

Interactive comment on “Cross-shore gradients of physical disturbance in mangroves: implications for seedling establishment” by T. Balke et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 21 June 2013

General comments The paper deals with a very important subject in mangrove regeneration, which by and large determines natural forest restocking or artificial restoration. Hydrodynamics plays a very important role in this regard and is a cause for failure of many mangrove restoration projects globally.

Technical comments The paper is also well laid out and well presented. Some specific corrections below. Some comments however persist from my first review which haven't been dealt with or not clearly indicated as having been resolved: - 3.1: I asked about the R2 for correlation between seedling height and erosion of 0.56 which is low and for it to be used as a basis of drawing conclusion of this relationship under investigation, may be misleading. Was any test on significance done on this very low correlation and if yes, what is the p value? Any subsequent conclusions based on this very low are

C2905

thus highly subjective as they are based on a foundation, which is fatally weak.

The paper can be considered for publication once the above comments are resolved.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 10, 5361, 2013.

C2906