Biogeosciences Discuss., 8, 5935–5954, 2011 www.biogeosciences-discuss.net/8/5935/2011/ doi:10.5194/bgd-8-5935-2011 © Author(s) 2011. CC Attribution 3.0 License.



This discussion paper is/has been under review for the journal Biogeosciences (BG). Please refer to the corresponding final paper in BG if available.

Species-specific trajectories of nitrogen isotopes in Indiana hardwood forests, USA

K. K. McLauchlan¹ and J. M. Craine²

¹Department of Geography, Kansas State University, Manhattan, KS 66506, USA ²Division of Biology, Kansas State University, Manhattan, KS 66506, USA

Received: 12 April 2011 - Accepted: 15 June 2011 - Published: 28 June 2011

Correspondence to: K. K. McLauchlan (mclauch@ksu.edu)

Published by Copernicus Publications on behalf of the European Geosciences Union.



Abstract

Humans have drastically altered the global nitrogen (N) cycle, and these alterations have begun to affect a variety of ecosystems. In North America, N deposition rates are highest in the Central US, yet there are few studies that examine whether N availability

- ⁵ has been increasing to different tree species in the forests of the region. To determine the species-specific trajectories of N availability in secondary temperate forests experiencing high N deposition, we measured the N concentrations and composition of stable N isotopes in wood of four tree species from six hardwood forest remnants in Northern Indiana, USA. Annual nitrogen deposition rates averaged 5.8 kg ha⁻¹ from
- ¹⁰ 2000 to 2008 in this region. On average, wood δ^{15} N values in *Quercus alba* have been increasing steadily over the past 100 yr. In contrast, wood δ^{15} N values have been declining in three other hardwood species – *Acer saccharum, Carya ovata*, and *Fagus grandifolia* – over the same time period. The species-specific trends suggest a change in the partitioning of ammonium and nitrate among species, a change in nitrification
- rates, and/or offsetting changes in the dependence of species on mycorrhizal fungi. With no apparent net change in wood δ^{15} N over the past century at the stand level, on average there appears to have been little change in N availability for these forests despite high levels of N deposition in the region.

1 Introduction

²⁰ Modern temperate forests are experiencing an unprecedented variety of anthropogenic changes on a global scale, such as increasing levels of atmospheric CO₂, increased temperature, and increased deposition of reactive forms of nitrogen (N) from the atmosphere (Kareiva et al., 2007). In addition to these regional- to global-scale changes, many forests are experiencing local changes in fire regimes, drought, and the intro-²⁵ duction of non-native plants and animals while recovering from earlier logging and windthrow. Not only do many of these factors have the potential to interact in their



effects on forest processes, but they also have the potential to enhance or dampen N availability, which often limits primary productivity and influences forest species composition (Pepper et al., 2007). For example, experiments have suggested that elevated CO_2 may decrease terrestrial N availability (Johnson, 2006; Luo et al., 2004), while chronic N deposition may increase N availability to temperate forests (Aber et al., 2003).

5

10

Although understanding how global change factors affect the N cycle is of paramount importance to predicting forest dynamics, long-term records of N cycling in forests are rare and generally restricted to modern measurements that might span a few decades at most (Stoddard et al., 1999; Bernhardt et al., 2005). A more temporally-complete understanding of the modern trajectory of N cycling in forests requires extending records back in time beyond the modern record (Galloway et al., 2004). Analysis of the natural

abundance ratios of ¹⁵N to ¹⁴N in wood of living trees can serve as a proxy record for the history of N cycling in terrestrial ecosystems (Bukata and Kyser, 2005, 2007;

- ¹⁵ McLauchlan et al., 2007; Savard et al., 2009; Hietz et al., 2010). Although the N cycle is complex and the lack of direct climate information contained in N isotopes has previously hindered their use (McCarroll and Loader, 2004), recent analytical and conceptual advances suggest that N isotopic signatures in terrestrial ecosystems can be reliably interpreted (Savard, 2010; Houlton and Bai, 2009). Consensus is emerging
- that the standardized ratio of ¹⁵N to ¹⁴N (δ¹⁵N) in soil and leaves integrates a complicated terrestrial N cycle into a single metric that reflects terrestrial N availability (Craine et al., 2009). Briefly, there are a few major processes that alter the δ¹⁵N signature in plant material as compounds containing ¹⁵N are discriminated against in key steps of the N cycle (Högberg, 1997). The steps that fractionate most strongly are gaseous loss pathways, especially denitrification (Groffman et al., 2006; Menyailo and Hun-
- gate, 2006), gaseous loss during nitrification, and ammonia volatilization at high soil pH, and the transfer of N from mycorrhizal fungi to plants (Handley and Raven, 1992; Bedard-Haughn et al., 2003). Although there are many processes that discriminate against ¹⁵N, stand-level plant δ^{15} N generally increases with increasing N availability,





