Biogeosciences Discuss., 5, S1931–S1932, 2008 www.biogeosciences-discuss.net/5/S1931/2008/© Author(s) 2008. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



**BGD** 

5, S1931-S1932, 2008

Interactive Comment

## Interactive comment on "Do species traits determine patterns of wood production in Amazonian forests?" by T. R. Baker et al.

## **Anonymous Referee #1**

Received and published: 8 October 2008

I thank the autghors for their response to my comments. The authors ask for some clarification as to why I found the results "cryptic". I would ask them to re-read my comments, as I give reasons there. None-the-less I reiterate here that categorising species not only results in most of the information in their hard won trait data being jettisoned, but makes it hard to see what the overall pattern is, based on their figures.

On the modelling approach, perhaps I should have been more clear in my earlier comment. I don't think the appproach employed is a rigorous way of examining trait-climate-wood production relationships. These seem like great data you have collected and could be put to much better use. In my comments I really intended to encourage the authors to find a more cogent means for using their data to address their questions. I am quite confident that I would not be alone in finding their current approach uncon-

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

**Discussion Paper** 



vincing, and not worthy of publication.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 5, 3593, 2008.

## **BGD**

5, S1931-S1932, 2008

Interactive Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

