

Interactive comment on “Environmental controls on the greening of terrestrial vegetation across northern Eurasia” by P. Dass et al.

T. Keenan (Editor)

trevor.keenan@mq.edu.au

Received and published: 16 November 2015

Dear Authors,

Thank you for submitting your revised manuscript. Although you have addressed the majority of the reviewers concerns, I find that there are two further aspects that would need to be addressed in order for the manuscript to be of publishable quality.

The first is that the results are entirely dependent on the form of the GPP model used, but the model is not fully described and there is no justification given for the parameters used (Table 1). Please provide a justification for both the model and parameters used. The Running and Zhang papers are cited but note that this approach has been criticised by B. Medlyn, 2011: Comment on “Drought-Induced Reduction in Global

C7721

Terrestrial Net Primary Production from 2000 Through 2009” Science 10.1126/science.1199544. As I pointed out in my previous comment, there are multiple LUE based GPP models to choose from, and the choice of model structure and parameters can greatly affect your results. This needs to be discussed in detail in the manuscript. I would suggest using the issues raised by Medlyn to inform your discussion.

The second is that the results are not always clearly presented as being model results, and often GPP and ‘greening’ are conflated. Please revise the manuscript to clarify that you are talking about modelled GPP, not observed, and that your analysis addresses GPP and not greening (e.g. in the title).

Best wishes,

Trevor F. Keenan

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 12, 9121, 2015.

C7722