

Interactive comment on “Comparing solubility algorithms of greenhouse gases in Earth-System modelling” by V. M. N. C. S. Vieira et al.

M.T. Johnson (Referee)

martin.johnson@uea.ac.uk

Received and published: 16 December 2015

Dear Dr Vieira and co-authors,

In response to your comment: "About adapting this work to a few paragraphs in its companion paper, we already replied to the exact same suggestion in Dr Wanninkhof's review. We were expecting for an independent review as standard procedure in ISI indexed publications."

I am offended by your suggestion that I would not provide an independent review.

I would like to make it very clear that you did receive an entirely independent review to both of your biogeosciences manuscripts from me. I did not read the reviews of Professor Wanninkhof before reviewing your manuscripts, as I did not want to be bi-

C8521

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



ased by his opinions of your manuscripts. Reading through our reviews you will notice that there is very little in common in terms of scientific critique, which I think is clear evidence that the reviews were indeed independent.

The fact that we both came to the same conclusion - that this work is probably better as part of the companion paper - is a coincidence of opinion based on completely independent views on the subject. In my case I offered an opinion on this matter because the editor asked for advice specifically on whether the two manuscripts should be combined - maybe this was also requested of Prof. Wanninkhof?

I have no vested interest in agreeing with the opinions of Prof. Wanninkhof, neither did we collude or otherwise discuss the manuscripts prior to our reviews or even have the opportunity to do so.

I will reply to your scientific points in a separate response

Yours sincerely

Martin Johnson

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 12, 15925, 2015.

BGD

12, C8521–C8522, 2015

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper