

Interactive comment on “Nitrogen load and forest type determine the soil emission of nitrogen oxides (NO and N₂O)” by K. Pilegaard et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 30 August 2006

The paper tries to summarize the results of an important measurement campaign and collates the experimental data in a comprehensive way, condensing as much as possible. This does not increase the readability of the text, but seems to be unavoidable given the comparatively few pages provided.

Methods are not described in detail, as this is done in the single papers referred to. It is meant to focus on results.

In doing so, the paper presents a host of useful data. Both for NO and N₂O emissions, each properly measured data set needs to be reported and discussed. The discussion reveals the state of knowledge (or ignorance) still present. It interprets the results reflecting relevant literature. Those who are more interested in lumped data will find

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

the paper helpful. Anybody interested in processes will have to read those special papers cited relating to single sites.

It might be worth while, though, to highlight new findings.

Details:

The SI unit for “year” is “a”.

Fig. 6 visualizes information which might also be deduced from Tables 2 and 5. The authors might need to explain why they need this figure. It is not thought to be superfluous!

It could be pointed out more clearly which single site data support an assumption or finding and which are contradictory.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 3, 837, 2006.

BGD

3, S453–S454, 2006

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper