

Interactive comment on “Contrasting patterns of litterfall seasonality and seasonal changes in litter decomposability in a tropical rainforest region” by S. A. Parsons et al.

S. A. Parsons et al.

scottanthonyparsons@gmail.com

Received and published: 29 July 2014

Anonymous Referee #2

SP: It is unfortunate that reviewer #2 did not express all of the major concerns he/she seems to show in the first paragraph of the review earlier. Most of them seem a little inflated anyway, and the weight of their meaning is reduced dramatically based on the other reviews, in addition to reviewer #1 and #3's lack of agreement, in the work being, as reviewer #2 puts it generally “poor”. Alas however, I have addressed the specific comments below in the revision.

Specific comments – p7903, l6 “C-cycle” replace with carbon cycle SP: Ok, changed
C3888

to “carbon cycle.

P7903 l15 “is thus essential in comprehending plant phenology”: It can be argued that it is plant phenology, which determines the litterfall and not the other way around SP: I do not disagree with that. However, we have not alluded to the causes of “litterfall” in that sentence anyway, we have merely mentioned that the factors listed are related (i.e. not the causes of one or the other).

p7903, l24 “deciduous species in seasonally wet tropical forests can shed litter as a response to new growth” Missing reference SP: No, the reference is at the end of the sentence (Hyland et al. 2002).

p7904 l1: You need to mention what your study region is SP: It is on the 4th line of the Methods.

p7905 l11 add temperature units SP: Added in the revision

p7905 l13: “summer months” name the months, summer has different definitions in different hemispheres SP: Added in the revision

p7907 l10: ‘Deciduousness’ is not an ecosystem intrinsic property, but rather an emergent property that results out of a combination of factors, such as climate and species distribution. SP: Agreed. We never said it was an “ecosystem intrinsic property”.

p7908 l4 It is unclear if the data on secondary species was obtained and described in a previous Parsons et al paper or if it had another source SP: “determined in Parsons et al 2014”, “determined added to line 4 before “in”.

p7909 l6 “in the dry” Missing the word season? SP: “season” added

p7911 l20 “highest annually insolation” Should this be highest annual insolation? Or highest insolation within a year? Does the same period have both high rainfall and high radiation? SP: Changed to “annual” yes.

p7911 l22 “in other locations globally”: Which locations in particular? SP: The reader

C3889

can check the references listed there if they require this information. It refers to a lot of locations.

7915 I5 This part of the discussion is based on a regression with an r^2 value of 0.2. Surely there should be a discussion of the other 80% of unexplained variation in the data prior to any other more broad implications. SP: The variability is a high as we would expect, especially for a composite variable like this (wet/dry season decomposability difference). As this was also the best model/fit out of many variables, I fail to see the relevance of this suggestion.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 11, 7901, 2014.