

Interactive comment on “Evaluation of coral reef carbonate production models at a global scale” by N. S. Jones et al.

N. S. Jones et al.

nancy.jones@bristol.ac.uk

Received and published: 21 October 2014

Dear Reviewer,

On behalf of myself and my co-authors, I would like to thank you for your comments and for highlighting issues that will improve our manuscript. Please see text below for our initial responses to the points you raise.

Comment 1: *...there is some physiological literature that must be taken into account in the discussion and, probably, in the model construction (e.g. Marshall and Clode, 2004; Colombo-Pallotta et al., 2010).*

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

Authors response: We agree, further discussion of the physiological literature is justified and will be included in the revised manuscript. This is a particularly valid point since one of the published models, Silverman^{SST Ω} , incorporates the experimentally-derived temperature-calcification response curve of Marshall and Clode (2004) to modulate calcification rates derived from inorganic calcification (G_i) as calculated from Ω_a . We would like to clarify that the intention of our paper is to evaluate published models to determine which produced the best fit to present day observations of CaCO_3 production. This does not involve model construction. If the scope of our study is unclear, we will need to clarify this.

Comment 2: ...I'm concerned about the so-called Lough^{SST} model. Basically, the authors are using the same line of reasoning of McNeil et al. (2004), which was widely criticized by Kleypas et al. (2005). Lough and Barnes (2000) are Porites growth data in an environmental gradient, not in a time-line gradient. For this, take a look to Worum et al. (2007); Cooper et al. (2008); Tanzil et al. (2009); and Carricart-Ganivet et al. (2012) between others.

Authors response: We agree - advocating the use of Lough^{SST} alone for future simulations (time-line gradients), similar to McNeil et al. (2004), would be completely inappropriate and there is substantive evidence that calcification rates have fallen in the last two to three decades (e.g. Cooper et al., 2008; De'ath et al., 2009; Cantin et al., 2010; Manzello, 2010; De'ath et al., 2013; Tanzil et al., 2013). This is not our intention and we will emphasis this. Instead, our intention in this manuscript is to evaluate all the models, including Lough^{SST}, spatially across global environmental (temperature) gradients.

Once again, many thanks for your comments.

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)

References

Cantin, N. E., Cohen, A. L., Karnauskas, K. B., Tarrant, A. M., and McCorkle, D. C.: Ocean warming slows coral growth in the central Red Sea, *Science*, 329, 322-325, 2010.

Carricart-Ganivet, J. P., Cabanillas-Teran, N., Cruz-Ortega, I., and Blanchon, P.: Sensitivity of calcification to thermal stress varies among genera of massive reef-building corals, *Plos One*, 7, 8, 2012.

Colombo-Pallotta, M. F., Rodriguez-Roman, A., and Iglesias-Prieto, R.: Calcification in bleached and unbleached *Montastraea faveolata*: evaluating the role of oxygen and glycerol, *Coral Reefs*, 29, 899-907, 2010.

Cooper, T. F., De'ath, G., Fabricius, K. E., and Lough, J. M.: Declining coral calcification in massive *Porites* in two nearshore regions of the northern Great Barrier Reef, *Global Change Biol.*, 14, 529-538, 2008.

De'ath, G., Fabricius, K., and Lough, J.: Yes – Coral calcification rates have decreased in the last twenty-five years!, *Mar. Geol.*, 346, 400-402, 2013.

De'ath, G., Lough, J. M., and Fabricius, K. E.: Declining coral calcification on the Great Barrier Reef, *Science*, 323, 116-119, 2009.

Kleypas, J. A., Buddemeier, R. W., Eakin, C. M., Gattuso, J.-P., Guinotte, J., Hoegh-Guldberg, O., Iglesias-Prieto, R., Jokiel, P. L., Langdon, C., Skirving, W., and Strong, A. E.: Comment on "Coral reef calcification and climate change: the effect of ocean warming", *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 32, L08601, doi:10.1029/2004gl022329, 2005.

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)

Lough, J. M. and Barnes, D. J.: Environmental controls on growth of the massive coral *Porites*, *J. Exp. Mar. Biol. Ecol.*, 245, 225-243, 2000.

Manzello, D. P.: Coral growth with thermal stress and ocean acidification: lessons from the eastern tropical Pacific, *Coral Reefs*, 29, 749-758, 2010.

Marshall, A. T. and Clode, P.: Calcification rate and the effect of temperature in a zooxanthellate and an azooxanthellate scleractinian reef coral, *Coral Reefs*, 23, 218-224, 2004.

McNeil, B. I., Matear, R. J., and Barnes, D. J.: Coral reef calcification and climate change: the effect of ocean warming, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 31, L22309, doi:22310.21029/22004GL021541, 2004.

Tanzil, J. T., Brown, B. E., Dunne, R. P., Lee, J. N., Kaandorp, J. A., and Todd, P. A.: Regional decline in growth rates of massive *Porites* corals in Southeast Asia, *Global Change Biol.*, 19, 3011-3023, 2013.

Tanzil, J. T. I., Brown, B. E., Tudhope, A. W., and Dunne, R. P.: Decline in skeletal growth of the coral *Porites lutea* from the Andaman Sea, South Thailand between 1984 and 2005, *Coral Reefs*, 28, 519-528, 2009.

Worum, F. P., Carricart-Ganivet, J. P., Benson, L., and Golicher, D.: Simulation and observations of annual density banding in skeletons of *Montastraea* (Cnidaria: Scleractinia) growing under thermal stress associated with ocean warming, *Limnol. Oceanogr.*, 52, 2317-2323, 2007.

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

