

Interactive comment on “What is the P value of Siberian soils?” by F. Brédoire et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 15 December 2015

The reviewed manuscript present data on P stocks and bio-availability in soils of Siberia. Since this area is going through rapid climate change, and since little is known about the P availability in these soils, this is an important contribution. The authors also made a literature search and compiled data on P status (measured in similar methods) in soils around the world. This enabled them to put the Siberia data in context. Overall this study seems sound, and I recommended publishing it after some minor revisions, detailed below. 1) The manuscript will benefit from English language editing. Especially the introduction and the discussion in which some of the sentence structure, and some of the words use, make it hard to read. 2) The title is confusing. P-value is usually used for statistics. 'P status' will be much better description for this work. 3) Page 19823, line 23 , remove humus which is not well defined and replace by organic matter. Same throughout the text., See: Lehmann, Johannes, and Markus Kleber. "The contentious nature of soil organic matter." *Nature* 528.7580 (2015): 60-68. 4) Since a lot of effort

C8499

was put into compilation of global data, it might be a good idea to present this data by maps with colors representing P concentrations (and insets of areas of interest). This is of course if there is some spatial pattern. Another option is to present this global data by plotting it against variables it is correlated with, like pH etc., together with the soils from the current study.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 12, 19819, 2015.

C8500