

Interactive comment on “Fossil invertebrates records in cave sediments and paleoenvironmental assessments: a study of four cave sites from Romanian Carpathians” by O. T. Moldovan et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 27 August 2015

General comments: The presence of preserved invertebrates in cave sediments is quite interesting. I am aware of only a few cases where these have been documented, including an earlier paper by Moldovan and colleagues. This paper focuses on four caves in Romania, and includes detailed descriptions of their sedimentology and dating and a brief discussion of the actual invertebrates discovered. Most of the paper focuses on the geologic aspects. My main issue is the lack of information on the fauna itself. Most importantly, how are they preserved? We are told “good state of preservation,” but that does this mean? Are they articulated? Is the original cuticle preserved? To what

C4780

extent do they represent a biased record of the original biota? What are the suggested mechanisms for them getting into the caves? Overall, how well, do the cave fossils represent the surface environment? Figure 3 is the only one that shows the organisms; I would have liked far more illustrations that show the fossils. A lot of information in the discussion would have been much better being put in a table, focusing on the potential paleoclimate/paleoenvironmental information from each taxon and clearly identifying their larger group. The writing is overall fine, although there are small grammatical errors throughout.

Specific comments: 1. In the abstract we are told that “some of identified the taxa are new for science;” this is also mentioned in section 3.4. Are these being described elsewhere? What is their significance? Again, the organisms seem to take less important in the paper than they should be. By the way, should be “new to science” 2. P. 8851. Replace “and are all explaining the” to simply “explain” 3. P. 8852. Last paragraph of the Introduction should be moved to Material and Methods 4. P. 8854. Line 1-4. Not clear. What does “deposited continuously” mean? I am assuming deposition in these environments would be intermittent at many scales. 5. P. 8859 Delete “that lied”. 6. P. 8860 “Coercivities” with “coercivity”

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 12, 8849, 2015.

C4781