

Interactive comment on “Foliar photochemical processes and carbon metabolism under favourable and adverse winter conditions in a Mediterranean mixed forest, Catalonia (Spain)” by D. Sperlich et al.

V. Brovkin (Referee)

victor.brovkin@zmaw.de

Received and published: 30 July 2014

Dear Dr. Sperlich,

as the editor, I was unable to find the 2nd reviewer of the manuscript, therefore I reviewed the manuscript myself. I noticed that the manuscript was revised in the process of interactive discussion and uploaded as supplementary material, which is rather unusual for the editorial process in Biogeosciences. I therefore read the revised manuscript and did my comments based on your response to the comments of the 1st

C3937

reviewer.

The revised manuscript is easy to read and it is not as long as the original version (the length, particularly of the introduction, was my concern from the beginning of the editorial process). The manuscript summarizes well results of novel, interesting research and fits well into the scope of Biogeosciences. I have minor comments of the editorial origin:

- Figures 2 to 8 are done in the format of line plots just for 2 case studies. Values on intermediate line points have no meaning which makes the line plots not really appropriate for the graphical presentation of these data. Please consider making a bar diagram at least for some of these figures;
- The figures as they are now are blurry; this should be improved in the final manuscript version;
- Reconsider whether you need Figs. 10 and 11. Right now, they are not discussed much in the paper and are absent in the figure caption list;
- Table 1: Explain what is the “all” case and add units;
- Figure 8: add a legend on the plot.

To facilitate the review process after the end of the interactive discussion phase, please upload the newly revised manuscript and a response letter to the comments listed above and the second set of comments by the 1st reviewer.

Yours sincerely,

Victor Brovkin

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 11, 9697, 2014.

C3938