

Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “Nitrogen storage and variability in paddy soils of China” by J. S. Lin et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 19 April 2010

Overall this is an interesting and well-written manuscript. In my opinion it should be acceptable for publication after minor revision.

I would suggest the authors clarify and expand upon two points. First, there is no explanation of how the nitrogen fertilization data were collected. These data must be based on some kind of survey rather than analyses of soil samples (as is the case for N concentration, pH, etc.). What were the characteristics of that survey?

Second, if the results of this work agreed with those of Tian 2006 for soil N density but differed significantly for total N stocks, aren't the only ways to account for that either (1) differences in land area assessed or (2) differences in the distributions of different N densities? The authors suggest this in the conclusion section, but I would think this warrants more discussion.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



Specific comments:

pg 858, line 6: insert “and” after “China,”

pg 858, line 7: insert “on” before “N”

pg 863, line 1: insert “is” after “It”

pg 875, figure 2: I would suggest using a color gradient instead of distinctly different colors. This would facilitate easier interpretation.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 7, 855, 2010.

BGD

7, C612–C613, 2010

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper