

Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “Influence of seasonal monsoons on net primary production and CO₂ in subtropical Hong Kong coastal waters” by X. C. Yuan et al.

X. C. Yuan et al.

xcyuan@scsio.ac.cn

Received and published: 20 October 2010

RC: This manuscript covers a very small area of Hong Kong, discusses upwelling phenomenon which is well known, and relies on suspect data. There are a lot of good data in waters near Hong Kong. The authors should combine and discuss their data together with the much larger data sets in the context of the larger geographic domain. Related papers in the neighborhood should also be mentioned, if not discussed.

Response: We added more discussion with the much larger data sets in the context of the larger geographic domain (See discussion section). Although our study focuses on a relatively small area, it contains several contrasting environments in terms of hy-

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



drodynamics which help us to understand the mechanism of the relationship between trophic state and CO₂ source or sink. While our study focuses on a relative small area around H.K., we emphasize that our purpose is to discuss how monsoon induced physical processes (upwelling and downwelling) affect biological production/respiration and these would affect O₂ and CO₂ dynamics. It is NOT our intention to report regional air-sea CO₂ flux or Pearl River estuarine processes. Our paper is unique in reporting the relationship between biological properties and CO₂ properties and is very different from other papers reporting mainly CO₂ dynamics (i.e., those from M Dai and coworkers).

RC: Having said the above, however, I do not think the manuscript publishable mainly because I have serious doubts about the quality of the data. For one thing, the seawater pCO₂ was calculated based on pH and DIC. Yet, it is not even certain which pH scale the authors chose to use. The precision of pH measurements is also very poor. Further, the authors did not measure the CO₂ concentration in the air and chose a value of 370 μ atm for the calculation of CO₂ fluxes. This value is almost certainly too low as values near 440 μ atm have been measured in cruises near Hong Kong. Most of the stations sampled are in the harbour with heavy traffic in a city with six million people, thus the CO₂ concentration in the atmosphere must be high and variable. Without such data the CO₂ flux can not be calculated.

Response: Our pH measurements were based on the NBS scale and have a precision about 0.01 units. We added this information to the method. Insufficient of information regarding pH measurements should not be a reason to conclude that “The precision of pH measurements is also very poor.” In addition, whether a set of measurements is sufficient depends on the purposes of the issue to be addressed. The precision of pH measurements is enough for our purpose. The 0.01 pH error will result in the uncertainties of $\pm 3\%$ pCO₂ (ca. $15 \pm 6 \mu$ atm CO₂) and $\pm 10\%$ CO₂ fluxes (ca. 3 ± 2 mmol C m⁻² d⁻¹), which does not considerably affect our conclusion due to high pCO₂ in Hong Kong waters. Incorporating the reviewer’s concern, we now added a

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)

discussion on the uncertainty of unknown atmospheric pCO₂ value: The atmospheric pCO₂ has been reported to be in the range of 349 to 372 μatm in inner shelf/coastal areas adjacent to the Pearl River plume (Zhai et al., 2005), and ~358 μatm in offshore waters (Zhai et al., 2009). Since our sampling sites are very close to a mega city (Hong Kong), the land mass influence may result in higher atmospheric pCO₂, especially in the dry season when northeast winds were dominant. A large range of the atmospheric pCO₂ (349 to 460 μatm, and averaged 400 μatm) was reported in Randers Fjord, Scheldt, and Thames (Borges et al. 2004), where sampling sites were also close to anthropogenic influences. The average atmospheric pCO₂ (400 μatm) is used for the calculation of the air-sea flux of CO₂ in our studies. The variations in atmospheric pCO₂ (349 to 460 μatm) would quantitatively result in the estimates of average CO₂ effluxes (-20 mmol C m⁻² d⁻¹) varying from -12 to -25 mmol C m⁻² d⁻¹ in Hong Kong waters.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 7, 5621, 2010.

BGD

7, C3375–C3377, 2010

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

