

Interactive comment on “Sediment core fossils in ancient Lake Ohrid: testing for faunal change in molluscs since the Last Interglacial period” by C. Albrecht et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 8 June 2010

1. Does the paper address relevant scientific questions within the scope of BG? yes
2. Does the paper present novel concepts, ideas, tools, or data? yes
3. Are substantial conclusions reached? yes
4. Are the scientific methods and assumptions valid and clearly outlined? yes
5. Are the results sufficient to support the interpretations and conclusions? yes
6. Is the description of experiments and calculations sufficiently complete and precise to allow their reproduction by fellow scientists (traceability of results)? yes

C1329

7. Do the authors give proper credit to related work and clearly indicate their own new/original contribution? yes
8. Does the title clearly reflect the contents of the paper? yes
9. Does the abstract provide a concise and complete summary? yes
10. Is the overall presentation well structured and clear? yes
11. Is the language fluent and precise? yes
12. Are mathematical formulae, symbols, abbreviations, and units correctly defined and used? yes
13. Should any parts of the paper (text, formulae, figures, tables) be clarified, reduced, combined, or eliminated? no
14. Are the number and quality of references appropriate? yes
15. Is the amount and quality of supplementary material appropriate? na

Peer-Review Completion (BG)

Excellent paper which gives new insights into the development of this peculiar endemic lake fauna.

There are only very minor suggestions:

Piston coring often causes some compaction. Can this factor be quantified?

Chaper 3.1. Can the sedimentation rate for each unit be calculated?

Fig.2: it would be helpful to indicate the suggested boundaries between Holocene/Pleistocene (between units I and II) and also the boundaries between the Würm glacial and interglacial – if realistic.

ad Fig 2: or new figure: please show the sampling points and occurrences of the 13 species along the core. From the text it seems to be limited to Lithofacies III? What

C1330

happened during Lithofacies II which seems to represent the glacial?
Whats about winnowing effects by currents?

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 7, 3969, 2010.

C1331