

Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “Spatial genetic structure of the Sea Sandwort on Surtsey: an immigrant’s journey” by S. H. Árnason et al.

A. Désamoré (Referee)

adesamore@doct.ulg.ac.be

Received and published: 25 July 2014

The authors present a nice study on island colonization by a polyploid plant with robust past knowledge of the colonization history. The sampling and methods are appropriate to adress their hypotheses. The questions I raised during the earlier stage of revision were well addressed and the new version is now well improved.

p4 l15-27: recent litterature on island biogeography (Whittaker, Triantis & Ladle 2008 JBI, 35(6) 977-994) show that not only island size or isolation act on diversity but also island age (General Dynamic Model) which is of particular interest here as the Surtsey is a very young island. One sentence about it could be mentioned in the introduction and might be useful to enhance more your own results.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



minor corrections:

page 3 : sentence 1, replace "if Iceland" by "of Iceland"

section 2.3. page 16 line 17: I would remove the "of" between july 2010 and May 2011.
same sentence replace ",of these" by "from which" Line 19: I think it might be clearer
for the reader to replace "This includes;" by " The 12 locations are : five on Surtsey
(SC: located...,...), two on Heimaey" and so on; and I would put all the descriptions of
locations between parentheses.

page 21 line 3 : misspelling in between

Page 19 line 2 : misspelling in heterogeniety

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 11, 10045, 2014.

BGD

11, C3772–C3773, 2014

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper