Biogeosciences
Discussions

Interactive comment on "Contrasting patterns of litterfall seasonality and seasonal changes in litter decomposability in a tropical rainforest region" *by* S. A. Parsons et al.

S. A. Parsons et al.

scottanthonyparsons@gmail.com

Received and published: 29 July 2014

Anonymous Referee #3 Received and published: 27 June 2014 General Comments This paper examined the seasonality of litterfall and leaf decomposability in a variety of plots in the Australia wet tropical region. A major finding of this paper was that greater levels of deciduousness led to more consistent monthly litterfall. The authors argue that this is because the larger number of deciduous species brings a greater mix of litterfall characteristics relative to evergreen forests, whereas the litterfall characteristics for the evergreen trees were more consistent across species. This is an interesting finding and an important contribution to the literature, especially because this may be relevant

to forests in other regions. Overall, the paper was well written. A few specific concerns are listed below.

Specific Comments Abstract Line 10 – the full model with statistics and P values doesn't seem to fit in an abstract SP: I am not sure how to address this. Does this mean you want the model results deleted from the abstract?

Intro Line 28 – "including understanding of the seasonality of litter inputs in forested ecosystems is a limiting factor" . . . this line doesn't seem grammatically correct SP: You meant line "8" I think. Yes, agreed, "including" has been deleted

Methods Line 10-12- "total litterfall" included leaves, and leaf litterfall, is then mentioned separately following the parentheses SP: These phrases do not occur on lines 10-12 on any of the pages in the methods. I am unsure what this is referring to. As it has not come up in any other of the reviews, I cannot see any urgency to making this change.

Line 15- change "most falls" to most rain SP: Changed for the revision

General comment for methods- Need a better description of the statistical tests used, particularly the repeated measures ANOVA, and whether the assumptions for those tests were met SP: This has been amended as per reviewer #1's recommendations

Results Line 10- "an should be "and" SP: I could not find "an" on line 10 on any page of the results. I searched the document and could not find this error anywhere.

Last paragraph of results- Lines 1-4- This section refers to Table 4, which is presented as a repeated-measures ANOVA. It is not clear what the repeated measures were in this case. This way this model was run needs to be clarified. As it is, it does not appear that this is the appropriate model procedure. SP: Again, see response to reviewer #1 as to how this has been repaired.

Table 4, the caption refers to sample size in parentheses, but I could not find sample sizes in the table. SP: They are shown as mentioned, i.e. in the "wet mean" & "dry mean columns in parenthesis (brackets) (see Table 4).