

## 44 1 Introduction

45 Permafrost is widespread in Arctic and boreal regions (Schuur et al., 2008)<sup>1</sup> and is  
46 estimated to contain ca. 1700 Pg of organic carbon (McGuire et al., 2009; Tarnocai et al.,  
47 2009). Permafrost thawing and erosion is evident by the northward retreat of the  
48 permafrost boundary (Thibault and Payette, 2009). In some northern regions this has led  
49 to the expansion of permafrost thaw ponds and lakes (thermokarst systems; Grosse et al.,  
50 2013), whereas in other regions there has been a contraction and loss of these waterbodies  
51 (e.g., Andresen and Lougheed, 2015). These thermokarst systems are part of circumpolar  
52 and global biogeochemical cycles (Abnizova et al., 2012; Walter et al., 2007). Although  
53 some are carbon sinks (Walter Anthony et al., 2014), others are net sources of carbon  
54 dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>) and methane (CH<sub>4</sub>) to the atmosphere<sup>2</sup> due to the mobilization of ancient  
55 carbon stored in permafrost (Laurion et al., 2010; Negandhi et al., 2013; Walter et al.,  
56 2008).

57 Bacterial communities are among the main drivers of key biogeochemical processes  
58 (Ducklow, 2008), and in thermokarst systems are composed of functionally diverse taxa  
59 (Crevecoeur et al., 2015; Rossi et al., 2013). In particular, these systems are favorable for  
60 bacterial methanotrophs (Crevecoeur et al., 2015) as well as archaeal methanogens  
61 (Mondav et al., 2014), and the relative activity of these two groups will affect methane  
62 balance and the net emission of greenhouse gases. Identifying factors that shape bacterial  
63 communities in these aquatic systems is therefore essential for understanding the  
64 functional significance of these permafrost thaw systems in the global carbon budget.


65 Aquatic bacterial communities are thought to be selected by a combination of bottom-  
66 up (resource availability) and top-down (viral lysis, grazing) controls. Less studied are  
67 bacteria-bacteria interactions (facilitation, competition), which may further contribute to  
68 non-random distributions observed among microbial taxa (e.g., Horner-Devine et al.,  
69 2007). Examining co-occurrence patterns has the potential to unveil ecological processes  
70 that structure bacterial communities. Specifically, patterns of co-occurrence may reveal to  
71 what extent groups of microbes share habitat preferences, to what extent there may be  
72 ecological linkages among bacterial taxa and with other planktonic organisms, and the  
73 extent of phylogenetic closeness of co-occurring bacterial taxa given that closely related  
74 taxa may share life strategies and ecological traits.

# Résumé des commentaires sur Ms Comte track mode IL\_bgd-12-C7646-2015-supplement.pdf

---


Page : 3

---

 Nombre : 1      Auteur :      Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte      Date : 2015-11-25 14:33:05

---

the argument behind mentioning this is unclear: is it because this stock of OC once dissolved in lake water can drive the bacterial communities as evidenced by your study?

 Nombre : 2      Auteur :      Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte      Date : 2015-11-26 13:31:59

---

this part of sentence is only supported by Walter et al. 2008, not by Laurion et al. 2010 neither by Negandhi et al 2013. And in fact I don't think it's right to say they are net sources of GHG to the atmosphere DUE to the mobilization of ancient C. There is still a lot of work to be done to quantify to which degree the old stock is fueling microbes. And see Bouchard et al. in the special issue related to this question.

75 Across northern landscapes, both regional (e.g., climate and the degradation state of  
76 permafrost) and local (e.g., nutrients, dissolved organic carbon and oxygen) conditions  
77 are likely to influence the <sup>1</sup> distribution and bacterial community composition of thaw  
78 ponds and lakes. Thaw ponds and lakes show a high degree of limnological (Deshpande  
79 et al., 2015) and bacterial heterogeneity (Crevecoeur et al., 2015), making them suitable  
80 models to investigate the co-occurrence patterns among bacterial taxa as well their  
81 network relationships within microbial consortia. The main objectives of this study were  
82 to characterize the ecological linkages within microbial communities as a response to  
83 permafrost thawing. Our hypotheses were that (i) bacterial communities follow co-  
84 occurrence patterns along the permafrost degradation gradient, due to distinct habitat  
85 preferences among bacteria, and (ii) these habitat preferences relate to differences in the  
86 phylogenetic structure of bacterial communities.

87 To test the above hypotheses, we employed high-throughput sequencing of the 16S  
88 rRNA gene to determine the composition of bacterial communities in thaw ponds and  
89 lakes of Nunavik (Quebec, Canada) along a North-South permafrost degradation  
90 gradient. In addition, we sampled rock-basin lakes that were under the same regional  
91 climate but whose formation was not related to climate change. We investigated the  
92 relationships among bacterial taxa and local environmental conditions by means of  
93 network analysis, which has been applied with success elsewhere to evaluate microbial  
94 distribution patterns (Barberan et al., 2012; Peura et al., 2015; Steele et al., 2011) and  
95 responses to environmental perturbation (Araújo et al., 2011). We then examined the  
96 potential linkages between the bacteria and phytoplankton, <sup>2</sup> autotrophic picoplankton and  
97 zooplankton biomass in the ponds.

98

## 99 **2 Methods**

### 100 **2.1 Study sites and sampling**

101 Surface water (0.2 m) from 29 thermokarst ponds was collected from 1 to 13 August  
102 2012 in two types of permafrost landscapes. Thaw ponds were located in the vicinity of  
103 Whapmagoostui-Kuujuarapik (W-K: lat. 55° 15' N, long. 77° 45' W) and Umiujaq (lat.  
104 56° 32' N, long. 76° 33' W), within four valleys in the eastern Canadian subarctic,

---

**T** Nombre : 1      Auteur :      Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte      Date : 2015-11-25 15:37:31  
reverse so that we can understand you mean bacterial distribution, otherwise it becomes the distribution of lakes and ponds

---

**T** Nombre : 2      Auteur :      Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte      Date : 2015-11-25 15:42:16  
why autotrophic and not phototrophic?

105 Nunavik along a North-South permafrost degradation gradient as described in Comte et  
106 al. (2015): the Sasapimakwananisikw River valley (SAS) and the Kwakwatanikapistikw  
107 River valley (KWK), in sporadic, highly degraded permafrost landscapes (< 10%  
108 permafrost coverage; see Bhiry et al. 2011 for details); and the Sheldrake River valley  
109 (BGR) and Nastapoka River valley (NAS) that are in discontinuous permafrost  
110 landscapes (10-50% permafrost coverage). In addition, we sampled 5 rock-basin lakes as  
111 ‘reference lakes’ (RBL) in catchments near the W-K village as a fifth ‘valley’; these  
112 waters occupy glacially scoured basins, and their origin is not related to permafrost  
113 degradation.

114 At each site, temperature, conductivity, dissolved oxygen and pH were measured using  
115 a 600R multiparametric probe (YSI, Yellow Springs, OH, USA). Water for dissolved  
116 organic carbon (DOC) and <sup>1</sup>Chlorophyll-*a* (Chl-*a*) was filtered through a MilliQ water  
117 pre-rinsed 47-mm diameter, 0.22- $\mu$ m pore size acetate filters and <sup>2</sup>GF/F filters  
118 respectively (Whatman, GE Healthcare Life Sciences, Little Chalfont, Buckinghamshire,  
119 UK). Water samples for total phosphorus (TP) and total nitrogen (TN) were preserved  
120 with H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> (0.15% final concentration) until further analyses.

121 Samples for zooplankton were collected using a 35  $\mu$ m net and <sup>3</sup>fixed in ethanol (final  
122 concentration: 75%, v/v), and stored in cold (4 °C) dark conditions until analysis by  
123 inverted microscopy. Microbial abundance samples for flow cytometry (FCM) analysis  
124 were further collected and fixed with glutaraldehyde (final concentration: 2%, v/v) and  
125 stored frozen at -80 °C until analysis.


126

## 127 2.2 Chemical and plankton analyses


128 <sup>4</sup>DOC and nutrient analyses were conducted at the Institut National de la Recherche  
129 Scientifique, Centre Eau Terre Environnement (INRS-ETE, Quebec City, QC, Canada).

130 DOC concentrations were analyzed on a Shimadzu TOC-5000A carbon analyzer and  
131 nutrients were analyzed using standard methods (Stainton et al., 1977). Colored dissolved  
132 organic matter (CDOM) was measured by spectrophotometric analysis of <sup>5</sup>absorption at  
133 254 nm by water filtered through 0.2  $\mu$ m pore-size filters and the dissolved aromatic  
134 carbon content was determined using the SUVA<sub>254</sub> index (Weishaar et al., 2003).


