in the eastern Mediterranean, J. Geophys. Res., 115, C12050, doi:10.1029/2010JC006171, 2010.
  - Smith, H. E. K., Tyrrell, T., Charalampopoulou, A., Dumousseaud, C., Legge, O. J., Birchenough, S., Pettit, L. R., Garley, R., Hartman, S. E., Hartman, M. C., Sagoo, N., Daniels, C. J., Achterberg, E. P., and Hydes, D. J.: Predominance of heavily calcified coc-
- <sup>25</sup> colithophores at low CaCO<sub>3</sub> saturation during winter in the Bay of Biscay, P. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA, 109, 8845–8849, 2012.
  - Touratier, F. and Goyet, C.: Impact of the Eastern Mediterranean Transient on the distribution of anthropogenic CO<sub>2</sub> and first estimate of acidification for the Mediterranean Sea, Deep-Sea Res. Pt. I, 58, 1–15, doi:10.1016/j.dsr.2010.10.002, 2011.
- Touratier, F., Guglielmi, V., Goyet, C., Prieur, L., Pujo-Pay, M., Conan, P., and Falco, C.: Distributions of the carbonate system properties, anthropogenic CO<sub>2</sub>, and acidification during the 2008 BOUM cruise (Mediterranean Sea), Biogeosciences Discuss., 9, 2709–2753, doi:10.5194/bgd-9-2709-2012, 2012.





Van de Waal, D. B., John, U., Ziveri, P., and Reichart, G. J.: Ocean acidification reduces growth and calcification in a marine dinoflagellate, PLoS One, 8, e65987, doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0065987, 2013.

Wilson, J. D., Barker, S., and Ridgwell, A.: Assessment of the spatial variability in particulate

organic matter and mineral sinking fluxes in the ocean interior: implications for the ballast hypothesis, Global Biogeochem. Cy., 26, GB4011, doi:10.1029/2012GB004398, 2012.
 Young, J. and Ziveri, P.: Calculation of coccolith volume and its use in calibration of carbonate flux estimates, Deep-Sea Res. Pt. II, 47, 1679–1700, 2000.

Zeebe, R. E.: History of seawater carbonate chemistry, atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, and ocean acidifi-

<sup>10</sup> cation, Annu. Rev. Earth Pl. Sc., 40, 141–165, doi:10.1146/annurev-earth-042711-105521, 2012.

	<b>BGD</b> 10, 19701–19730, 2013	
-	<i>Emiliania huxleyi</i> coccolith thinning in the Mediterranean Sea	
	K. J. S. Meier et al.	
J		
	Title Page	
	Abstract	Introduction
2	Conclusions	References
	Tables	Figures
J	14	►I.
	•	•
1	Back	Close
<u>.</u>	Full Screen / Esc	
	Printer-friendly Version	
,	Interactive Discussion	

Discussion Paper

Jiscussion Paper

Discussion Paper

Discussion Paper

































**Fig. 5.** Seasonal signal extracted from the weight and environmental data in Fig. 4 by a single spectrum analysis (SSA). Monthly averages and the deviation from the average for every year (bars) are shown.

















**Fig. 7.** Long-term trends in the environmental data from single spectrum analysis (SSA). Black lines show the evenly spaced dataset produced from the environmental measurements (see methods). Red lines indicate the trends from the SSA.





