

***Interactive comment on* “The influence of leaf photosynthetic efficiency and stomatal closure on canopy carbon uptake and evapotranspiration – a model study in wheat and sugar beet” by A. Schickling et al.**

G. Wohlfahrt (Editor)

georg.wohlfahrt@uibk.ac.at

Received and published: 7 December 2010

Paper bg-2010-242 has been assessed by three reviewers which generally concur in their assessment which ranges from major revisions (#2) to reject (#1, #3). Most importantly the reviewers rated the scientific significance of the paper generally poor, arguing that, while their data are valuable, their findings hardly add any new information to what is already known about the coupling between leaf and canopy processes. The reviewers generally express that the dataset has considerable potential which needs to be better exploited and make a number of suggestions to this end. It would appear

C4207

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



to me that the most promising way to make this a significant contribution would be to assimilate their data into a corresponding model and test their conclusions/hypothesis with the model. As this calls for considerable additional work, I am not sure whether this can be done in reasonable time (i.e. within the time limits within which revisions are due). Should the authors nevertheless decide to submit a revised paper, it should take all reviewer comments into account and be accompanied by a point-by-point reply to the reviewer comments. I am sorry that I can not be more positive at this stage.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 7, 7131, 2010.

BGD

7, C4207–C4208, 2010

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

C4208

