

Interactive comment on “Responses of lower trophic-level organisms to typhoon passage on the outer shelf of the East China Sea: an incubation experiment” by N. Yasuki et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 6 May 2013

Yasuki et al. reported natural plankton incubation experiment simulated upwelling/mixing caused by typhoon. It is an interesting and nice experiments to show the possible responses of phytoplankton and microzooplankton to upwelling/mixing caused by typhoon. However, the experiments are very simple and analysis is also not enough to achieve the goals they set. I do not see much new findings from the manuscript.

They tried to simulate upwelling/mixing caused by typhoon. But the justification of the experimental condition is very weak. What is different of upwelling/mixing as well as difference from the upwelling/mixing caused by other reasons.

There are many incubation experiments were conducted to simulate upwelling/mixing

C1539

from 70'. Authors should compared with the previous works and should point out the difference and similarities. For example, they can compared with results of coastal upwelling experiments vs. open ocean experiments. I believe there are few experiments using open ocean waters, even the present study area may or may not be classified to open ocean as they stated because it is fairly close to the shelf break area.

They pointed out the differences of seed population from surface and subsurface. However, there analysis is far from showing the clear evidence which is the seed population. I believe authors can do more quantitative as well as qualitative analysis showing the different populations.

They also pointed out the response of ciliate, but their quantitative influence to phytoplankton community is not well discussed. They also mentioned about copepod response but the point is also not clear to me.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 10, 6605, 2013.

C1540