here defined as the supply of N to terrestrial plants and soil microorganisms relative to their N demands (Schimel and Bennett, 2004). In forests, high δ^{15} N values are found in soils and leaves of ecosystems with high rates of nitrification (Pardo et al., 2006), high rates of denitrification (Houlton et al., 2006), partial nitrification followed by nitrate leaching (Pardo et al., 2002), and low reliance on mycorrhizal fungi for plant N uptake (Hobbie and Colpaert, 2003).

5

Wood in living trees provides a widespread and readily-available record of N isotopes associated with terrestrial ecosystems that can be used to reconstruct terrestrial N cycling. Wood has very low N concentrations, and most of the N in wood is located
in proteins complexed with cellulose in cell walls (Bao et al., 1992; Showalter, 1993). A tiny proportion of N is mobile in sapwood, but most N is not mobile and N isotopes in wood have faithfully recorded clearance events in Ontario (Bukata and Kyser, 2005) and New Hampshire (McLauchlan et al., 2007), regional pollution in Eastern Canada (Bukata and Kyser, 2007; Savard et al., 2009), and short-term fertilization experiments
in California (Hart and Classen, 2003) and France (Elhani et al., 2005). Ultimately, the analysis of network abundance pitzgen isotopes in wood have the potential to eluvidete

analysis of natural abundance nitrogen isotopes in wood has the potential to elucidate whether forests are generally experiencing increased or decreased N availability.

In North America, some of the highest rates of N deposition occur in the Midwest region due to extensive inorganic fertilizer application to agricultural fields that began

- in the 1940s. The forests of this region are the most likely in North America to be experiencing eutrophication, but it is unknown how widespread this pattern might be or if all tree species in a forest respond similarly to the effects of N deposition. To better understand the changes in N cycling in temperate forests of the region, we obtained records of N isotopes, N concentrations, and ring widths from four tree species in six
- forest remnants in Northwestern Indiana. We expected to see an increase in wood δ^{15} N in all hardwood tree species beginning in the mid-20th century. Alternatively, stand-level declines in wood δ^{15} N would likely signal declines in N availability, while the lack of significant changes would indicate that N availability was not changing. We also analyzed the dendroisotopic records separately for each species, to assess whether



there are species-specific trajectories of N isotopes that might signal species-specific changes in N availability or reliance on mycorrhizal fungi.

2 Methods

2.1 Study site

- Increment bores were collected from six forest remnants in Northwest Indiana (Fig. 1). All sites are within 50 km of one another, in the Southern Great Lakes forests ecoregion (Olson et al., 2001). Extensive hardwood forests dominated by *Quercus alba* were common in the region prior to Euro-American settlement (Cowell and Hayes, 2007). These forests were cleared rapidly and converted to agricultural fields during the mid-10 19th century, and today the region is known as the Corn Belt, dominated by industrial agriculture. Each forest remnant contained a mix of species, generally with oaks (*Quercus* spp.) at all sites, shagbark hickory (*Carya ovata*) abundant in the drier sites, and sugar maple (*Acer saccharum*) and/or beech (*Fagus grandifolia*) abundant in the more mesic sites. N deposition in this area is among the highest in the US. The average amount of inorganic N deposited each year at these locations was 5.8 kg ha⁻¹ from 2000 to 2008 (National Atmospheric Deposition Program; http://nadp.sws.uiuc.edu). The source of this deposition is primarily inorganic N fertilizer applied to intensive corn
 - The source of this deposition is primarily inorganic N fertilizer applied to intensive corn and soybean agriculture in the region.

