A simple method for vaterite precipitation for isotopic studies: implications for bulk and clumped isotope analysis

4

5 T. Kluge^{1,*} and C. M. John¹

[1]{Department of Earth Science and Engineering and Qatar Carbonate and Carbon Storage
Research Centre, Imperial College London, Prince Consort Road, London, SW7 2BP, UK}

8 [*]{now at: Institut für Umweltphysik, Universität Heidelberg, Im Neuenheimer Feld 229,
9 69120 Heidelberg, Germany}

10 Correspondence to: T. Kluge (tobias.kluge@iup.uni-heidelberg.de)

11

12 Abstract

13 Calcium carbonate (CaCO₃) plays an important role in the natural environment as a major

14 constituent of the skeleton and supporting structure of marine life and has high economic

15 importance as additive in food, chemicals and medical products. Anhydrous CaCO₃ occurs in

16 the three different polymorphs calcite, aragonite and vaterite, whereof calcite is the most

17 abundant and best characterized mineral. In contrast, little is known about the rare polymorph

18 vaterite, in particular with regard to the oxygen isotope fractionation between H_2O and the

19 mineral.

20 Synthetic precipitation of vaterite in the laboratory typically involves rapid processes and

21 isotopic non-equilibrium, which excludes isotope studies focused on characterization of

22 vaterite at equilibrium conditions. Here, we used a new experimental approach that enables

23 vaterite mineral formation from an isotopically equilibrated solution. The solution consists of

24 a ~0.007 mol per litre CaCO₃ solution that is saturated with NaCl at room temperature (up to

25 6.4 mol per litre). Vaterite precipitated as single phase or major phase (\geq 94%) in experiments

26 performed between 23 and 91°C. Only at 80°C vaterite was a minor phase with a relative

abundance of 27%. The high mineral yield per experiment of up to 235 mg relative to the

28 initially dissolved CaCO₃ amount of on average 360 mg enables an investigation of the

1 oxygen isotope fractionation between mineral and water, and the determination of clumped

2 isotope values in vaterite.

3 1 Introduction

4 Vaterite is the least know polymorph of calcium carbonate and was first described by Vater 5 (Vater, 1893). In the 1920 and 1930s the nature and crystallographic structure of vaterite was 6 still questioned and the occurrence of a third polymorph of CaCO₃ was disputed amongst 7 various groups (Johnston et al., 1916; Spangenberg, 1921; Heide, 1924; Rinne, 1924; Gibson et al., 1925). In the following decades work focused mainly on the structure of vaterite (e.g., 8 9 McConnell, 1960; Kamhi, 1963; Meyer, 1969; Mann et al., 1991; Wang and Becker, 2009) 10 which continues to provide surprises until today (Kabalah-Amitai et al., 2013). Vaterite has a major heaxagonal structure (von Olshausen, 1925) and appears in different morphologies such 11 as spherulitic aggregates (Han et al., 2006; Nebel and Epple, 2008; Mori et al., 2009; Hu et 12 al., 2012) or hexagonal plates (e.g., Johnston et al., 1916; Kamhi, 1963; Dupont et al., 1997; 13 14 Xu et al., 2006; Kawano et al., 2009).

15 Vaterite occurrence in nature is more widespread than generally assumed. It was first

16 observed in gastropods (Mayer and Weineck, 1932), but later studies discovered vaterite also

17 related to oil field drilling (Friedman and Schultz, 1994), in Portland cement (Friedman and

18 Schultz, 1994), and as stones in the urinary system (Prien and Frondel, 1947; Sutor and

19 Wooley, 1968). Vaterite has not been found in the geologic record and is therefore suspected

20 to be metastable. The observation of vaterite in biogenic systems (Mayer and Weineck, 1932;

21 Spann et al., 2010; Nehrke et al., 2012; Kabalah-Amitai et al., 2013) gives some constraints

22 on its stability which can be on the order of years (Lowenstamm and Abbott, 1975), but not

23 geological ages.

24 The natural occurrence of vaterite and its potential economic use due to its large specific

surfaces and high porosity (Mori et al., 2009) warrants a precise investigation of this mineral.

26 So far, most laboratory experiments were designed to precipitate relatively large single

27 crystals of vaterite for X-ray analysis that focused on the crystal structure (e.g., Kamhi, 1963).

28 Vaterite precipitation experiments generally used either mixtures of several solutions such as

29 K₂CO₃, Na₂CO₃, and CaCl₂ (Kamhi, 1963; Easton and Claugher, 1986; Han et al., 2006;

30 Nebel and Epple, 2008) or CaNO₃ (Davies et al., 1978), sometimes with added surfactants

31 (Mann et al., 1991; Dupont et al., 1997; Mori et al., 2009) or additional organic substrates

32 (Falini et al., 1996; Xu et al., 2006; Kirboga and Oner, 2013). These experiments provided

crystals with sizes between a few 100 nm and a few µm and were mostly restricted to the
 temperature range of 25°C-60°C.

As vaterite is a relevant mineral in biogenic systems (Lowenstamm and Abbott, 1975; Pouget 3 4 et al., 2009; Spann et al., 2010; Nehrke et al., 2012) it may provide new insights into the 5 isotope fractionation during biological carbonate formation. Vaterite was proposed as a 6 potential precursor phase in biogenic CaCO₃ precipitation, later transforming into aragonite or calcite (e.g., Jacob et al., 2008). Depending on conditions prevailing during the vaterite-7 8 aragonite or vaterite-calcite transformation, the original isotope signature may be inherited in 9 the final, stable CaCO₃ phase. To be able to use isotopic tools (for instance, to reconstruct environmental conditions or paleoclimate) on biogenic carbonate with vaterite precursors or 10 remaining vateritic components requires the knowledge of the fractionation factor between 11 12 vaterite and water, and the clumped isotope Δ_{47} -T relationship of vaterite, respectively. 13 However, so far little is known about the oxygen isotope fractionation between dissolved 14 inorganic carbon and vaterite and, in particular, the clumped isotope Δ_{47} -T relationship of 15 vaterite. Whereas vaterite was reported in a few stable isotope studies aiming at determining the oxygen isotope fractionation factor in the system CaCO₃-H₂O (e.g., Kim and O'Neil, 16 1997), it rarely occurred as a pure phase and, thus, did not allow for a precise study focused 17 on vaterite. Based on the limited data available Tarutani et al. (1969) suggested vaterite to be 18 19 enriched in ¹⁸O by +0.5 ‰ relative to calcite. Kim and O'Neil (1997) obtained a similar value of +0.6 ‰ with respect to calcite. Both studies were limited to either one (25°C) or two 20 21 temperatures (25°C, 40°C), and a more comprehensive study is still lacking. In addition, the 22 clumped isotope Δ_{47} -T relationship of vaterite has not been assessed so far, but could give 23 new insights into the effect of polymorphism on isotope ratios or mineral growth related isotope fractionation. 24

In this study we present a simple method that allows vaterite precipitation over a wide temperature range (at least between 20 and 91°C) and that provides large quantities of the mineral, enabling for example the investigation of the oxygen isotope fractionation factor between vaterite and H₂O, and the Δ_{47} -T relationship of vaterite.

