

Interactive comment on “Mean age of carbon in fine roots from temperate forests and grasslands with different management” by E. Solly et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 17 May 2013

This is a really nice manuscript. I have hesitated to submit a review as I have actually not been able to detect any major problems with it, although I have now read it several times. In general the manuscript is pedagogic and well written. The topic is relevant, the study is novel and the authors do not make any claims that were not supported by their data.

As a reader, however, I had some problems with following how land use/land management differed between regions and within grassland and forests. I do not think that this was because the manuscript was poorly written, but because the experimental design was quite complicated. This different land use/land management is also a potential methodological problem, although as far as I understand I think the authors actually handle this quite well.

C1976

The one thing that disturbed me while reading was that the hypotheses were not presented again in the discussion section, but instead just referred to as the first, the second and the third hypothesis. I had to go back in the manuscript to remind myself which the hypotheses were and which number they had. Please remind the readers in the discussion section what the hypotheses were.

Other than that I can only congratulate to a nice piece of work.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 10, 5671, 2013.

C1977