2.2 Increment bores: sampling, dating, and mass spectrometry

²⁰ Sampling consisted of a 5.15 mm diameter increment bore that spanned the entire radius of each tree acquired 1 m above the forest floor. Replication focused on the region, so three individual living trees were sampled at each site, generally *Quercus alba, Carya ovata, Acer saccharum*, or *Fagus grandifolia* (hereafter referred to by genus only). Trees of different ages allowed us to test for temporal effects independent of tree

Discussion Pa	BC 8, 5935–5	BGD 8, 5935–5954, 2011						
iper	Nitrogen is hardwoo	sotopes in d forests						
Discussion	K. K. McLauchlan and J. M. Craine Title Page							
Pape								
er	Abstract	Introduction						
D	Conclusions	References						
iscussi	Tables	Figures						
on P	14	►I.						
aper	•	•						
_	Back	Close						
Discus	Full Screen / Esc							
sion	Printer-frien	Printer-friendly Version						
Pape	Interactive	Interactive Discussion						
T I								

age (Hietz et al., 2010). Each increment bore was stored in a paper straw and dried at 60 °C until no further mass loss was observed. The face of each increment bore was sanded to increase the contrast between rings and then scanned at 1200 dpi. Each image was analyzed for ring width with Cybis CDendro software (Saltsjöbaden, Sweden).

- ⁵ The heartwood-sapwood boundary was determined visually on all but one increment bore. An age was assigned to each ring after cross-dating and close visual examination of the increment bore. After determination of ring width, each bore was weighed and divided into 30 mg segments along ring boundaries, providing enough N for mass spectrometry while maximizing the temporal resolution of the record and limiting the carbon
- ¹⁰ content and risk of incomplete combustion. The wood samples were not subjected to any chemical pretreatments based on results from (Bukata and Kyser, 2005; Hietz et al., 2010). The standardized ratio of ¹⁵N:¹⁴N relative to air (δ^{15} N) was determined for segments of wood at the Stable Isotope Mass Spectrometry Laboratory at Kansas State University on a ThermoFinnigan Delta Plus mass spectrometer interfaced with
- ¹⁵ a Carlo Erba 1110 elemental analyzer with Conflo II interface (Thermo Fisher Scientific Inc., Waltham, MA, USA), fitted with sequential traps of MgClO₄, NaOH on solid support (Carbosorb), and a cold trap in liquid N₂. Generally, every third segment of wood was analyzed resulting in an average length of time represented by a segment of 4.5 yr with 426 segments analyzed.

20 2.3 Statistical methods

The data from the increment bores (wood δ^{15} N, N concentration, and ring width) were manipulated as little as possible to reveal trends that might be obscured with detrending or statistical treatments that are applied temporally (Gavin et al., 2008). Average wood δ^{15} N was standardized to the same mean value for each site. Extensive analysis of the differences in chemical composition between heartwood and sapwood have been conducted (Savard et al., 2009; Hietz et al., 2010), and based on these results, N concentrations in wood deposited after 2000 C.E. were excluded from further statistical analyses. Wood N concentrations and δ^{15} N for each increment bore were analyzed



with simple linear regression against age for all wood with dates after 1900 C.E., which helped account for different ages among individual trees and species and to facilitate comparisons among sites. Piecewise linear regressions were performed to identify potential breakpoints in the record, such as during the mid-20th century when inorganic fertilizer application began. We did not constrain the intercept for each portion of the record identified with piecewise linear regression.

3 Results and discussion

3.1 Long-term records of stable N isotopes

On average, values of wood $\delta^{15}N$ for *Quercus* were 1.85% lower than the other three species (-1.52% vs. 0.33%, *P* < 0.001) with no significant differences in average wood $\delta^{15}N$ values among the other three species (*P* = 0.77). Standardizing wood $\delta^{15}N$ among sites produced similar differences between the two species groups: *Quercus* wood $\delta^{15}N$ values were 1.73% lower than those in the other hardwood species.

