Biogeosciences Discuss., 11, C7288–C7289, 2014 www.biogeosciences-discuss.net/11/C7288/2014/
© Author(s) 2014. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



Interactive comment on "Flux variations and vertical distributions of microzooplankton (Radiolaria) in the western Arctic Ocean: environmental indices in a warming Arctic" by T. Ikenoue et al.

G. Cortese (Referee)

G.Cortese@gns.cri.nz

Received and published: 11 December 2014

Hi Takahito & co-authors,

General comments: I liked your paper, it is a nice contribution to improve our baseline data for radiolarians from the Arctic Ocean, and the team includes quite some experts in the field, with careers spanning 40+ years specialising in high-latitude/Arctic radiolarians, so you cannot go wrong with the taxonomy...

Specific comments: Essentially I have only one main concern with your paper: The

C7288

linkages and hypotheses linking radiolarian abundances and flux to their feeding habits (and, towards the end, where you discuss intermediate to deep-water living forms: organic matter availability), seem rather tenuous to me, and very hypothetical/not substantiated by real data. So probably toning down that aspect will help your paper.

Technical corrections: Besides that, there were a lot of typos scattered around, so I did my best to fix those for you in the attached PDF.

Those mistakes were more than enough to scare a less lenient reviewer... next time you submit a paper to an international journal, please seek help from a professional editor/proof-reader, as many reviewers would reject your paper JUST based on that, which is a pity, as your work is very interesting.

Thanks for your contribution, Peppe

Please also note the supplement to this comment: http://www.biogeosciences-discuss.net/11/C7288/2014/bgd-11-C7288-2014-supplement.pdf

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 11, 16645, 2014.