---

 Nombre : 1      Auteur :      Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte      Date : 2015-11-25 15:44:12  
capital letter not needed


---

 Nombre : 2      Auteur :      Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte      Date : 2015-11-26 13:34:00  
strictly speaking, water for DOC is filtered THROUGH a filter, and water for Chla is filtrered ONTO a filter... but I understand you were trying to condense...


---

 Nombre : 3      Auteur :      Sujet : Texte inséré      Date : 2015-11-25 15:48:15  
,

---

 Nombre : 4      Auteur :      Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte      Date : 2015-11-26 13:34:25  
I don't think this informatiion is necessary, rarely the lab is given, unless for very specific analyses

---

 Nombre : 5      Auteur :      Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte      Date : 2015-11-25 15:52:29  
strictly speaking this should be absorbance, that is used in the SUVA calculation (not absorption coefficient)

135 Phytoplankton biomass was estimated as Chlorophyll *a* concentrations (Chl-*a*), which  
136 were determined using high performance liquid chromatography (ProStar HPLC system,  
137 Varian, Palo Alto, CA, USA) following the procedures described in <sup>1</sup>Bonilla et al., 2005).  
138 Zooplankton, specifically copepods, rotifers and cladocerans, were enumerated following  
139 the Utermöhl procedure (1958) and inverted microscopy (Zeiss Axiovert, Carl Zeiss  
140 Microscopy GmbH, Jena, Germany). Bacteria, picocyanobacteria and autotrophic  
141 picoeukaryotes were enumerated using a FACScalibur flow cytometer (BD, Mississauga,  
142 ON, Canada), equipped with an argon laser, at the lowest flow rate (12 µl min<sup>-1</sup>), using 1  
143 µm yellow green microspheres (Polysciences Inc, Warrington, PA, USA) in suspension  
144 as an internal standard. Bead concentration was controlled using Truecount Absolute  
145 counting tubes (BD, Mississauga, ON, Canada). Bacteria were stained by adding 20 µl of  
146 a 50X SYBR Green I (Life Technologies, Thermo Fisher Scientific, Waltham, MA,  
147 USA) to 500 µl of sample for 10 min in the dark. Bacterial cells were then discriminated  
148 on the basis of their green fluorescence (FL1) and side scatter signals (SSC) while excited  
149 at 488 nm, <sup>2</sup>whereas autotrophic picoeukaryotes and picocyanobacteria were discriminated  
150 on the basis of their red fluorescence (FL3) with a threshold in orange (FL2) and SSC.  
151 The resulting data were analyzed using the CellQuest Pro software with manual gating.

152

### 153 **2.3 Bacterial community composition**

154 Bacterial community composition (BCC) was determined by 454-pyrosequencing of  
155 the V6-V8 regions of the 16S rRNA gene. In brief, water was sequentially filtered  
156 through a 20 µm mesh net to remove larger organisms, a 47-mm diameter, 3 µm pore size  
157 polycarbonate filter (Whatman) and a 0.2 µm pore size Sterivex unit (EMD Millipore,  
158 Billerica, MA, USA) using a peristaltic pump. The filters were preserved with 1.8 ml of  
159 RNAlater (Life Technologies) and stored at -80°C until further processing. <sup>3</sup>For this  
160 study, DNA was extracted from cells collected onto Sterivex units using the PowerWater  
161 Sterivex DNA Isolation Kit (MO BIO Laboratories Inc., Carlsbad, CA USA) following  
162 the manufacturer instructions. Extracted DNA was amplified in three separate 20 µl PCR  
163 reactions using 1 µl of template (3 concentrations: 1, 0.5, and 0.2X) and a Phusion high-  
164 fidelity DNA polymerase kit (New England Biolabs, Whitby, ON, USA), and reverse  
165 1406R and forward 969F primers with sample specific tags as in Comeau et al. (2011).

---

**T** Nombre : 1      Auteur :      Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte      Date : 2015-11-26 13:35:33  
remove parenthesis in front of author

---

**T** Nombre : 2      Auteur :      Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte      Date : 2015-11-25 15:54:49  
but I beleive this is done on UNstained samples right? (no SYBR Green)

---

**T** Nombre : 3      Auteur :      Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte      Date : 2015-11-26 13:36:05  
I suggest that you make this choice more explicit, which means that you excluded bacterial communities associated to particles (collected on the 3um filters), and this can be a large fraction in thermokarst lakes... You might want to briefly acknowledge this in the discussion as well.



226 GenBank (<http://blast.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/Blast.cgi>) to identify the lowest level of  
227 classification possible. A heatmap was produced to examine the variability in the  
228 ecological preference among the 30 most abundant OTUs.

229


## 230 2.6 Co-occurrence patterns

231 Co-occurrence analyses were performed using the overall dataset and each of the  
232 datasets for the 5 individual valleys. The data were filtered by using only those OTUs  
233 with a minimum of 20 reads and that were detected in at least three different ponds. This  
234 filtering step removed poorly represented OTUs and reduced the network complexity,  
235 resulting in a core community of 294 OTUs.


236 Randomness in co-occurrence of OTUs in the regional and individual valley datasets  
237 was tested in a null model using the quasiswap algorithm (Miklós and Podani, 2004) and  
238 C-score metric (Stone and Roberts, 1990) under 50000 simulations. SES (standardized  
239 effect size) was used as a measure of OTU segregation as described in Heino and  
240 Grönroos (2013) in order to determine whether this may relate to the overall  
241 environmental heterogeneity, the heterogeneity in biotic and abiotic variables separately,  
242 or to specific environmental variables. Environmental heterogeneity was determined  
243 using homogenization of group dispersion (Anderson et al., 2006) and defined as the  
244 mean distances of ponds to the centroid (central point) of each valley. Analyses were  
245 conducted on Euclidean distances on standardized variables and based on 1000  
246 permutations. **Similarly, the homogenization of group dispersion method was used to**  
247 **determine whether communities among ponds within a given valley were more similar**  
248 **than within other valleys.**

249 Network analyses were conducted on the filtered OTU dataset. In addition, a total of 8  
250 physicochemical variables (DOC, TP, TN, pH, SUVA<sub>254</sub>, COND: conductivity, T: water  
251 temperature, DO: <sup>1</sup>Dissolved oxygen concentration) and 7 biotic variables (Chl-*a*:  
252 phytoplankton biomass, BA: bacterial abundance, <sup>2</sup>PC: picocyanobacteria, PE: autotrophic  
253 picoeukaryotes, Rot: rotifers, Clad: cladocerans, Cop: copepods) data were also included  
254 in the network. For each environmental variable, any missing data were estimated as the  
255 mean for the corresponding valley and all data were then normalized by subtracting the  
256 mean value for the overall study and dividing by the corresponding standard deviation.

---

 Nombre : 1      Auteur :      Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte      Date : 2015-11-25 16:06:46  
capital letter not necessary

---

 Nombre : 2      Auteur :      Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte      Date : 2015-11-26 13:36:30  
these are also abundances (not only bacterial)

408 Analysis of the network hubs further showed that the top 24 were mainly composed of  
409 Actinobacteria OTUs, in particular members of Actinomycetales and Acidimicrobiales.  
410 In addition, OTUs assigned to Betaproteobacteria represented a large fraction of these  
411 highly connected OTUs including the typical freshwater *Limnohabitans*, whereas  
412 Verrucomicrobia and Bacteroidetes were represented by only a few highly connected  
413 OTUs. Interestingly, the anaerobic photosynthetic sulphur bacterium Chloroflexi was also  
414 identified as a hub in the overall network (SI Table 3).

415

#### 416 **4 Discussion**

417 The main goal of the present study was to identify co-occurrence patterns among  
418 bacterial communities **in thaw ponds and lakes** in the changing subarctic landscape.  
419 Consistent with our first hypothesis, there was a non-random distribution of bacterial taxa  
420 across the distinct valleys sampled in this study. The results showed that thaw ponds  
421 communities from the same valley, especially those located in the sporadic permafrost  
422 landscape, tended to be more similar in terms of bacterial community composition than  
423 communities originating from ponds located in other valleys. Furthermore, the thaw  
424 ponds differed taxonomically from the rock-basin reference lakes, with specific bacterial  
425 OTUs associated with a particular valley or permafrost landscape type. Contrary to our  
426 second hypothesis, that differences in habitat preferences among bacterial communities  
427 were related to distinct phylogenetic structure, we found no evidence for differences in  
428 the community phylogenetic relatedness between the different valleys. The same bacterial  
429 phyla occurred throughout the region, and variability among ponds in the same valley  
430 was greater than the differences among valleys.

431

#### 432 **4.1 Local community composition uniqueness and habitat preference among** 433 **bacterial communities**

434 Non-random distribution patterns among bacterial taxa were detected, indicating that  
435 bacterial taxa in our study region tended to co-occur more than expected by chance. Non-  
436 random assembly patterns indicate the dominance of deterministic processes such as  
437 environmental filtering in shaping community composition (Horner-Devine et al., 2007).

438 The bacterial communities of freshwater ecosystems elsewhere (Eiler et al., 2011), as

---

Nombre : 1      Auteur :      Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte      Date : 2015-11-26 13:37:16

---

Here and below down to the end of conclusion: I understand that when you talk in general (intro), you want to include both lakes and ponds, but in your dataset, can't you decide if your water bodies are lakes or ponds according to your classification (freezing to bottom?, connected to hydrographic network? size?) instead of carrying this unprecise/large qualification?

439 well as in certain terrestrial (Barberan et al., 2012) and marine (Steele et al., 2011)  
440 ecosystems, have also been reported to have distributional patterns that relate to the  
441 environment. Such patterns may depend on niche breadth and competitive abilities  
442 (Székely et al., 2013), grazing and viral lysis susceptibilities (Chow et al., 2014; Miki,  
443 2008) and dispersal capabilities (Fahlgren et al., 2010; Hervas and Casamayor, 2009).

444 No significant relationship was found between distribution patterns and environmental  
445 heterogeneity. This was unexpected, as previous studies have shown that thaw ponds and  
446 lakes are heterogeneous environments with marked differences in community  
447 composition across the different valleys associated with distinct environmental variables  
448 (Crevecoeur et al., 2015; Comte et al. 2015). In agreement with Heino and Grönroos  
449 (2013), we suggest that the relationship between distribution pattern and environmental  
450 heterogeneity may be scale-dependent such that environmental heterogeneity may have  
451 effects on the bacterial taxa distribution patterns at the overall study region scale and not  
452 at the valley scale as tested here. The results did show differences in the phylogenetic  
453 composition of bacterial communities among the different valleys, which highlight  
454 distinct habitat preferences among taxa (Fig. 2, SI Fig. 4). In particular, the combination  
455 of LCBD and regression analyses indicated that the compositional uniqueness of thaw  
456 ponds and lakes was positively related to DOC **concentrations**, a well known determinant  
457 of bacterial communities and processes (Kritzberg et al., 2006; Ruiz-González et al.,  
458 2015). Along with the variations in permafrost degradation state across the study region,  
459 there were also differences among valleys in terms of availability and origin of carbon  
460 subsidies. The northern sites are located within the discontinuous permafrost area where  
461 most of the soil remains frozen and is thus not available for microbial degradation, while  
462 in the southern sporadic area, permafrost is highly degraded (Bouchard et al., 2014) and  
463 large amounts of ancient permafrost carbon may be available for microbial processes.  
464 Consistent with this pattern, elevated concentrations and high rates of CO<sub>2</sub> and CH<sub>4</sub>  
465 emission to the atmosphere have been reported among the southern sites within the most  
466 degraded area of permafrost (Laurion et al., 2010; Deshpande et al. 2015). In addition,  
467 **SAS sites originated from palsas (organic permafrost mounds) and were likely different**  
468 **in DOC composition relative to other valleys**, where the ponds were formed by the  
469 thawing of lithalsas (mineral permafrost mounds). This **is consistent with recent**

I am searching for a description of this specificity in DOC (or you mean in DOM i.e. DOC and SUVA?) at SAS, but cannot find it in the results.

470 observation of a direct link between community composition and the degradation of  
471 terrestrially derived DOM (Logue et al. 2015) and may in turn explain the significantly  
472 higher bacterial richness and diversity observed in SAS thaw ponds communities<sup>1</sup> and  
473 why OTUs assigned to methanotrophic bacteria such as *Methylobacter* and  
474 *Methylotenera* were amongst the most abundant detected in this valley (Fig. 2).

475

## 476 4.2 Bacterial phylogenetic structure

477 The mean NRI across all communities was significantly greater than zero. This  
478 provides evidence for a dominant role of environmental filtering on community  
479 composition (Kembel, 2009). The corollary is that a set of environmental variables  
480 constrained community composition, resulting in taxa that were closer phylogenetically  
481 and more ecologically similar than if stochastic processes (including dispersal) drove  
482 community assembly. In fact, there is no corridor such as streams that connects the  
483 ponds, and thus local dispersal processes are unlikely to explain the local phylogenetic  
484 structure of the thaw pond communities. Similar results were obtained for microbial  
485 community studies in the ocean (Monier et al., 2015) and on groundwater communities  
486 (Stegen et al., 2012).