- Temporal trends in wood δ^{15} N differed among the four hardwood species examined (Fig. 2). After standardizing wood δ^{15} N so that all the sites had the same mean δ^{15} N (0%) from 1900–2008, *Quercus* wood δ^{15} N increased over time with an inflection point (1986.5±7.4) after which wood δ^{15} N increased even faster. Before 1986, δ^{15} N increased at a rate of 0.004 ‰ yr⁻¹. From 1987 on, *Quercus* wood δ^{15} N increased by 0.055 ‰ yr⁻¹. In contrast, wood δ^{15} N for the other three species – *Carya, Fagus*, and *Acer* – declined at a rate of 0.012 ‰ yr⁻¹ before 1980 and 0.045 ‰ yr⁻¹ after 1980. The point of inflection for these three species was 1980.5±8.1. Analyzing the linear rates of change over the entire period of analysis, there was no significant difference among the three species in their trends (*P* = 0.78) (Fig. 2, Table 1). Thus, there are contrasting trends where *Quercus* wood δ^{15} N has increased over time while wood δ^{15} N for other
- ²⁵ hardwoods has decreased. All species experienced an acceleration of these isotopic trends, in opposite directions, in the 1980 s.



3.2 Wood N concentration

All species had higher N concentrations in wood formed after 2000 C.E., which was sapwood. Before 2000, N concentrations increased over time for both sets of species (*P* < 0.01 for both), but N concentrations increased more for *Quercus* (0.0056 mg g⁻¹ yr⁻¹) than for other species (0.0015 mg g⁻¹ yr⁻¹) (*P* < 0.001) (Fig. 3). Sapwood has been shown to have higher N concentrations than heartwood in several tree species (Merrill and Cowling, 1966), and this pattern is consistent in both untreated wood and wood treated to remove water- and lipid-soluble compounds (Hietz et al., 2010). Thus, the higher N concentrations in sapwood than heartwood cannot be entirely explained by the higher proportion of labile N-containing compounds in living cells, and future research should help identify under what conditions a chemical extraction procedure might be useful and describe standardized methods for wood treatment prior to N isotopic analysis in environmental research. Wood N concentrations and δ¹⁵N values for each increment bore are shown in Fig. 4. The position of the heartwood-sapwood boundary varies among individual increment bores.

3.3 Age of trees and ring-width increments

Differences in temporal trends in wood δ^{15} N values between the two sets of species were not due to differences in the ages of trees. The oldest wood sampled for all trees ranged from 1855 to 1953 C.E. (Table 1). The oldest wood we sampled for 20 *Quercus* averaged 1898 C.E. among trees, compared with 1880 C.E. for *Carya*, 1922 C.E. for *Acer*, and 1916 C.E. for *Fagus*. Nor were there marked differences in radial increment trajectories for the two sets of species. On average, since 1900 C.E. the radius of *Quercus* trees increased by 2.34 ± 0.04 mm yr⁻¹, while other species increased at just 1.66 ± 0.03 mm yr⁻¹. Yet, radial increment for all species declined over time, with *Quercus* radial increment decreasing at a rate of 0.01 mm yr⁻¹ and other species at 0.005 mm yr⁻¹ (*P* = 0.003). All six sites exhibit expected trends of reduced radial growth over time.



The demography of nearby old-growth forest stands in Indiana indicates that the composition of tree species will be shifting in the near future, as canopy species such as *Quercus* spp. are replaced by subcanopy species such as *Acer saccharum* (Cowell and Hayes, 2007). High mortality in the subcanopy and a limited role of canopy gaps for favoring *Quercus* spp. may complicate these dynamics, however (Cowell et al., 2010). Our results indicate that altered nutrient dynamics in these forest remnants surrounded by agriculture are not substantially influencing these normal demographic processes.

3.4 Potential processes in this region

5

The different trajectories in wood δ^{15} N between *Quercus* and the other hardwood tree species could be caused by several factors. The *Quercus* wood δ^{15} N consistently increased at all sites over the duration of the record, which if it were typical of standlevel signatures would indicate increasing N availability, either through enrichment of N sources to the trees or reduced reliance on mycorrhizal fungi. Yet, the increases in *Quercus* wood δ^{15} N were accompanied by decreases in wood δ^{15} N of *Acer, Fagus*, and *Carya* species from the same stands. There are few single factor explanations that can explain the pairing of the two opposite δ^{15} N trajectories.

