Biogeosciences Discuss., 5, S2971–S2972, 2009 www.biogeosciences-discuss.net/5/S2971/2009/© Author(s) 2009. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



BGD

5, S2971-S2972, 2009

Interactive Comment

Interactive comment on "Similar patterns of community organization characterize distinct groups of different trophic levels in the plankton of the NW Mediterranean Sea" by V. Raybaud et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 5 February 2009

Comments to the author Manuscript revision:

Similar patterns of community organization characterize distinct groups of different trophic levels in the plankton of the NW Mediterranean Sea V. Raybaud, A. Tunin-Ley, M. E. Ritchie, and J. R. Dolan

General comment

I find this paper very interesting and I think it contributes significantly to the discussion of biodiversity and community structure of planktonic communities. The work represents an important amount of sampling and taxonomic effort that must be admitted.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



While reading this paper I had some thoughts or comments I would like to pose to the authors. Specific comments

My first comment is related to the feeding interactions of the organisms analysed. Authors do not provide details on what these organisms eat and it is not so clear that they are trophically distinct. I would suggest they provide some empirical results or some results from the literature.

My second broad comment is related with the fact that, although this work represented an important amount of sampling during a continuous period of time, and due to high turnover rate of planktonic communities, it may be not sufficient to sample for few weeks to fully characterise the biodiversity and structure of planktonic communities. Do the authors have any thoughts about this? The species accumulation curves are a good example of this, they do not saturate during the sampling period. This does not take value off the study, but it may be interesting to discuss this issue. Do the authors would expect these results to change if they would have sample longer period of time? Or in another season under different water column and environmental conditions?

My third and last comment goes on the direction to answer to "so what?". What are the ecological consequences of these results? Do we have to change some of the perceptions we have regarding marine plankton communities and ecosystem functioning? I think it would be interesting to put the results in a bigger picture and try to highlight on what they contribute to what we know so far.

I enjoy reading this paper.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 5, 4897, 2008.

BGD

5, S2971-S2972, 2009

Interactive Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

