Biogeosciences Discuss., 12, C8530–C8531, 2015 www.biogeosciences-discuss.net/12/C8530/2015/

© Author(s) 2015. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



BGD

12, C8530-C8531, 2015

Interactive Comment

Interactive comment on "Closing a gap in tropical forest biomass estimation: accounting for crown mass variation in pantropical allometries" by P. Ploton et al.

E. Rutishauser

er.rutishauser@gmail.com

Received and published: 16 December 2015

Dear Pierre et al.

Congratulations for this very interesting contribution and closing such a gap. While reading your manuscript, I was strike by your definition of trunk height. The first definition is found on p. 1979 in reference to Equ.2, and it says: "Ht the trunk height (i.e., height to the first living branch, in m)." It seems that Ht is not used in Equ.2. It is not clear, if you refer to H (H total) or define Ht here.

More importantly, your definition of Ht is questionable. The height to the first living

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



branch is generally known as clear-bole height or branch-free section of the bole. Based on your definition of crown depth (H - Ht, same page), Ht also refers to the length to crown base. While lower branches generally self-prune with ontogeny until the crown is formed, small unreiterated or epicormics branches may still be found below crown base (Nicolini et al. 2003, Barthélémy & Caraglio 2007, Rutishauser et al. in press). Hence, defining and measuring trunk height is not trivial. A clear differentiation between trunk and crown might even be challenging in several tropical tree species or along ontogeny (but I am not familiar with African trees). Without going to far into this architectural prognosis, the height to the first living branch often don't relate to crown base. I recommend to spend some time on this aspect and clarify your definition, given the importance it has in your study.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 12, 19711, 2015.

BGD

12, C8530-C8531, 2015

Interactive Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