One possibility is a partitioning of N sources among tree species. There is some evidence that herbaceous plant species partition sources of N such that consistent, interpretable differences among species in foliar δ^{15} N are maintained (Kahmen et al.,

- ²⁰ 2008). Over time, this could lead to species-specific trajectories of δ^{15} N in plant tissue, as the type and quantity of N sources vary. However, there has been little evidence for this effect in wood δ^{15} N to date. When the wood δ^{15} N of two or more species have been studied in the same locations, trees generally exhibit the same trends in isotopic composition over time, even species with different growth forms, secondary com-
- ²⁵ pounds, wood anatomy, ecology, and function such as conifers and hardwoods (Savard et al., 2009). This could be a function of spatial scale, where the relative strength of regional processes such as N deposition and local processes such as species interactions determines the direction and type of signal in wood δ^{15} N values.



Nitrification, the conversion of ammonium to nitrate, is a strongly fractionating step that results in isotopic enrichment of NH_4^+ and depletion of NO_3^- . On average, the $\delta^{15}N$ values of *Quercus* wood were lower than those of *Acer, Fagus*, and *Carya*, which would suggest a greater reliance of *Quercus* on NO_3^- than NH_4^+ (Kahmen et al., 2008).

- ⁵ If *Quercus* took up less NO₃⁻ over time and the other species took up more NO₃⁻ over time, then this would lead to a gradual enrichment of wood δ^{15} N in *Quercus* and a depletion of wood δ^{15} N in the other species. Similarly, if N mineralization rates relative to plant demand were constant over time and nitrification rates became higher, this would also likely lead to a narrowing of the difference in wood δ^{15} N between the two sets
- of species. The type of mycorrhizal association varies among these hardwood tree species: *Quercus*, *Fagus*, and *Carya* form associations with ectomycorrhizal fungus, while *Acer* forms associations with arbuscular mycorrhizal fungus. Although this hypothesis requires further testing, ectomycorrhizal *Quercus* seedlings have been shown to have a greater relative preference for NO₃⁻ over NH₄⁺ when compared to *Acer* (Templer and Dawson, 2004).

Other potential explanations for patterns in wood δ^{15} N over time are possible, but are generally less parsimonious. For example, plant species that rely on ectomycorrhizal fungi are much more depleted in ¹⁵N than other species as a result of the fungi transferring depleted N to the plants. The increase in *Quercus* wood δ^{15} N since 1900 C.E. could be driven by a reduction in the reliance of the Quercus species on mycorrhizal 20 fungi, but this would not explain the concomitant decline in δ^{15} N of Acer, Fagus, and Carya. Another alternative explanation is that the hardwood tree species are taking up different amounts of the deposited N, such that the recent wood δ^{15} N signatures reflect the isotopic signature of deposited N. This is also somewhat unlikely because there is high variability in the isotopic signature of N deposited from fossil fuel sources. The 25 δ^{15} N values for deposited nitrate are circumneutral but range from -8.1% to 3.2%in the Eastern US (Elliott et al., 2007). Additionally, a N-deposition explanation fails to account for two aspects of the data: the past divergence of the wood δ^{15} N values between Quercus and the other hardwood species (almost 3‰ in 1900 C.E.) and the



lack of a mid-century breakpoint when fertilizer use, and anthropogenic N deposition, commenced in the region.

- When comparing temporal trends between regions, the absolute amount of N deposition could be important. A deposition station close to the Indiana forest locations has been averaging approximately $6 \text{ kg ha}^{-1} \text{ yr}^{-1}$ of inorganic N wet deposition over the past decade, and the sites we studied receive approximately 5.76 to $6 \text{ kg ha}^{-1} \text{ yr}^{-1}$ (Fig. 1). In a New Hampshire secondary forest, wood δ^{15} N had consistently declined among five species from 1929 to 2005 C.E., with no indication of wood δ^{15} N significantly increasing for any species (McLauchlan et al., 2007). This decline in wood δ^{15} N was consistent with the hypothesis that N availability had been declining due to forest regrowth. N deposition rates are approximately 20 % higher in Northwest Indiana than they are in New Hampshire, yet there has been no evidence of consistent increases in wood δ^{15} N in the Indiana forests. In Brazil, with very low anthropogenic N deposition, wood δ^{15} N has generally been increasing during the 20th century (Hietz et al., 2010).
- ¹⁵ In all, determination of whether stand-level δ^{15} N for these forests is increasing or decreasing will require more precise weighted mass-balance assessments, but there is currently little evidence for consistent trends in stand-level N availability over time in the Indiana forests. Regardless, the analyses of the wood δ^{15} N in these Indiana forests reveals clear species-specific trajectories that may reflect differences in resource parti-
- ²⁰ tioning. Future research on patterns of dendroisotopic δ^{15} N should include a range of species in a given stand and not assume that patterns for one species are representative of others. In addition, mechanistic work that investigates the role of N fertilizer, associations with mycorrhizal fungus, and progressive N limitation at different spatial scales is likely to be necessary to begin to separate the various hypotheses about the species-specific trajectories for these forests.
- Discussion Paper **BGD** 8, 5935-5954, 2011 Nitrogen isotopes in hardwood forests **Discussion Paper** K. K. McLauchlan and J. M. Craine **Title Page** Introduction Abstract Conclusions References **Discussion** Paper Tables **Figures** Back Close **Discussion** Paper Full Screen / Esc **Printer-friendly Version** Interactive Discussion

