

## ***Interactive comment on “Assessing variability and long-term trends in burned area by merging multiple satellite fire products” by L. Giglio et al.***

**K. Tansey (Referee)**

kjt7@le.ac.uk

Received and published: 21 January 2010

The publication by Giglio et al. is a step forward in the development of a comprehensive burned area data set to facilitate long-term trend assessment.

I have the following minor comments that the reviewers may wish to consider: 1. The MODIS surface reflectance product was used to derive a burned area data set. It might be worth making clear that this is not the MCD45 product that is also burned area. The manuscript describes in Section 3.1.1. direct mapping using dynamic thresholds. The paper probably needs citing here. 2. Under Section 5.2 we need to evaluate (through the CEOS protocol) the benefits of all the burned area products available. I have independent evidence that the L3JRC algorithm performs rather well over Europe. This has been verified by the MODIS team (Boschetti). I actually still do not know fully

C4068

the true extent of burning. 3. In the conclusion, the authors could make an assessment about what is needed to be done to make the next steps. This is still a product derived from mainly one source of information.

A great paper that moves the field forward

All of the figures are necessary.

Best wishes, Kevin Tansey

---

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 6, 11577, 2009.