

Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “Erosion control blankets, organic amendments and site variability influenced the initial plant community at a limestone quarry in the Canadian Rocky Mountains” by A. C. Cohen-Fernández and M. A. Naeth

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 25 March 2013

General comments:

This manuscript is a well-written account of a straightforward field experiment in vegetation establishment on a harsh substrate. The methods and experimental design are generally described clearly, and the discussion follows logically from the results presented. I note that this manuscript is being considered for a special theme issue, but am not able to comment on how closely it fits the intended scope and theme(s) of that

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



issue.

Specific comments:

p. 3013, l. 10: capitalize Brunisolic; also, for international readers, make it clear that this is the Canadian soil classification term (citing 1998 classification), and provide an equivalent from the FAO World Reference Base http://www.fao.org/fileadmin/templates/nr/images/resources/pdf_documents/wrb2007_red.pdf and/or the U.S. Soil Taxonomy.

p. 3017, l. 21: it would be more accurate to amend this sentence to read: “ ... being up to twice as high....”

Table 1: What is “Saturation %”? Several chemical properties (soluble chloride ... sodium) are listed but the method isn’t given in the text. Also, for these properties the concentrations are given on a volume base (mg L⁻¹) which is difficult to interpret. Is it necessary to give two sets of almost identical results for inorganic C?

Table 6: Since the other plant density and cover data are presented graphically (Figures 1 & 2), wouldn’t it be more consistent to use a similar style of figure to present these data?

Technical corrections:

p. 3010, l. 9 (and elsewhere): hyphenate “non seeded” wherever it precedes a noun

p. 3011, l. 28: de Souza and Batista 2004 is missing from the reference list

p. 3012, l. 25 – p. 3013, l. 1: Sentence would be clearer as follows: “These sites collectively represented the heterogeneity of conditions found around the world on typical limestone quarries requiring reclamation.”

p. 3015, l. 12: Kelowna is capitalized

p. 3020, l. 1: change “has” to “have”

BGD

10, C490–C492, 2013

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



p. 3020, l. 16 (and p. 3023, l. 15): Is “Cohen and Naeth, 2013” the same as Cohen-Fernandez and Naeth 2013 in the reference list?

p. 3022, l. 24: insert comma after “New”

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 10, 3009, 2013.

BGD

10, C490–C492, 2013

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

C492

