

## ***Interactive comment on “Chemical and physical properties of Amazon forest soils in relation to their genesis” by C. A. Quesada et al.***

### **Anonymous Referee #2**

Received and published: 15 July 2009

1. The paper analyzed mostly chemical factors (physical issues appeared on pages 21-22 in a paper with 70 pages, based on qualitative estimations of structure, soil depth, etc). Perhaps the authors should consider keeping only chemical properties in paper title.
2. Soil data is confirming and providing additional evidences on the relationships between Amazonian soils and the geology. Most of those relationships are well known based on the observations of Sombroek and others. Perhaps, it mains merits is to provide a more organize and comprehensive picture of soils of Amazonia without the physical constraints represented by political borders, which acted, unfortunately, as a border for scientific knowledge for decades: there is no map of soils for the whole Amazon, for instance. On this respect, the paper is

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



- an important step forward.
3. The paper needs to be trimmed in many aspects, in particularly regarding the revision of methods, which discuss in detail various aspect of soil analysis which are beyond the scope of a paper. Such level of detail makes the reader impatient.
  4. It seems properties such as texture and bulk density were calculated. I am not sure though whether there were actually included in the soil physical score.
  5. Finally, and since the data is providing additional evidences of existence knowledge, it will be a good opportunity to make some inferences basin wide. The authors have available a unique dataset and could use the new information together with previous soils maps, to do some inferences basin wide regarding physical and chemical properties.

In conclusion, the paper should be considered a review of existent knowledge. Prior to publications, I suggest summarize the text, particularly the description of soil analysis.

I would like to see a more detail analysis in terms of the geographical implications basin wide of the data collected.

---

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 6, 3923, 2009.

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)