



Interactive comment on “Applying biomass and stem fluxes to quantify temporal and spatial fluctuations of an old-growth forest in disturbance” by S. Liu et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 19 June 2009

The paper of Liu et al. describes the biomass dynamics of a subtropical old growth forest. The subject is interesting since few of subtropical old growth forests are conserved and data on this biome is deficient.

I would suggest to reject the paper since: 1) The paper is not necessarily in the right journal. The paper deals mainly with changes in diameter distribution which are expanded (using preexisting biomass equations) into "biomass fluxes". 2) The native english speaking co-authors in the paper have clearly not done their job in correcting terminology and style (while the paper seems to have undergone a good language revision) I am not really shure why the authors talk about stem fluxes which does not seem

C832

to be a correct terminology.(foresters talk of ingrowth). 3) The study is a unreplicated single plot study. (which would not be fatal if the spatial analysis (presented in point four) would have been done properly. 4) The authors present sophisticated spatial images which remain a bit in the limbo, since they are not connected to the discussion or any formal spatial analysis. There is some work on subplots but there is no other analysis done by the subplots than a calculation of averages and standard deviations. It seems that somebody intended to do a formal spatial analysis and then left it on the way.....

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 6, 2723, 2009.

C833