

# ***Interactive comment on “Three years of increased soil temperature and atmospheric N deposition have no effect on the N status and growth of a mature balsam fir forest” by L. D’Orangeville et al.***

**L. D’Orangeville et al.**

loicdorangeville@gmail.com

Received and published: 15 May 2013

We thank the anonymous referee for his constructive comments. We hope that our response will account for the concerns raised by the referee.

REFeree. I suggest acceptance of the paper, even if the air drying of the samples before extraction may have really affected the quality of the results obtained. I think that this methodological approach has to be clearly justified in the materials and methods section, adding the proper references.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



AUTHORS. The justification for air drying soil samples – including adequate references – will be added to the methods, in response to reviewer 2 earlier comments (See 'reply to anonymous reviewer 2'). Briefly, we can repeat that although we cannot exclude that the inorganic N values obtained from air-dried samples may have been affected by drying, there is no evidence that it may have affected one treatment more than another. Therefore, we believe that our methodological approach is valid for the purpose of comparing inorganic N content between treatments. Moreover, soil nutrient availability was also thoroughly examined with the ion exchange membranes which provided a robust and continuous monitoring of potential changes in nutrient availability.

---

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 10, 1313, 2013.

**BGD**

10, C1887–C1888, 2013

---

Interactive  
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

C1888

