

Interactive comment on “A simple ecohydrological model captures essentials of seasonal leaf dynamics in semi-arid tropical grasslands” by P. Choler et al.

G. Wohlfahrt (Editor)

georg.wohlfahrt@uibk.ac.at

Received and published: 8 December 2009

The discussion phase of bg-2009-193 is going to end soon (11 December) and we have three reviews available, thus I am contributing an editorial comment at this point to guide the revision of the paper.

The three reviews are generally very positive - the reviewers consistently felt that the paper represents a novel and important contribution to the field. They, however, raised a number of concerns - two reviewers were recommending major, one minor revisions are necessary to make the paper acceptable for publication. I think the issues raised by the reviewers will indeed (further) improve the paper and I am thus looking forward to a

C3465

revision of the paper which takes these recommendations (and mine, which follow below) into account. The revised manuscript should be line-numbered and accompanied by a point-by-point reply to the reviewer (and my) comments.

General comments: Similar to one of the reviewers I had the feeling that at times the paper was extremely condensed. In particular when discussing linear vs. non-linear models I sometimes lost track of the differences between the models, in particular which processes and how these are (not) represented - maybe the authors can invest a bit more into getting down to the processes when discussing differences between the models. I also view the lack of other validation data for the model a drawback - not only regarding soil water content as one reviewer pointed out, but also regarding Eq.(1), i.e. the basic relationship between the green vegetation fraction and NDVI. Finally, I was a bit wondering that a lot of metrics are used to evaluate the model, none explicitly considered the different numbers of parameters (such as the Akaike Information Criterion).

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 6, 8661, 2009.

C3466