487 No significant difference in NRI was found among the different valleys, but this result  
488 likely reflects the high variability within individual valleys. In particular, two ponds in  
489 the NAS valley had higher values of NRI in comparison to their neighboring ponds.  
490 These two ponds had specific environmental characteristics including high concentrations  
491 of suspended clay particles and low phytoplankton concentrations, which may have  
492 favored certain environmental specialists. The rock-basin waters had higher NRI values  
493 than the thaw ponds, indicating that their assemblages were more ecologically similar to  
494 each other than those originating from thaw ponds and lakes. This could relate to their  
495 respective histories in that the rock- basin lakes originate from deglaciation followed by  
496 retreat of the Tyrell Sea ca. 8000 years ago<sup>2</sup> and have thus been exposed to longer term  
497 ecological processes. In contrast, the high environmental heterogeneity in the permafrost  
498 landscape is consistent with the<sup>3</sup> higher degree of community relatedness observed among  
499 thaw ponds.

1 Nombre : 1 Auteur : Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte Date : 2015-11-26 13:38:35

---

I think you are not explicit enough on why you make a link to methanotrophs; I suggest this part makes its own sentence with the link to specificity of SAS DOM and CH<sub>4</sub> (more CH<sub>4</sub> brings more CH<sub>4</sub> consumers I suppose?).

1 Nombre : 2 Auteur : Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte Date : 2015-11-25 16:57:14

---

is this bringing lower diversity in general/elsewhere?

1 Nombre : 3 Auteur : Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte Date : 2015-11-25 16:58:50

---

is this equivalent in saying lower diversity, i.e. more similar? I am confused now cause you said above rock ponds had more similar communities (than thaw ponds right?)



500 The extent of permafrost erosion (permafrost landscape type) appeared to influence  
501 phylogenetic structure. When controlling for the two outliers mentioned above (NAS-A  
502 and NAS-B), the northern communities (BGR, NAS) had a greater phylogenetic distance  
503 among co-occurring taxa than expected by chance (lower NRIs) <sup>1</sup> than communities from  
504 the thaw ponds located in valleys from sporadic permafrost (KWK, SAS). This suggests  
505 that taxa from SAS valley (and to a lesser extent KWK), tend to be more ecologically  
506 similar to each other than those from northern valleys. These findings are in line with  
507 studies elsewhere that showed that clustered communities are mainly retrieved from  
508 environments <sup>2</sup> that have constrained environmental conditions (Monier et al., 2015).


509  
510

### 4.3 Network associations


511 The extent to which closely related bacterial taxa may coexist is still a subject of  
512 considerable discussion (Mayfield and Levine, 2010). Previous studies on aquatic  
513 microbial communities have shown that closely related taxa have coherent temporal  
514 dynamics and share similar ecological niches (Andersson et al., 2009; Eiler et al., 2011).  
515 Co-occurrence networks enable the depiction and visualization of co-occurrence patterns  
516 among OTUs, and they provide a way of identifying potential ecological niches within  
517 microbial consortia. Network analyses have recently been applied to a wide range of  
518 microbial communities and biomes, and specific associations among bacterial OTUs and  
519 with environmental variables have been reported (Barberan et al., 2012; Chow et al.,  
520 2014; Eiler et al., 2011; Steele et al., 2011).

521 Our results point toward the importance of environmental filtering for community  
522 assembly in thaw ponds and lakes. In co-occurrence networks, correlations between  
523 OTUs and environmental variables highlight the conditions that may favor particular  
524 assemblages. Specifically, our co-occurrence networks identified two abiotic variables  
525 (DOC and conductivity) to be among the most connected nodes (SI Fig. 5B), and these  
526 variables separated according to landscape type: the northern ponds located in the  
527 discontinuous permafrost landscape had high conductivity and low DOC, whereas  
528 southern sites within the sporadic permafrost landscape had high DOC and lower  
529 conductivity (SI Table 2; further details are given in Comte et al. 2015). The analysis of  
530 the DOC subnetwork showed that only a few OTUs were significantly and directly

---

 Nombre : 1      Auteur :      Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte      Date : 2015-11-26 13:45:49  
the 2 "than" makes the comparison confusing


---

 Nombre : 2      Auteur :      Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte      Date : 2015-11-25 17:00:45  
please specify what constrains are you referring to for SAS?


