

Interactive comment on “Cross-shore gradients of physical disturbance in mangroves: implications for seedling establishment” by T. Balke et al.

T. Balke et al.

thorsten.balke@deltares.nl

Received and published: 21 June 2013

Response to reviewer 2

Thank you very much for your feedback. Please see our detailed comments below:

Reviewer2: General comments The paper deals with a very important subject in mangrove regeneration, which by and large determines natural forest restocking or artificial restoration. Hydrodynamics plays a very important role in this regard and is a cause for failure of many mangrove restoration projects globally.

Response: We are grateful for the comments during the earlier quick review which have helped to improve the manuscript substantially.

C2935

Reviewer2: 3.1: Some comments however persist from my first review which haven't been dealt with or not clearly indicated as having been resolved: I asked about the R2 for correlation between seedling height and erosion of 0.56 which is low and for it to be used as a basis of drawing conclusion of this relationship under investigation, may be misleading. Was any test on significance done on this very low correlation and if yes, what is the p value? Any subsequent conclusions based on this very low are thus highly subjective as they are based on a foundation, which is fatally weak.

Response: The correlation which is demonstrated in this manuscript between seedling biomass (dry weight) and critical erosion depth (Fig.2) with an R2 of 0.56 is statistically significant. We added the results of a linear model in line: 204: '(Linear model, N= 35, $p < 0.000$)'

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 10, 5361, 2013.

C2936