29 2 Experimental setup

The precipitating solution was prepared by dissolving high-purity CaCO₃ (Merck Suprapur,
99.95%) in de-ionized water. Light-microscopy indicates that this CaCO₃ consists of calcite.
The water was initially taken from the local water supply, purified with a reverse osmosis

- 1 technique and finally de-ionized with an UltrapureTM system with an output quality of 18 M Ω
- 2 cm. Trace components of the CaCO₃ used to prepare the solution are strontium (≤ 100 ppm),

3 rubidium (≤ 20 ppm), sulphate (≤ 20 ppm), and phosphate (≤ 10 ppm).

About 370 mg CaCO₃ was dissolved in ~500 ml de-ionized water at room temperature per experiment. The water was acidified by purging of CO₂ tank gas (normal grade, BOC UK) through the solution. The solution was filtered after three hours through a double layer of Whatman® filter paper (grade 1, corresponding to 11 μ m filtration size) to remove undissolved CaCO₃ crystals. Optical inspection of the filtered water via light reflectance confirmed no large crystals to have bypassed the filtration stage. The dissolution step appeared to be quantitative as no CaCO₃ was visibly retained on the filter paper.

11 The filtered $CaCO_3$ solution was then thermally and isotopically equilibrated at a set 12 temperature in a temperature-controlled water bath (sketch of the experimental setup is depicted in Fig. 1). The experimental temperatures ranged from 23 to 91°C. The solution was 13 14 enclosed in a 500 ml Erlenmeyer flask with a rubber stopper. The rubber stopper contained 15 two feed-throughs for tubes that were used to maintain a constant gas flow through the 16 solution. Humidified and thermally equilibrated CO_2 gas (same temperature as the solution) was passed through the CaCO₃ solution (Table 1) at a rate of ~0.03-0.1 ml/s to prevent 17 18 carbonate precipitation before complete isotopic equilibrium was achieved. The CO₂ gas was 19 humidified and adjusted to the experimental temperature by bubbling it slowly through an 20 Erlenmeyer flask filled with de-ionized water and contained in the temperature-controlled 21 water bath. The equilibration period varied between 3 hours at 91°C and 23 hours at 23°C. pH 22 values during equilibration are below pH 6 due to the continuous CO₂ flux.

23 After equilibration NaCl was added, reaching concentrations between 4.2 and 6.4 mol per litre (Table 1). The added NaCl (Sigma Aldrich[®]) has a purity of \geq 99% and contains minor traces 24 of sulphates (≤ 200 ppm), alkaline Earth metals (≤ 100 ppm) and bromides (≤ 100 ppm). 25 Carbonate precipitation was induced by slowly bubbling N₂ tank gas (BOC UK, normal 26 27 grade) through the solution. The N₂ gas was humidified and adjusted to the experiment 28 temperature using the same procedure as for the CO₂ gas. The bubbling rate was set to about 1 29 bubble per second (~0.03 ml/s). The gas stream was humidified to prevent water evaporation and a potential change in the solution δ^{18} O value over time. Minerals always formed on the 30 31 bottom or the side wall of the Erlenmeyer flask. No crystals were observed on the surface of 32 the solution. After 2-19 days the solution was passed through a double-layer of Whatman® filter paper (grade 1 with a pore size of 11µm). Crystals on the glass walls were loosened by a thin PVC plastic tube and flushed out with de-ionized water. The precipitated minerals were air-dried at room temperature before microscopic and XRD analysis.

4 3 Samples

5 3.1 Mineral description, microscopy and SEM

6 Depending on the experiment temperature and duration between 5 and 235 mg CaCO₃ was 7 precipitated (Table 1, 2). Low carbonate recovery < 20 mg is linked to short experiment 8 duration (3-6 days) at lower temperatures (< 70°C, Table 2). In contrast, experiments with a 9 longer duration of 14-24 days at temperatures \leq 50°C yielded on average 135 mg. At 80-91°C 10 it was sufficient to allow two days for mineral precipitation to obtain 80-90 mg calcite. Note 11 that in all experiments the initially dissolved amount of calcite was similar at about 360 (±20) 12 mg in 500 ml de-ionized water (Table 1).

13 Vaterite can be distinguished by its morphology from other CaCO₃ polymorphs. Calcite 14 rhombohedra and aragonite needles can be recognized by light microscopy (e.g., Fig 2C). Vaterite crystals can be similar in size, but are more irregular and show a spherulitic shape 15 (Figs. 3, 4). Inspection of large vaterite crystals under normal and polarized light reveals a 16 complex growth history. Various globular segments of 50-100 µm with an internal spherulitic 17 growth pattern coalesce into one larger crystal (Fig. 4). Vaterite crystals showed a typical size 18 19 of 50 µm (Figs. 2, 3, 4), whereas in a few experiments crystals of up to 500 µm were 20 observed. Experiments at 70°C and 91°C resulted also in vaterite crystals in the 50 µm size 21 range, however, these are composed of many small (~ 10 µm) globular sub-segments. A 22 peculiarity of vaterite crystals precipitated at 23°C is the combination of rounded, spherical shapes with sharp angular forms (Fig. 3A). Together with the larger crystals sizes observed at 23 this temperature it points towards slower mineral growth. All minerals of this study were 24 investigated with XRD in addition to optical microscopy. Note, that optical microscopy alone 25 26 may be ambiguous and should be complemented by additional methods (e.g., XRD).

Scanning-electron microscope (SEM) images were made at the Institute of Earth Sciences at Heidelberg University to investigate the morphology in more detail. The scanning electron microscope LEO 440 was used for imaging. It has a tungsten cathode, was operated at an accelerating voltage of 20 kV and enables a minimal resolution of ca. 5 nm. Samples were sputtered with a thin gold layer for imaging and with carbon for elemental analysis. A

summary with characteristic vaterite aggregates is shown in Fig. 5. The size of individual 1 2 grains that make up the vaterite aggregates was investigated using SEM images (Figs. 5, 6). The grain size decreases with increasing temperature, from about 100 µm at 23°C, 10-20 µm 3 at 50°C, to <10 µm at 91°C. The relatively large grains detected at 23°C are internally 4 5 composed of ~2 µm long elongated fibrous crystallites (Fig. 6A). The smallest grains observed at 91°C are of similar size of a few µm. Sub-µm sized crystallites and framboidal 6 7 aggregates (e.g., Nehrke and Van Cappellen, 2006) were not observed. The minerals show a 8 radial growth pattern from a central nucleus leading to spherical conglomerate particles (Fig. 9 5A). The spherical shape is still dominating at 50°C (Fig. 5B), however, changes to the 10 growth of flat platelets at 91°C (Fig. 5C). The radiating growth pattern at 91°C is restricted to 11 two dimensions with a tree-like branching structure characteristic for diffusion-controlled 12 dentritic crystallization (Fig. 5D).

Additional elemental analyses on carbon-sputtered vaterite grains using the energy-dispersive X-ray spectroscopy (EDS) at the SEM system at Heidelberg University revealed minor traces of sodium and chloride to be occasionally incorporated in the vaterite mineral. Quantitative analysis was not attempted due to the very sporadic and dispersed occurrence of the sodium chloride crystals.

18 3.2 XRD analysis

19 The carbonate samples were analysed at the National History Museum London using an Enraf 20 Nonius FR 590 Powder Diffractometer with Cu-Ka radiation (40 kV, 35mA). In brief, the 21 sample powder was placed as thin layer on a sapphire substrate and measured in a fixed 22 beam-sample-detector geometry. Analysis times were adjusted to the counting statistics and 23 varied between 10 and 90 min. Signals and phase fractions were evaluated by comparing 24 measured spectra with a mineral data base using the program X'Pert Highscore (PANalytical 25 B.V., 2009). Peak positions were calibrated with two standards (silver behenate and quartz). 26 For phase quantification a pure calcite and aragonite standard was measured additionally.

For most samples the dominant XRD peaks were found at 20.98 (± 0.04), 24.86 (± 0.02), 27.03(± 0.03), 32.74(± 0.03), 43.79(± 0.09), and 50.0(± 0.04)° (20, Fig. 7). In contrast, the characteristic and dominant calcite peak of the calcite standard is observed at 29.46°; those of the aragonite calibration standard are at 26.36, 27.35, 33.25, and 46.01° (20, Fig. 8). The aragonite peaks at 26.36 and 27.35° were resolved for the pure aragonite standard, but the

peak at 27.35° overlapped with the vaterite peak at $\sim 27.03^{\circ}$ for an agonite-vaterite mixtures. 1 Our laboratory CaCO₃ samples are clearly different from aragonite and calcite, but coincide 2 3 with the XRD data and d-spacing of vaterite. Kabalah-Amitai et al. (2013) measured vaterite 4 d-spacing of 2.07 and 3.63Å, corresponding to 43.69 and 24.50° (2θ at Cu-Kα radiation). Earlier work of Dupont et al. (1997) determined similar d-spacing values of 4.254, 3.591, 5 3.307, 2.741, 2.07, and 1.826 Å, corresponding to 20.86, 24.77, 26.94, 32.64, 43.69, and 6 7 49.90° (2 θ at Cu-K α radiation). Our own results are close to these values confirming the 8 precipitates to be composed of vaterite. In case of the 37°C experiment additionally calcite is 9 present as minor phase (about 5%, visible in the peak at 29.46°, Fig. 7), whereas only traces of calcite are found in the 91°C experiment. An exact quantification of this small calcite 10 11 fraction was not possible due to a general uncertainty of about 3% in the phase quantification. Half of the mineral phase at 80°C consists of calcite, whereas the other half is made up of 12 equal proportions of aragonite and vaterite (Table 2, Fig. 8). Aragonite is also a minor phase 13 14 at the 91°C experiment (6 %, Fig. 7).

15 **3.3 Isotope analysis**

16 Oxygen, carbon and clumped isotopes were analyzed at the Qatar Stable Isotope Laboratory 17 at Imperial College. Details of the sample preparation and mass spectrometric procedures are 18 given in Kluge et al. (2015). In brief, per analysis ~5 mg sample was dissolved in ortho-19 phosphoric acid at 70°C to produce CO_2 for the mass spectrometric measurement. The CO_2 is 20 cleaned manually comprising of a step for cryogenic water separation and one for contaminant removal via porous polymers (PorapakTM Q). Analyses were done at two dual 21 22 inlet isotope ratio mass spectrometers (Thermo Scientific MAT 253) that measure alternately sample and reference gas. Individual analyses have a precision of 0.2 % for δ^{18} O, 0.1 % for 23 δ^{13} C, and 0.03 % for Δ_{47} , based on replicate analyses of standards. Samples were measured 24 25 repeatedly (typically 3 times) to reduce the uncertainty.

Carbonate δ^{18} O values follow the trend determined by the temperature-dependent isotopic fractionation between water and calcite (Fig. 9). For calculation of the expected carbonate δ^{18} O values we used the fractionation factors of Kim and O'Neil (1997) and a water value of $-6.4\pm0.7 \ (-7.8\pm0.5 \)$ for the later repeat experiments NA-4 and NA-6). The water δ^{18} O value was not directly measured but is based on back-calculation of aragonite and calcite samples that were precipitated in close temporal connection (within 3-12 d) of the vaterite experiments using the same water source and the same precipitation technique (see Kluge et al., 2015). The back-calculated water values from the pure $Ca(HCO_3)_2$ solution used as reference correspond to the observed range of surface and ground water values of the London Metropolitan area (Darling, 2003). For all experiments, the water was taken from the local water supply. Although we have a defined water reference value based on the pure $Ca(HCO_3)_2$ solution, we cannot exclude short-term fluctuations of the tap water $\delta^{18}O$. However, it is unlikely that it exceeds the observed long-term variability of ± 0.7 ‰ (June-October 2012) and ± 0.5 ‰ (March-April 2013) for the back-calculated solution $\delta^{18}O$ value.

 δ^{13} C values vary between -18 and -26 ‰ and reflect the negative signature of the CO₂ tank gas used during the equilibration phase (Table 2). δ^{13} C values do not show a temperature dependence. Clumped isotope Δ_{47} values of vaterite samples decrease with increasing temperature and are similar to calcite or aragonite-calcite mixtures precipitated at the same temperature (Fig. 10). Δ_{47} values of calcite and calcite-aragonite mixtures were taken from Kluge et al. (2015) for comparison.

14 **4 Discussion**

15 Vaterite was obtained over the entire experimental temperature range of 23-91°C. It is

- 16 detected either as the only phase (23, 50, 70°C) or as the major phase (\geq 94 %) with minor
- 17 contributions from calcite or aragonite (37, 91°C). An exception is the experiment at 80°C

18 where all anhydrous CaCO₃ polymorphs were precipitated simultaneously. On average 80 mg

- 19 vaterite was formed per experiment. This amount may be increased by longer experiment runs
- 20 or by up-scaling of the setup using larger beakers with the same solution concentrations. A
- 21 longer experiment duration appears to be the most effective approach. Considering the

22 experiments from 23-70°C only, the yield increases exponentially with the duration, reaching

- 23 a recovery rate (relative to the initially dissolved $CaCO_3$) of 70% after ~570 h (Fig. 11).
- 24 Extrapolating the trend, about 700 h should be sufficient to recover the entire amount of
- 25 initially dissolved CaCO₃. Another option of increasing the CaCO₃ super-saturation in the
- 26 initial solution was not tested, but has to be treated carefully. A higher initial chemical
- 27 potential may produce a higher yield but also lead to the precipitation of other forms of
- 28 CaCO₃ such as ikaite (calcium carbonate hexahydrate, CaCO₃(H₂0)₆) or amorphous calcium
- 29 carbonate (Kawano et al., 2009).
- 30 This study shows that vaterite precipitation is not limited to a certain temperature range, e.g.,
- 31 to room temperature or from 10 to 48°C (Gussone et al., 2011), but can be performed at least
- 32 up to 91°C. A pressurized reaction vessel that prevents boiling of the solution could be used

- 1 to extend vaterite mineral formation to much higher temperatures (e.g., Kluge et al., 2015). A
- 2 thermally and isotopically equilibrated CaCO₃ super-saturated solution could be injected into
- 3 the thermally equilibrated and saturated NaCl solution of a pressurized reaction vessel.
- 4 The detection of vaterite minerals over the large temperature interval of this study and its
- 5 predominating character is surprising, given that many other studies emphasized the low
- 6 stability of vaterite (e.g., McConnel, 1959). McConnel (1959) states that vaterite dissolves at
- 7 room temperature at contact with water. However, our precipitates were air-dried at room
- 8 temperature on Whatman[®] filter paper and stayed wet for a few hours, but did not transform
- 9 into calcite. Furthermore, vaterite minerals were stored for many weeks up to a year before
- 10 being analyzed by XRD and SEM. Despite long storage periods vaterite did not transform
- 11 into other CaCO₃ polymorphs and implies that vaterite can be precipitated and stored for
- 12 periods that are long enough to enable precise and detailed experimental analyses.
- 13 Independent evidence for the stability of vaterite over years comes from biogenic samples
- 14 such as bivalves, mollusks and other marine organism (Lowenstamm and Abbott, 1975;
- 15 Spann et al., 2010; Nehrke et al., 2012).

16 Isotopic analysis of vaterite

17 Our study presents a well-defined method for the isotopic study of vaterite. The technique for vaterite precipitation was modified from the procedures of McCrea (1950), O'Neil et al. 18 19 (1969) and Kim and O'Neil (1997) that were developed for isotopic studies on calcite and aragonite minerals. The values of Kim and O'Neil (1997) are commonly used as reference for 20 21 the oxygen isotope fractionation between calcite and water. Furthermore, for the temperature calibration of clumped isotopes an analogous method was applied to precipitate calcite 22 23 (Ghosh et al., 2006; Zaarur et al., 2013). The closeness of the methodology for synthetic vaterite and calcite precipitation ensures good comparability of the obtained results with 24 25 widely used calibration and fractionation data.

The long equilibration procedure used in our experimental approach (Table 1) enables isotopic equilibration between the dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC) and water and among the DIC species. 99% equilibrium between oxygen isotopes in water and DIC takes about 9 h at 25°C and a pH of ~8, whereas it is less than 2h at temperatures above 40°C (Beck et al., 2005). For comparison, the equilibration duration was 23 h at 23°C, 14-21 h at 37.5°C, and 3-17 h above 40°C (Table 1). This provides the necessary basis for a meaningful isotopic analysis of the precipitated vaterite which has not been attempted in a systematic manner so
 far.

3 Beyond the isotopic equilibration of the DIC with water, the precipitation rate and the ionic 4 concentration of the solutions can affect isotope values. The growth rate has to be considered in the interpretation of isotope values as differences can be substantial between slow and 5 rapidly grown minerals (up to 2 % for δ^{18} O; Coplen, 2007; Dietzel et al., 2009; Gabitov et al., 6 2012). The growth rate in our study was not precisely monitored, but can be estimated from 7 8 the derivative of the general relationship between experiment duration and mineral yield (Fig. 9 11). The mineral growth for temperatures below 80°C started very slowly with a value of ~ $1.4 \cdot 10^{-10}$ mol/s and increased exponentially (e.g., to $1.1 \cdot 10^{-9}$ mol/s after 350 h). Converting it 10 relative to the growth surface (using the walls of the Erlenmeyer flask as first order estimate) 11 the growth rate was about $3.7 \cdot 10^{-9}$ mol/(m²s) at the beginning of the mineral formation and 12 increased to $2.9 \cdot 10^{-8}$ mol/(m²s) at 350 h. These values only give an impression of the order of 13 14 magnitude due to the limitation of the assumptions, but already demonstrate that the mineral 15 formation was unlikely affected by rapid growth disequilibrium that is typically encountered at values above 10⁻⁷-10⁻⁸ mol/(m²s) (compare e.g., Watkins et al., 2013). In contrast, in other 16 vaterite precipitation techniques two solutions were mixed leading to almost instantaneous 17 precipitation (e.g., Nebel and Epple, 2008). As rapid mineral growth may induce 18 19 disequilibrium fractionation related to a mineral surface effect (Watson, 2004; Dietzel et al., 2009; Watson and Müller, 2009; DePaolo, 2011; Reynard et al., 2011; Gabitov et al., 2012; 20 21 Gabitov, 2013) experiments with quasi-instantaneous mineral growth are not suitable for 22 isotope studies. Consequently, we did not rapidly grow vaterite nor conduct isotope 23 measurements on potentially fast growth phases.

Traditionally, vaterite was synthesized from mixtures of CaCl₂, K₂CO₃ (Kamhi, 1963) and 24 25 admixtures of calgon (McConnell, 1960) or included other surfactants (Mori et al., 2009). In 26 other experiments a CaCO₃ super-saturated solution was treated with surfactants (Dupont et al., 1997) or polymeric substances (Kirboga and Oner, 2013). In few experiment Na₂CO₃ 27 replaced K₂CO₃ as solution containing the carbonate ion (Nebel and Epple, 2008). The use of 28 CaCl₂ and especially K₂CO₃ could impact on the isotopic values of the forming minerals via 29 preferential fractionation related to the hydration sphere of the Ca^{2+} and K^{+} ions (Taube, 30 1954; Sofer and Gat, 1972; O'Neil and Truesdell, 1991) and, thus, should either be restricted 31

to low concentrations or avoided. Our method uses only NaCl as additive that has been
confirmed not to affect the isotope values of the DIC (e.g., O'Neil and Truesdell, 1991).

Before discussing the measured vaterite δ^{18} O values and its implication for the oxygen isotope 3 fractionation factor $\alpha_{CaCO3-H2O}$ we note that we did not analyze the oxygen isotope 4 5 composition of the solution per se. However, as the solution water is ultimately taken from the local water supply that reflects the London Metropolitan ground- and surface water $\delta^{18}O$ 6 7 of -6 to -8 ‰ (Darling, 2003) and which is cross-examined by values from independent NaClfree experiments carried out in parallel, we have a defined reference water δ^{18} O value (-8 9 6.4 ± 0.7 ‰, -7.8 ± 0.5 ‰ for the later repeat experiments NA-4 and NA-6, see section 3.3). Thus, our results give a first order guideline with respect to the temperature dependence of 10 11 $\alpha_{CaCO3-H2O}$ and can provide an upper limit for the deviation of the fractionation factor of 12 vaterite compared to aragonite and calcite. We compare our values to data of Kim and O'Neil 13 (1997) due to similar experimental procedures and their universal use. Note that the exact 14 value of the equilibrium oxygen isotope fractionation factor for calcite is under debate (Coplen, 2007; Dietzel et al., 2009; Gabitov et al., 2012; Kluge et al., 2014). 15

16 The fractionation 1000lna(CaCO3-H2O) of vaterite closely follows the values of Kim and O'Neil 17 (1997) for calcite (Fig. 9). Over the entire experimental temperature range vaterite values 18 agree within uncertainty with the calcite values. Repeat experiments at 37 and 50°C confirm 19 the initial results by providing almost identical fractionation factors. The average deviation is 20 0.0 ± 0.4 ‰ and, thus, the vaterite oxygen isotope fractionation factor $\alpha_{CaCO3-H2O}$ cannot be 21 distinguished from that of calcite, Tarutani et al. (1969) observed vaterite to be enriched in 22 ¹⁸O by 0.5 ‰ relative to calcite at 25°C. Kim and O'Neil (1997) detected a similar difference of 0.6 ‰ at 25 and 40°C. Our experiments are consistent with both studies indicating a small 23 24 or negligible difference of the fractionation $\alpha_{CaCO3-H2O}$ between vaterite and calcite. Our study 25 additionally constrains this value over the larger temperature range from 23-91°C.

26 Carbonate clumped isotope Δ_{47} values are only determined by the mineral formation 27 temperature at equilibrium conditions and are independent of the solution δ^{18} O and δ^{13} C 28 values (for reviews see e.g., Eiler, 2007, 2011). We use the Δ_{47} -T calibration of Kluge et al. 29 (2015) as reference relationship as it was determined in the same laboratory using the same 30 preparation and measurement techniques (T in K, Δ_{47} in ‰):

31
$$\Delta_{47} (T) = 0.98 \cdot (-3.407 \cdot 10^9 / T^4 + 2.365 \cdot 10^7 / T^3 - 2.607 \cdot 10^3 / T^2 - 5.880 / T) + 0.293$$
(1)

Equation (1) is given in the absolute reference frame of Dennis et al. (2011). Vaterite Δ_{47} values scatter around the Δ_{47} -T line of Eq. (1) with an average difference of -0.003 ± 0.013 ‰ and, thus, are indistinguishable from the calibration line (Fig. 10). Subtle differences in the mineral structure of the CaCO₃ polymorph vaterite appear to be irrelevant for the ¹³C-¹⁸O clumping.

6 **5 Conclusions**

7 Vaterite was successfully synthesized from a NaCl-saturated CaCO₃ solution. Vaterite formed

8 between 23 and 91°C and was generally the single or major phase. The precipitation

9 technique allows thermal and isotopic equilibration of the oxygen and clumped isotopes in the

- 10 solution. The precipitation technique fosters slow mineral formation which enables a
- 11 meaningful isotopic analysis of the precipitated vaterite. Recovered vaterite amounts of up to

12 235 mg also permit the precise determination of the clumped isotope value at each experiment

- 13 temperature which requires a relatively large sample aliquot of 5 mg per replicate
- 14 measurement.

15 The oxygen isotope fractionation between water and the vaterite mineral agrees within 16 uncertainty with calcite (average difference 0.0 ± 0.4 ‰). Clumped isotope Δ_{47} values are 17 indistinguishable from calibration data (difference of -0.003 ± 0.013 ‰). The presented 18 precipitation technique for vaterite, in particular the possibility for thermal and isotopic 19 equilibration, opens research opportunities also for investigation of isotope ratios on this 20 unexplored CaCO₃ polymorph.

21 Appendix A

22 δ^{18} O, δ^{13} C and Δ_{47} values of samples and calibration standards are provided in the 23 supplementary data file.

24 Acknowledgements

We gratefully acknowledge funding from the Qatar Carbonates and Carbon Storage Research Centre (QCCSRC), provided jointly by Qatar Petroleum, Shell, and Qatar Science & Technology Park. We thank Simon Davis for technical support and the Carbonate Research group at Imperial for fruitful discussions. We thank Jens Najorka for technical assistance during XRD measurements at the National History Museum London and for discussion of the results, and Alexander Varychev and Hans-Peter Meyer for SEM imaging. We are grateful for review comments by R. Gabitov and G. Nehrke that helped to improve the manuscript.