562 positive co-occurrence (Fig. 5C), consistent with bacterial network relationships.  
563 Although other examples of positive co-occurrence among bacterial OTUs were  
564 identified in the dataset (Fig. 5A), there was also evidence of ‘non co-existence’ (*sensu*  
565 Reshef et al.<sup>1</sup> (2011)) among certain OTUs: In the northern, less degraded permafrost  
566 valley (BGR), OTU 1242 (Betaproteobacteria *Limnohabitans*) dominated, whereas in the  
567 southern highly degraded permafrost valleys (SAS, KWK), OTU 14 (Actinobacteria  
568 *ACK-MI*) dominated (Fig. 5B). These trade-offs among OTUs were partially explained  
569 by the geographic location of the valleys, suggesting that environmental variables not  
570 only drive the composition of the bacterial assemblages within the individual valleys but  
571 may also determine the ecological associations within microbial consortia. Furthermore,  
572 the positive relationship found between the connectivity and the habitat specificity among  
573 the most abundant OTUs is most likely driven by the dominance of highly connected  
574 OTUs in the southern<sup>2</sup> high degraded permafrost valleys<sup>3</sup> in comparison to the northern  
575 less degraded permafrost valleys. In addition, the OTUs retrieved from the southern thaw  
576 ponds were closely related to specific bacterial functional groups such as methanotrophs  
577 and nitrogen fixing bacteria (Fig. 5).

578  
579 The microbial networks for the thaw ponds had<sup>4</sup> ‘small world’ properties, with only a  
580 few, highly connected nodes, which can be viewed as keystone species. This property  
581 would render the networks more resilient to environmental change, but vulnerable to the  
582 loss of these nodal species (Montoya et al., 2006). The bacterial hubs were identified as  
583 typical freshwater, terrestrial and marine taxa (SI Table 3), and some of them were  
584 closely related to taxa that are involved in key biogeochemical processes such as nitrogen  
585 fixation and degradation of complex polymers, or that are known to be restricted in niche  
586 breadth, for example to cold environments. In accordance with Peura et al. (2015), the  
587 importance of a taxon in a microbial network may be less associated with its abundance,  
588 but instead determined by its connectivity, as represented by node degree for example.  
589 Thus many of the hub taxa identified in this study could be defined as a keystone  
590 microbial species (SI Table 3).<sup>5</sup> For example, the nitrogen-fixing bacterium *Beijerinckia*  
591 was among the most connected node in the co-occurrence network despite its low relative  
592 abundance.


---

 Nombre : 1      Auteur :      Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte      Date : 2015-11-26 13:39:24  
remove parentheses?


---

 Nombre : 2      Auteur :      Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte      Date : 2015-11-25 17:09:09  
highly?


---

 Nombre : 3      Auteur :      Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte      Date : 2015-11-25 17:10:01  
what do you mean? less likely driven by this in northern site?

---

 Nombre : 4      Auteur :      Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte      Date : 2015-11-26 13:27:34  
is this an expression used in other context or by Montoya? If so, please define further what you mean, otherwise useless

---

 Nombre : 5      Auteur :      Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte      Date : 2015-11-26 13:19:54  
it would be interesting to discuss why N-fixing bacterium would be important in an environment relatively rich in N

593

## 594 **Conclusions**

595 The thaw ponds and lakes sampled in the present study showed large variability in  
596 their bacterial community structure, even among <sup>1</sup>Sites in a single valley. This underscores  
597 the heterogeneous nature of permafrost aquatic environments, and is consistent with their  
598 known limnological variability. A small number of taxa occurred in high abundance and  
599 dominated many of the communities; these northern dominants included members of the  
600 betaproteobacterial order Burkholdiales and the Actinobacterial family ACK-M1; other  
601 dominants included members of the Bacteroidetes family Chitinophagaceae and  
602 Verrucomicrobia. Despite this variability and the existence of common taxa, there were  
603 taxonomic differences among different valleys and between permafrost landscape types,  
604 implying some degree of habitat selection.


