

***Interactive comment on “Deep plant-derived  
carbon storage in Amazonian podzols” by  
C. R. Montes et al.***

**Anonymous Referee #2**

Received and published: 15 December 2010

GENERAL COMMENTS concerning MS:

I have greatly appreciated the manuscript written by C.R. Montes et al. entitled "Deep plant-derived carbon storage in amazonian podzols". It turns out that I know very well the field of investigations and particularly the relationship between amazonian ferralsols and podzols. It is a far-flung place where it is not very easy to work. The field work done is impressive and many descriptions of soils were one in other contributions of same authors who are much experienced at this job. Data and discussions are in good agreement and well argued. However, there is little to write up and just some details to adjust. For example, authors should leave out terms as "equilibrium" or "not in equilibrium" which have a clear significance in thermodynamics which the paper is not dealing with. They are not appropriate terms for such a work and would confuse

C4362

people. It could be considered that soils are still in evolution through time depending on local conditions. So, those terms are misused and appear as pure statements. I advise the authors to get rid of them. Apart from these minute details which will improve their manuscript, this kind of research and results is going to get more and more importance because it turns in the nick of time in discussions regarding with carbon budgets in tropical soils and rain-forest.

I strongly recommend it to be published in Biogeosciences as an outstanding paper.

---

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 7, 7607, 2010.

C4363