

Interactive comment on “Terrestrial carbon sinks in the Brazilian Amazon and Cerrado region predicted from MODIS satellite data and ecosystem modeling” by C. Potter et al.

G. Wohlfahrt (Editor)

Georg.Wohlfahrt@uibk.ac.at

Received and published: 30 March 2009

Article bgd-2008-0212 has received somewhat tepid reviews - one reviewer recommends minor, the other major revisions will be necessary before the paper becomes acceptable for publication in Biogeosciences. I too feel that major revisions will be necessary. When submitting a revision please do not forget to accompany it with a point-by-point reply to my and the reviewers comments.

In particular I believe that the authors should do a better job in exploring the causes of the spatio-temporal variability produced by their model. What would e.g. interest me is in how much is the spatio-temporal variability due to variability in EVI on one hand,

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



and meteo inputs on the other and what is the covariance between these drivers and how does it impact model simulations. Are there any lagged effects detected? In order to better understand model predictions readers not too familiar with the region may require appropriate maps of vegetation and climate fields.

Detailed comments: (1) p. 953, l. 26: how do these uncertainties impact model-data comparisons (see comment by reviewer #1)? (2) p. 954, l. 22: I recall that the lab of George Vourlitis is (used to be?) operating a tower in the Cerrado; are these data available for comparison or if not could a comparison be done based on their papers? (3) p. 956, l. 3: add statistics (r, p-value) (4) p. 957, l. 16-21: this appraised strength is not really very well reflected in the paper (see comments by reviewer #1) (5) Fig. 2: y-axis - what is shown NEE, NEP or NPP? x-axis - number months from 1-12 only (6) Fig. 3: number months from 1-12 only (7) Fig. 4 legend: (a); (b)

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 6, 947, 2009.

BGD

6, S625–S626, 2009

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper