

Interactive comment on “After trees die: quantities and determinants of necromass across Amazonia” by K.-J. Chao et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 26 March 2009

I want to stress that this is an interesting paper but needs to address some issues. These are the low r -square values in the regressions and the problems with non-randomly selected sites and sites in literature. Are these sites representative of the areas? Does site selection create a bias in your results.

Another item that might be interesting to look at is in table 1 A, to analyze the differences between NE and NW Amazonia sites in regard to decay classes. Since wood density has been suggested to be different between regions this might be reflective in the decay classes.

I also include here references that I mentioned in my previous comments that I did not include. Sorry about that.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



Asner, G. P., Palace, M., Keller, M., Pereira R., Silva, J. N. M., Zweede, C., 2002. Estimation canopy structure in an Amazon forest from laser range finder and IKONOS satellite observations. *Biotropica* 34, 483-492.

Chambers, J.Q., Schimel, J.P., Nobre, A.D., 2001a. Respiration from coarse wood litter in central Amazon forests. *Biogeochemistry* 52, 115-131.

Chave, J., Condit, R., Lao, S., Caspersen, J.P., Foster, R.B., Hubbell, S.P. 2003. Spatial and temporal variation of biomass in a tropical forest: results from a large census plot in Panama. *Journal of Ecology* 91, 240-252.

Clark, D.A., Brown, S., Kicklighter, D.W., Chambers, J.Q., Thomlinson, J.R., Nif, J., 2001a. Measuring Net Primary Production in Forests: Concepts and Field Methods. *Ecological Applications* 11(2), 356-370.

Clark, D.A., Brown, S., Kicklighter, D.W., Chambers, J.Q., Thomlinson, J.R., Nif, J., 2001b. Net Primary Production in Tropical Forests: An Evaluation and Synthesis of Existing Field Data. *Ecological Applications* 11(2), 371-384.

Harmon, M.E., Whigham, D.F., Sexton, J., Olmsted, I., 1995. Decomposition and mass of woody detritus in the dry tropical forests of the northeastern Yucatan peninsula, Mexico. *Biotropica* 27(3), 305-316.

Keller, M., Palace, M., Hurtt, G., 2001. Biomass estimation in the Tapajos National Forest, Brazil: examination of sampling and allometric uncertainties. *Forest Ecology and Management* 154, 371-382.

Interactive comment on *Biogeosciences Discuss.*, 6, 1979, 2009.

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)