

Interactive comment on “Does the temperature sensitivity of decomposition vary with soil organic matter quality?” by M. Reichstein et al.

M. Reichstein et al.

Received and published: 15 September 2005

Response to Reviewer #3

GENERAL REMARK: This paper was written with the major goal to avoid the possible impression in the carbon cycle modeling community, that the problems of temperature sensitivity of carbon decomposition are solved with the study by Knorr et al. (Nature 433, 298–301), and to point to crucial problems in their analysis from our perspective. The paper was initially intended as a “communication arising” for Nature [as suggested by referee #3 on the response of Knorr et al.], but was not accepted by the editor due to limitations of space in relation to the perceived importance for the general reader.

We would like to thank reviewer #3 for his constructive comments on our manuscript. We note that reviewer #3 essentially supports our notion that drawing firm conclusions from the Knorr et al. study may be premature. However the reviewer criticizes, that it is not sufficiently addressed how to overcome

Full Screen / Esc

Print Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

the current limitations of the analysis of experimental data. We concur with this statement but think that this was outside the focus of the paper. Nevertheless, we add in the revised versions constructive perspectives to address these limitations from modeling and experimental points of view.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discussions, 2, 737, 2005.

BGD

2, S541–S542, 2005

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Print Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper