

Interactive comment on “Dynamics and distribution of natural and human-caused coastal hypoxia” by N. N. Rabalais et al.

E. Bonsdorff (Referee)

ebonsdor@abo.fi

Received and published: 11 November 2009

The manuscript/discussion paper by Rabalais, Diaz, Levin, Turner, Gilbert & Zhang on coastal hypoxia, its history and development, its causes and consequences, and possible remedies, offers an excellent overview of the topic on a variety of scales, from global to regional to local. As I have not seen any of the other manuscripts intended for the same thematic volume/issue, I cannot say anything about potential overlaps (but I feel any overlaps between reviews are not a real problem). The main benefit of this review is that it offers valuable insights both for the Expert in the field, and for the Beginner and/or Administrator who needs to learn things from trustworthy sources fast.

The ms is very well written, the literature is comprehensive, and the field is covered in a logic and readable way. So in principle I strongly recommend publication, basically

C2962

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



as it is, with two (minor) recommendations:

1) The authors rely heavily on their own papers, and I feel the author-team should consider reducing the amount of self-citations (which is not to say that their work isn't valuable - on the contrary; they are The Experts!): Increasing the role of other papers might make this paper even more valuable for the international audience!

2) Based on (1) it also follows that some figures/graphs could perhaps be removed/deleted (or replaced by others from other sources) - the manuscript has 25 figs, and I would recommend that some are deleted.

Major detail:

Chapter 9.4 Baltic Sea (p 9397 ff): Needs revision and updating (although recent papers by Conley et al 2009 a & b are included); the chapter now relies too heavily on one basic source, and I would welcome references to the HELCOM-reports on the Baltic Sea Action Plan (HELCOM 2007) - they are all freely downloadable at www.helcom.fi

Minor detail(s):

Mistakes among the references; (a) Tyson & Pearson (eds): Info missing (p 9425; line 33-), and (b) Vahtera E 2007 (Ambio); p. 9426, line 8-): Should be Vahtera et al, i.e. a long list of co-authors (and in this specific case, that is vital, as the papers was the product of an international ws on the issues described in the paper).

I enjoyed reading this manuscript!

Best regards,

Erik Bonsdorff

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 6, 9359, 2009.

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)