1 References

- 2 Coplen, T.B.: Calibration of the calcite-water oxygen-isotope geothermometer at Devils Hole,
- 3 Nevada, a natural laboratory, Geochim. Cosmochim. Ac., 71, 3948-3957, 2007.
- 4 Darling, W.G.: Hydrological factors in the interpretation of stable isotopic proxy data present
- 5 and past: a European perspective, Quat. Sci. Rev., 23, 743-770, 2003.
- Davies, P., Dollimore, D., and Heal, G.R.: Polymorph transition kinetics by DTA, J. Therm.
 Anal., 13, 473-487, 1978.
- 8 Dennis, K.J., Affek, H.P., Passey, B.H., Schrag, D.P., and Eiler, J.W.: Defining an absolute
- 9 reference frame for 'clumped' isotope studies of CO₂, Geochim. Cosmochim. Ac., 75, 7117-
- 10 7131, 2011.
- 11 DePaolo, D.J.: Surface kinetic model for isotopic and trace element fractionation during
- 12 precipitation of calcite from aqueous solutions, Geochim. Cosmochim. Ac., 75, 1039-1056,
- 13 2011.
- 14 Dietzel, M., Tang, J., Leis, A., and Köhler, S.J.: Oxygen isotopic fractionation during
- 15 inorganic calcite precipitation Effects of temperature, precipitation rate and pH, Chem.
- 16 Geol., 268, 107-115, 2009.
- 17 Dupont, L., Portemer, F., and Figlarz, M.: Synthesis and study of well crystallized CaCO₃
- 18 vaterite showing a new habitus, J. Mater. Chem., 7, 797-800, 1997.
- Easton, A. J. and Claugher, D.: Variations in a growth form of synthetic vaterite, Mineral.
 Mag., 50, 332-336, 1986.
- 21 Eiler, J.M.: "Clumped-isotope" geochemistry-The study of naturally-occurring, multiply-
- substituted isotopologues, Earth Planet. Sci. Lett., 262, 309-327, 2007.
- 23 Eiler, J.M.: Paleoclimate reconstruction using carbonate clumped isotope thermometry, Quat.
- 24 Sci. Rev., 30, 3575-3588, 2011.
- 25 Falini, G., Albeck, S., Weiner, S., and Addadi, L.: Control of aragonite or calcite
- 26 polymorphism by mollusk shell macromolecules, Science, 271, 67-69, 1996
- 27 Friedman, G.M. and Schultz, D.J.: Precipitation of vaterite (CaCO₃) during oil field drilling.
- 28 Mineral. Mag., 58, 401-408, 1994.

- 1 Gabitov, R.I., Watson, E.B., and Sadekov, A.: Oxygen isotope fractionation between calcite
- 2 and fluid as a function of growth rate and temperature: An in-situ study, Chem. Geol., 306-
- 3 307, 92-102, 2012.
- 4 Gabitov, R.I.: Growth-rate induced disequilibrium of oxygen isotopes in aragonite: An in situ
- 5 study, Chem. Geol., 351, 268-275, 2013.
- 6 Ghosh, P., Adkins, J., Affek, H.P., Balta, B., Guo, W., Schauble, E.A., Schrag, D., and Eiler,
- J. M.: ¹³C-¹⁸O bonds in carbonate minerals: A new kind of paleothermometer, Geochim.
 Cosmochim. Ac. 70, 1439–1456, 2006.
- 9 Gibson, R.E., Wyckoff, R.W.G., and Merwin, H.E.: Vaterite and μ-calcium carbonate, Am. J.
 10 Sci., 10, 325-33, 1925.
- 11 Gussone, N., Nehrke, G., and Teichert, B.M.A.: Calcium isotope fractionation in ikaite and
- 12 vaterite, Chem. Geol., 285, 194-202, 2011.
- 13 Han, Y., Hadiko, G., Fuji, M., and Takahashi, M.: Influence of initial CaCl₂ concentration on
- 14 the phase and morphology of $CaCO_3$ prepared by carbonation, J. Mater. Sci., 41, 4663–4667,
- 15 2006.
- Heide, F.: Über den Vaterit. Centralblatt für Mineralogie, Geologie und Paläontologie, 21,
 641-651, 1924.
- 18 Hu, Q., Zhang, J., Teng, H., and Becker, U.: Growth process and crystallographic properties
- 19 of ammonia-induced vaterite, Am. Mineral., 97, 1437-1445, 2012.
- 20 Jacob, D.E., Soldati, A. L-. Wirth, R., Huth, J., Wehrmeister, U., and Hofmeister, W.:
- Nanostructure, composition and mechanims of bivalve shell growth, Geochim. Cosmochim.
 Ac., 72, 5401-5415, 2008.
- 23 Johnston, J.; Merwin, H.E. and Williamson, E.D.: The several forms of calcium carbonate,
- 24 Am. J. Sci., 41, 473-512, 1916.
- 25 Kabalah-Amitai, L., Mayzel, B., Kauffmann, Y., Fitch, A. N., Bloch, L., Gilbert, P.U.P.A.,
- and Pokroy, B.: Vaterite crystals contain two interspersed crystal structures, Science, 340,
- 27 454-457, 2013.
- 28 Kamhi, S.R.: On the structure of Vaterite, CaCO₃, Acta Cryst., 16, 770-772, 1963

- 1 Kawano, J., Shimobayashi, N., Miyake, A., and Kitamura, M.: Precipitation diagram of
- 2 calcium carbonate polymorphs: its construction and significance, J. Phys., Condens. Matter,
- 3 21, 425102, 2009
- 4 Kim, S.T. and O'Neil, J.R.: Equilibrium and nonequilibrium oxygen isotope effects in
- 5 synthetic carbonates, Geochim. Cosmochim. Ac., 61, 3461–3475, 1997.
- 6 Kirboga, S. and Oner, M.: Effect of the experimental parameters on calcium carbonate
- 7 precipitation, Chemical Engineering Transactions, 32, 2119-2124, 2013.
- 8 Kluge, T., John, C.M., Jourdan, A.-L., Davis, S., and Crawshaw, J.: Laboratory calibration of
- 9 the calcium carbonate clumped isotope thermometer in the 25-250°C temperature range,
- 10 Geochim. Cosmochim. Ac., in press.
- 11 Kluge, T., Affek, H.P., Dublyansky, Y., and Spötl, C.: Devils Hole paleotemperatures and
- 12 implications for oxygen isotope equilibrium fractionation, Earth Planet. Sci. Lett., 400, 251-
- 13 260, 2014.
- 14 Lowenstamm, H.A. and Abbott, D.P.: Vaterite: A mineralization product of the hard tissues
- 15 of a marine organism (Ascidiacea), Science, 188, 363-365, 1975.
- 16 Mann, S. Heywood, B.R., Rajam, S., and Walker, J. B.A.: Structural and stereochemical
- 17 relationships between Langmuir monolayers and calcium carbonate nucleation, J. Phys. D.:
- 18 Appl. Phys., 24, 154-164, 1991.
- 19 Mayer, F.K. and Weineck, E.: Die Verbreitung des Kalziumkarbonates im Tierreich unter
- 20 besonderer Berücksichtigung der Wirbellosen, Jenaische Zeitschrift für Naturwissenschaft,
- 21 66, 199-222, 1932.
- McConnell, J.D.C.: Vaterite from Ballycraigy, Larne, Northern Ireland, Mineral. Mag., 32,
 535-544, 1960.
- 24 McCrea, J.M.: On the isotopic chemistry of carbonates and a paleotemperature scale, J.
- 25 Chem. Phys., 18, 849-857, 1950.
- Meyer, H.J.: Struktur und Fehlordnung des Vaterits, Zeitschrift für Kristallographie, 128,
 183-212, 1969.
- 28 Mori, Y., Enomae, T., and Isogai, A.: Preparation of pure vaterite by simple mechanical
- 29 mixing of two aqueous salt solutions, Materials Science and Engineering C, 29, 1409-1414,
- 30 2009.

