

Interactive comment on “Foliar photochemical processes and carbon metabolism under favourable and adverse winter conditions in a Mediterranean mixed forest, Catalonia (Spain)” by D. Sperlich et al.

D. Sperlich et al.

dominik@creaf.uab.es

Received and published: 25 August 2014

Dear Dr. Brovkin,

Thank you very much for the thorough reading of our manuscript and your positive comments. Our responses to each comment are given below each point:

Figures 2 to 8 are done in the format of line plots just for 2 case studies. Values on intermediate line points have no meaning which makes the line plots not really appropriate for the graphical presentation of these data. Please consider making a bar

C4617

diagram at least for some of these figures;

- In the initial version of our manuscript, we thought it makes it visually more attractive to use line points in order to highlight the change between the two periods for each tree species. However, we considered the constructive criticism and changed our line point diagrams to bar plots (figure 2-8).

The figures as they are now are blurry; this should be improved in the final manuscript version;

- We will provide high resolution figures for the final version of our manuscript after the end of the discussion phase.

Reconsider whether you need Figs. 10 and 11. Right now, they are not discussed much in the paper and are absent in the figure caption list;

- When rearranging our figures in the revised manuscript we confused the order as also Referee 1 pointed out. Figure 10 and 11 should be numbered 9 and 10. They are presented in the section 3.5. We have corrected this now. If possible, we would like to keep these figures as we discuss them in section 4.3 and 4.4 and we consider them to be worth publishing and sharing them with other physiologists.

Table 1: Explain what is the “all” case and add units;

- In this table we presented the P- values of Student’s t-tests for the differences between sunlit and shaded leaves of *Q. ilex* for different periods (unitless). We corrected the labeling as follows: All -> both periods Mild -> mild period Frost -> frost period

Figure 8: add a legend on the plot.

- Corrected.

To facilitate the review process after the end of the interactive discussion phase, please upload the newly revised manuscript and a response letter to the comments listed above and the second set of comments by the 1st reviewer.

C4618

- We have replied also to the comments of Referee 1 and uploaded now a new revised version of the manuscript including all changes following Referee 1 and 2.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<http://www.biogeosciences-discuss.net/11/C4617/2014/bgd-11-C4617-2014-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 11, 9697, 2014.

C4619