Biogeosciences Discuss., 11, C7288–C7289, 2014
www.biogeosciences-discuss.net/11/C7288/2014/
© Author(s) 2014. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.

Biogeosciences Discussions
Open Access

Interactive comment on "Flux variations and vertical distributions of microzooplankton (Radiolaria) in the western Arctic Ocean: environmental indices in a warming Arctic" *by* T. Ikenoue et al.

G. Cortese (Referee)

G.Cortese@gns.cri.nz

Received and published: 11 December 2014

Hi Takahito & co-authors,

General comments: I liked your paper, it is a nice contribution to improve our baseline data for radiolarians from the Arctic Ocean, and the team includes quite some experts in the field, with careers spanning 40+ years specialising in high-latitude/Arctic radiolarians, so you cannot go wrong with the taxonomy...

Specific comments: Essentially I have only one main concern with your paper: The

Full Screen / Esc
Printer-friendly Version
Interactive Discussion
Discussion Paper

linkages and hypotheses linking radiolarian abundances and flux to their feeding habits (and, towards the end, where you discuss intermediate to deep-water living forms: organic matter availability), seem rather tenuous to me, and very hypothetical/not substantiated by real data. So probably toning down that aspect will help your paper.

Technical corrections: Besides that, there were a lot of typos scattered around, so I did my best to fix those for you in the attached PDF.

Those mistakes were more than enough to scare a less lenient reviewer... next time you submit a paper to an international journal, please seek help from a professional editor/proof-reader, as many reviewers would reject your paper JUST based on that, which is a pity, as your work is very interesting.

Thanks for your contribution, Peppe

Please also note the supplement to this comment:
http://www.biogeosciences-discuss.net/11/C7288/2014/bgd-11-C7288-2014-supplement.pdf

---

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 11, 16645, 2014.