Acknowledgement. We thank the Nature Conservancy, Purdue University, and private landowners for site access. S. and W. McLauchlan provided field support. I. E. Wilson and J. Burniston assisted with sample preparation, and C. Morris provided technical support. We thank T. Ocheltree at the Stable Isotope Mass Spectrometry Laboratory (SIMSL) at Kansas State University for analytical assistance.

References

5

- Aber, J. D., Goodale, C. L., Ollinger, S. V., Smith, M. L., Magill, A. H., Martin, M. E., Hallett, R. A., and Stoddard, J. L.: Is nitrogen deposition altering the nitrogen status of northeastern forests?, Bioscience, 53, 375–389, 2003.
- Bao, W., O'Malley, D. M., and Sederoff, R. R.: Wood contains a cell-wall structural protein, P. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA, 89, 6604–6608, 1992.
 - Bedard-Haughn, A., van Groenigen, J. W., and van Kessel, C.: Tracing N-15 through landscapes: potential uses and precautions, J. Hydrol., 272, 175–190, 2003.

Bernhardt, E. S., Likens, G. E., Hall, R. O., Buso, D. C., Fisher, S. G., Burton, T. M., Meyer, J. L.,

McDowell, M. H., Mayer, M. S., Bowden, W. B., Findlay, S. E. G., Macneale, K. H., Stelzer, R. S., and Lowe, W. H.: Can't see the forest for the stream? – In-stream processing and terrestrial nitrogen exports, Bioscience, 55, 219–230, 2005.

Bukata, A. R. and Kyser, T. K.: Response of the nitrogen isotopic composition of tree-rings following tree-clearing and land-use change, Environ. Sci. Technol., 39, 7777–7783, 2005.

Bukata, A. R. and Kyser, T. K.: Carbon and nitrogen isotope variations in tree-rings as records of perturbations in regional carbon and nitrogen cycles, Environ. Sci. Technol., 41, 1331– 1338, 2007.

Cowell, C. M. and Hayes, J. J.: Structure, history and dynamics of a mature oak-beech forest in Western Indiana, J. Torrey Bot. Soc., 134, 215–222, 2007.

²⁵ Cowell, C. M., Hoalst-Pullen, N., and Jackson, M. T.: The limited role of canopy gaps in the successional dynamics of a mature mixed *Quercus* forest remnant, J. Veg. Sci., 21, 201– 212, doi:10.1111/j.1654-1103.2009.01137.x, 2010.

Craine, J. M., Elmore, A. J., Aidar, M. P. M., Bustamante, M., Dawson, T. E., Hobbie, E. A., Kahmen, A., Mack, M. C., McLauchlan, K. K., Michelsen, A., Nardoto, G. B., Pardo, L. H.,

Peñuelas, J., Reich, P. B., Schuur, E. A. G., Stock, W. D., Templer, P. H., Virginia, R. A.,



Welker, J. M., and Wright, I. J.: Global patterns of foliar nitrogen isotopes and their relationships with climate, mycorrhizal fungi, foliar nutrient concentrations, and nitrogen availability, New Phytol., 183, 980–992, 2009.

