

Interactive comment on “Contrasting patterns of litterfall seasonality and seasonal changes in litter decomposability in a tropical rainforest region” by S. A. Parsons et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 27 June 2014

General Comments

This paper examined the seasonality of litterfall and leaf decomposability in a variety of plots in the Australia wet tropical region. A major finding of this paper was that greater levels of deciduousness led to more consistent monthly litterfall. The authors argue that this is because the larger number of deciduous species brings a greater mix of litterfall characteristics relative to evergreen forests, whereas the litterfall characteristics for the evergreen trees were more consistent across species. This is an interesting finding and an important contribution to the literature, especially because this may be relevant to forests in other regions. Overall, the paper was well written. A few specific concerns are listed below.

C2863

Specific Comments

Abstract Line 10 – the full model with statistics and P values doesn't seem to fit in an abstract

Intro Line 28 – “including understanding of the seasonality of litter inputs in forested ecosystems is a limiting factor” . . . this line doesn't seem grammatically correct

Methods Line 10-12- “total litterfall” included leaves, and leaf litterfall, is then mentioned separately following the parentheses

Line 15- change “most falls” to most rain

General comment for methods- Need a better description of the statistical tests used, particularly the repeated measures ANOVA, and whether the assumptions for those tests were met

Results Line 10- “an should be “and”

Last paragraph of results- Lines 1-4- This section refers to Table 4, which is presented as a repeated-measures ANOVA. It is not clear what the repeated measures were in this case. This way this model was run needs to be clarified. As it is, it does not appear that this is the appropriate model procedure.

Table 4, the caption refers to sample size in parentheses, but I could not find sample sizes in the table.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 11, 7901, 2014.

C2864