

## ***Interactive comment on “Aggregates reduce transport distance of soil organic carbon: are our balances correct?” by Y. Hu and N. J. Kuhn***

**Anonymous Referee #8**

Received and published: 10 July 2014

I find the article interesting in that it presents results from well-designed experiments. The introduction, description of the protocol and results are very good. Overall, this is relevant for publication in Biogeosciences.

Nevertheless, I agree with most of the reviewers that the "back of the envelope" global estimate obtained by extrapolating results from a single experiment is not very useful. I fully understand the strategy of the authors to justify the importance of their research and results by providing insights on the big picture. However, I do not think it is needed to provide some big numbers that are probably irrelevant due to their uncertainty and from which it is hard to learn something.

However, this comment does not call for removing the discussion around weaknesses existing in erosion models. It is an important matter per se and this does not need a

C3397

very uncertain global estimate to be justified.

---

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 11, 8829, 2014.