- 1 Nebel, H. and Epple, M.: Continuous preparation of calcite, aragonite and vaterite, and of
- 2 magnesium-substituted amorphous calcium carbonate (Mg-Acc), Z. Anorg. Allg. Chem., 634,
- 3 1439-1443, 2008.
- 4 Nehrke, G. and Van Cappellen, P.: Framboidal vaterite aggregates and their transformation
- 5 into calcite: A morphological study, J. Crystal Growth, 287, 528-530, 2006.
- 6 Nehrke, G., Poigner, H., Wilhelms-Dick, D., Brey, T., and Abele, D.: Coexistence of three
- 7 calcium carbonate polymorphs in the shell of the Antartic clam Laternula elliptica, Geochem.
- 8 Geophy. Geos., 13, Q05014, doi:10.1029/2011GC003996, 2012.
- 9 O'Neil, J.R., Clayton, R.N., and Mayeda, T.K.: Oxygen isotope fractionation in divalent
- 10 metal carbonates, J. Chem. Phys., 51, 5547-5558, 1969.
- 11 O'Neil, J.R. and Truesdell, A H.: Oxygen isotope fractionation studies of solute-water
- 12 interaction, in: Stable isotope geochemistry: a tribute to Samuel Epstein (Eds. H.P. Taylor,
- 13 J.R. O'Neil, and I.R. Kaplan). The Geochemical Society, Special Publication No.3, San
- 14 Antonio, USA, 1991.
- 15 Pouget, E. M., Bomans, P. H., Goos, J. A. C. M., Frederik, P. M., With, G., and Sommerdijk,
- 16 N.A.J.M.: The initial stages of template-controlled CaCO₃ formation revealed by Cryo-TEM,
- 17 Science, 323, 1455-1458, 2009.
- Prien, E.L. and Frondel, C.: Studies of urolithiasis: I. The composition of urinary calculi, J.
 Urol., 57, 949-991, 1947.
- 20 Reynard, L.M., Day, C.C., and Henderson, G.M.: Large fractionation of calcium isotopes
- during cave-analogue calcium carbonate growth, Geochim. Cosmochim. Ac. 75, 3726-3740,
 2011.
- 23 Rinne, F.: Röntgenographische Untersuchungen an einigen feinzerteilten Mineralien,
- 24 Kunstprodukten und dichten Gesteinen, Zeitschrift für Kristallographie, 60, 55-69. 1924.
- 25 Sofer, Z. and Gat, J.R.: Activities and concentrations of oxygen-18 in concentrated aqueous
- salt solutions: analytical and geophysical implications, Earth Planet. Sci. Lett., 15, 232-238,
- 27 1972.
- 28 Spann, N., Harper, E.M., and Aldridge, D.C.: The unusual mineral vaterite in shells of the
- 29 freshwater bivalve Corbicula fluminea from the UK, Naturwissenschaften, 97, 743-751, 2010.

- Spangenberg, K.: Die verschiedenen Modifikationen des Calciumcarbonates, 56, 432-434,
 1921.
- 3 Sutor, D.J. and Wooley, S.E.: Gallstone of unusual composition: calcite, aragonite and
- 4 vaterite, Science, 159, 1113-1114, 1968.
- 5 Tarutani, T., Clayton, R. N., and Mayeda, T.K.: The effect of polymorphism and magnesium
- 6 substitution on oxygen isotope fractionation between calcium carbonate and water, Geochim.
- 7 Cosmochim. Ac., 33, 987-996, 1969.
- 8 Taube, H: Use of oxygen isotope effects in the study of hydration of ions, J. Chem. Phys., 58,
 9 523-528, 1954.
- 10 Vater, H.: Ueber den Einfluss der Lösungsgenossen auf die Krystallisation des
- 11 Calciumcarbonates, Zeitschrift für Kristallographie und Mineralogie, 21, 433-490, 1893.

12 von Olshausen, S.: Strukturuntersuchungen nach der Debye-Scherrer Methode, Zeitschrift für

- 13 Kristallographie, 61, 463-514, 1924.
- 14 Wang, J. and Becker, U.: Structure and carbonate orientation of vaterite (CaCO₃), Am.
- 15 Mineral., 94, 380-386, 2009.
- 16 Watkins, J.M., Nielsen, L.C., Ryerson, F.J., and DePaolo, D.J.: The influence of kinetics on
- the oxygen isotope composition of calcium carbonate, Earth Planet. Sci. Lett., 375, 349-360,2013.
- 19 Watson, E.B.: A conceptual model for near-surface kinetic controls on the trace-element and
- 20 stable isotope composition of abiogenic calcite crystals, Geochim. Cosmochim. Ac., 58,
- 21 1473-1488, 2004.
- 22 Watson, E.B. and Müller, T.: Non-equilbrium isotopic and elemental fractionation during
- 23 diffusion-controlled crystal growth under static and dynamic conditions, Chem. Geol., 267,
- 24 111-124, 2009.
- 25 Xu, A.-W. Antonietti, M., Cölfen, H., and Fang, Y.-P.: Uniform hexagonal plates of vaterite
- 26 CaCO₃ mesocrystals formed by biomimetic mineralization, Adv. Funct. Matter, 16, 903-908,
- 27 2006.
- 28 Zaarur, S., Affek, H.P., and Brandon, M.: A revised calibration of the clumped isotope
- thermometer, Earth Planet. Sci. Lett., 382, 47-57, 2013.
- 30

| Experiment | Т | CaCO _{3,dissolved} | NaCl added | equilibration | precipitation |
|-------------------|----------|-----------------------------|------------|---------------|---------------|
| No. | (°C) | (g/l) | (g/l) | (h) | (h) |
| | | | | | |
| NA-1 | 23.5±0.5 | 0.68 | 250 | 23 | 451 |
| NA-3 ^a | 37.5±0.5 | 0.70 | 260 | 21 | 72 |
| NA-4 | 37.5±0.5 | 0.74 | 244 | 14 | 341 |
| NA-5 | 49.6±0.5 | 0.70 | 375 | 16 | 143 |
| NA-6 | 49.6±0.5 | 0.80 | 262 | 17 | 573 |
| NA-7 | 69.9±0.5 | 0.70 | 325 | 3 | 69 |
| NA-8 | 79.9±0.5 | 0.78 | 280 | 3 | 47 |
| NA-9 | 91.0±0.5 | 0.70 | 260 | 3 | 42 |
| | | | | | |