605 The bacterial networks further showed that DOC and conductivity played an important  
606 role in the co-occurrence patterns of bacterial OTUs, corresponding at least in part to  
607 differences in these two environmental variables among valleys (SI Table 2). Strong  
608 positive associations as well as non-coexistence among OTUs were detected, and the  
609 resultant networks were composed of a limited number of highly connected OTUs. This  
610 ‘small world network’ property would render these communities more resilient to  
611 environmental change, but sensitive to the loss of their hub OTUs, which themselves  
612 showed some degree of habitat specificity. With ongoing global warming, these waters  
613 are likely to experience the effects of increased permafrost erosion and associated  
614 changes in their chemical environment, including shifts in DOC and conductivity. If such  
615 changes eventually cause the loss of keystone species that form the hubs of the present  
616 microbial networks, there would be a major disruption of thaw pond community  
617 structure, with potentially large biogeochemical consequences.

618


## 619 *Acknowledgements*

620 We are grateful to M. Bartosiewicz, B. Deshpande, A. Matveev, A. Przytulska-  
621 Bartosiewicz as well as C. Tremblay from Whapmagoostui-Kuujuarapik CEN station  
622 and the pilots of Canadian Helicopter Ltd., for their assistance in the field. We are also  
623 grateful to <sup>2</sup>Faschale N. Begin for zooplankton enumeration, Marie-Josée Martineau for

---

 Nombre : 1      Auteur :      Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte      Date : 2015-11-26 13:22:34  
you mean among lakes?

---

 Nombre : 2      Auteur :      Sujet : Commentaire sur le texte      Date : 2015-11-25 13:38:37  
All first names could be abreviated (as above) (same for Marie-Josée and Isabelle)

624 pigment analyses, Isabelle Laurion (INRS-ETE) for flow cytometry<sup>1</sup> and INRS-ETE for  
625 chemical analyses. Computing support from CLUMEQ/Compute Canada, aid from A.  
626 Monier for bioinformatics and phylogenetic analyses, advice from A. Eiler for network  
627 analyses, and insightful comments from two anonymous reviewers were also greatly  
628 appreciated. We acknowledge the Natural Sciences and Engineering Council (NSERC) of  
629 Canada funding for Discovery grants to WFV and CL and Discovery Frontier (ADAPT)  
630 grant to WFV, the support from the Network of Centres of Excellence program ArcticNet  
631 to WFV and CL, and the Canadian Research Chair Program to WFV. Additional support  
632 from Fonds de Recherche du Québec Nature et Technologies (FRQNT) to CEN is  
633 acknowledged. JC was partially supported by a FRQNT postdoctoral fellowship and the  
634 EnviroNorth CREATE program from NSERC.

635

## 636 References

- 637 Abnizova, A., Siemens, J., Langer, M. and Boike, J.: Small ponds with major impact: The  
638 relevance of ponds and lakes in permafrost landscapes to carbon dioxide emissions,  
639 *Global Biogeochem. Cy.*, 26(2), 2012.
- 640 Anderson, M. J., Ellingsen, K. E. and McArdle, B. H.: Multivariate dispersion as a  
641 measure of beta diversity, *Ecol. Lett.*, 9(6), 683–693, doi:10.1111/j.1461-  
642 0248.2006.00926.x, 2006.
- 643 Andersson, A. F., Riemann, L. and Bertilsson, S.: Pyrosequencing reveals contrasting  
644 seasonal dynamics of taxa within Baltic Sea bacterioplankton communities, *ISME J*, 4(2),  
645 171–181, doi:10.1038/ismej.2009.108, 2009.
- 646 Andresen, C. G. and Lougheed, V. L.: Disappearing Arctic tundra ponds: Fine-scale  
647 analysis of surface hydrology in drained thaw lake basins over a 65 year period (1948-  
648 2013), *J. Geophys. Res. Biogeosci.*, 120, doi:10.1002/2014JG002778, 2015.
- 649 Araújo, M. B., Rozenfeld, A., Rahbek, C. and Marquet, P. A.: Using species co-  
650 occurrence networks to assess the impacts of climate change, *Ecography*, 34(6), 897–908,  
651 2011.
- 652 Barberan, A., Bates, S. T., Casamayor, E. O. and Fierer, N.: Using network analysis to  
653 explore co-occurrence patterns in soil microbial communities, *ISME J*, 6(2), 343–351,  
654 doi:10.1038/ismej.2011.119, 2012.
- 655 Bastian, M., Heymann, S. and Jacomy, M.: Gephi: an open source software for exploring  
656 and manipulating networks, *ICWSM*, 8, 361–362, 2009.

I think there is no need to thank INRS for analyses that were paid.