1 Table 1. Experimental conditions during laboratory precipitation of CaCO₃ (see section 2).

2 ^aNA-2 differed in the experimental conditions and is therefore omitted

- 1 Table 2. Mineralogical and isotopic results of the vaterite precipitation experiments. The
- 2 mineralogy was determined by XRD analysis (section 3.2.). n gives the number of replicates
- 3 measured for isotopic analysis. The Λ_{47} value is given in the absolute reference frame of

| 5 | measureu | 101 | isotopic | anarysis. | THE | $\Delta 47$ | value | 15 | given | 111 | une | absolute | reference | manne | U |
|---|----------|-----|----------|-----------|-----|-------------|-------|----|-------|-----|-----|----------|-----------|-------|---|
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

| Experiment | Т | CaCO _{3 precipitated} | $\delta^{18}O$ | $\delta^{13}C$ | Δ_{47} | n | Mineralogy |
|-------------------|----------|--------------------------------|------------------|-------------------|-------------------|-----|--|
| No. | (°C) | (mg) | (‰) | (‰) | (‰) | (-) | |
| | | | | | | | |
| NA-1 | 23.5±0.5 | 120 | -8.57 ± 0.16 | -18.21±0.06 | 0.689 ± 0.003 | 3 | vaterite |
| NA-3 ^a | 37.5±0.5 | 5 | -11.29 ± 0.20 | -20.39 ± 0.10 | 0.639 ± 0.020 | 1 | vaterite (95%), calcite (5%) |
| NA-4 | 37.5±0.5 | 50 | -13.30±0.37 | -26.06 ± 0.18 | 0.672 ± 0.027 | 3 | vaterite (>95%), rest: calcite |
| NA-5 | 49.6±0.5 | 15 | -13.85±0.26 | -21.39 ± 0.03 | 0.605 ± 0.005 | 2 | vaterite |
| NA-6 | 49.6±0.5 | 235 | -15.06 ± 0.22 | -25.26 ± 0.17 | 0.634 ± 0.008 | 3 | vaterite |
| NA-7 | 69.9±0.5 | 15 | -16.92±0.15 | -21.71±0.03 | 0.577 ± 0.010 | 3 | vaterite |
| NA-8 | 79.9±0.5 | 80 | -17.54±0.03 | -25.86 ± 0.10 | 0.553 ± 0.018 | 3 | calcite (49%), aragonite (24%), vaterite (27%) |
| NA-9 | 91.0±0.5 | 90 | -19.21±0.15 | -25.00±0.16 | 0.545 ± 0.005 | 5 | vaterite (94%), aragonite (6%), calcite (traces) |
| | | | | | | | |

4 Dennis et al. (2011) and is corrected for the acid digestion reaction.

5 ^aNA-2 differed in the experimental conditions and is therefore omitted



1 2 Figure 1. Sketch (A) and photograph (B) of the experimental setup used to precipitate vaterite. 3 In the first step CaCO₃ is dissolved in deionized (DI) water (outside the water bath), which is 4 filtered after >3h to remove any un-dissolved component. The solution is then transferred to a 5 temperature-controlled water bath for thermal and isotopic equilibration (flask 2 in A). NaCl 6 is added after the equilibration step. Mineral formation is induced by slow bubbling of N₂ 7 trough the solution. The gas stream through the solution in flask 2 is humidified by passing it 8 beforehand through de-ionized (flask another flask filled with water 1).



- 1
- 2 Figure 2. Photomicrographs of CaCO₃ minerals precipitated in the laboratory experiment.
- Scale bar is 100 μm in A-C and 200 μm in D. Vaterite crystals formed at 50°C in experiment
 NA-6 (A), at 70°C (B) and at 91°C (D). At 80°C a mixture of aragonite, calcite and vaterite
- 5 was precipitated (**C**).



- 1
- 2 Figure 3. Photomicrographs of CaCO₃ minerals precipitated in the laboratory experiments.
- 3 Scale bar is 100 μm. Vaterite crystals formed at 23°C (**A**), at 37°C in experiment NA-3 (**B**)
- 4 and NA-4 (**C**) and 50°C (**D**, NA-5).





2 Figure 4. Close-up photomicrographs of vaterite minerals. Scale bar is 50 µm in A and C and

3 200 µm in **B**. B shows a vaterite crystal using polarized light.



Figure 5. SEM images of vaterite aggregates in the order of increasing precipitation
temperatures. Scale bars are 100 µm in A and B, 200 µm in C and 10 µm in D. Samples NA-1
(A), NA-4 (B), and NA-9 (C and D) were used for imaging.



1

2 Figure 6. High-resolution SEM images of vaterite aggregates showing the internal structure in

3 the order of increasing precipitation temperatures (A: 23°C, B: 50°C, C, D: 91°C). Two

- 4 different growth structures are observed at 91 °C: aggregation of µm-sized flat crystallites (C)
- 5 and tree-like branching growth resulting in flat platelets (D).





Figure 7. X-ray diffraction pattern of crystals from the laboratory experiments. The minerals
that grew at 23°C show a pure vaterite signal. Similarly, minerals formed at 50 and 70°C yield
an almost pure vaterite signal with a non-quantifiable fraction of calcite (traces, ≤ few %).
The samples at 37 and 91°C contain a minor fraction of calcite and aragonite (≤ 6% in total).





Figure 8. X-ray diffraction pattern of crystals from laboratory experiments. The experiment at 80°C produced a mixture of calcite, aragonite and vaterite (lower panel). For comparison, the XRD pattern of pure calcite is shown (upper panel). This example shows calcite that precipitated at 25°C from a pure CaCO₃ supersaturated solution without NaCl addition. The peaks in the lower panel are labeled according to the related mineral structure (A: aragonite, C: calcite, V: vaterite).



Figure 9. Oxygen isotope fractionation factor $1000\ln\alpha(CaCO_3-H_2O)$ of vaterite (circles) relative to expected values for calcite (Kim and O'Neil, 1997; solid line). The sample at 80°C consists of a mixture of calcite, aragonite and vaterite. At 37 and 50°C repeat experiments were performed yielding fractionation factors in agreement with the previous experiment at the same temperature.



Figure 10. Measured Δ_{47} values of vaterite (circles) relative to expected values following the calibration line of Kluge et al. (2015). The sample at 80°C (marked by an asterisk) consists of a mixture of calcite, aragonite and vaterite. The calibration line of Kluge et al. (2015) was mainly determined on calcite.



Figure 11. CaCO₃ formed per experiment vs. duration. The initially dissolved CaCO₃ amount
was identical in all experiments (about 370 mg). The yield of experiments conducted below
80°C follows an exponential relationship with duration.