Elhani, S., Guehl, J. M., Nys, C., Picard, J. F., and Dupouey, J. L.: Impact of fertilization on

- tree-ring delta N-15 and delta C-13 in beech stands: a retrospective analysis, Tree Physiol., 25, 1437–1446, 2005.
 - Elliott, E. M., Kendall, C., Wankel, S. D., Burns, D. A., Boyer, E. W., Harlin, K., Bain, D. J., and Butler, T. J.: Nitrogen isotopes as indicators of NO_x source contributions to atmospheric nitrate deposition across the Midwestern and Northeastern United States, Environ. Sci. Technol. 41, 7661–7667, 2007

- Galloway, J. N., Dentener, F. J., Capone, D. G., Boyer, E. W., Howarth, R. W., Seitzinger, S. P., Asner, G. P., Cleveland, C. C., Green, P. A., Holland, E. A., Karl, D. M., Michaels, A. F., Porter, J. H., Townsend, A. R., and Vorosmarty, C. J.: Nitrogen cycles: past, present, and future, Biogeochemistry, 70, 153–226, 2004.
- Gavin, D. G., Beckage, B., and Osborne, B.: Forest dynamics and the growth decline of red spruce and sugar maple on Bolton Mountain, Vermont: a comparison of modeling methods, Can. J. Forest Res., 38, 2635–2649, doi:10.1139/x08-106, 2008.
 - Groffman, P. M., Altabet, M. A., Böhlke, J. K., Butterbach-Bahl, K., David, M. B., Firestone, M. K., Giblin, A. E., Kana, T. M., Nielsen, L. P., and Voytek, M. A.: Methods for
- ²⁰ measuring denitrification: diverse approaches to a difficult problem, Ecol. Appl., 16, 2091– 2122, 2006.
 - Handley, L. L. and Raven, J. A.: The use of natural abundance isotopes in plant physiology and ecology, Plant Cell Environ., 15, 965–985, 1992.

Hart, S. C., and Classen, A. T.: Potential for assessing long-term dynamics in soil nitrogen availability from variations in delta N-15 of tree rings, Isotopes Environ. Health Stud., 39,

- availability from variations in delta N-15 of tree rings, Isotopes Environ. Health Stud., 39, 15–28, 2003.
 - Hietz, P., Dunisch, O., and Wanek, W.: Long-term trends in nitrogen isotope composition and nitrogen concentration in Brazilian rainforest trees suggest changes in nitrogen cycle, Environ. Sci. Technol., 44, 1191–1196, doi:10.1021/es901383g, 2010.
- ³⁰ Hobbie, E. A. and Colpaert, J. V.: Nitrogen availability and colonization by mycorrhizal fungi correlate with nitrogen isotope patterns in plants, New Phytol., 157, 115–126, 2003.

Högberg, P.: Tansley review No 95 – N-15 natural abundance in soil-plant systems, New Phytol., 137, 179–203, 1997.



nol., 41, 7661–7667, 2007.

McLauchlan, K. K., Craine, J. M., Oswald, W. W., Leavitt, P. R., and Likens, G. E.: Changes

Natl. Acad. Sci. USA, 106, 21713–21716, doi:10.1073/pnas.0912111106, 2009.

losses from tropical rainforests, P. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA, 103, 8745-8750, 2006.

scapes and ecosystems for human welfare, Science, 316, 1866-1869, 2007.

sponses to elevated CO₂, Ecology, 87, 64–75, 2006.

Oecologia, 156, 861-870, 2008.

54, 731-739, 2004.

801, 2004.

- in nitrogen cycling during the past century in a northern hardwood forest, P. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA, 104, 7466-7470, 2007.
- Menyailo, O. V. and Hungate, B. A.: Stable isotope discrimination during soil denitrification: production and consumption of nitrous oxide, Global Biogeochem. Cv., 20, 3025-3035, 2006.
- Merrill, W. and Cowling, E. B.: Role of nitrogen in wood deterioration amounts and distribution of nitrogen in tree stems, Can. J. Bot., 44, 1555, 1966.
- Olson, D. M., Dinerstein, E., Wikramanayake, E. D., Burgess, N. D., Powell, G. V. N., Under-25 wood, E. C., D'Amico, J. A., Itoua, I., Strand, H. E., Morrison, J. C., Loucks, C. J., Allnutt, T. F., Ricketts, T. H., Kura, Y., Lamoreux, J. F., Wettengel, W. W., Hedao, P., and Kassem, K. R.: Terrestrial ecoregions of the worlds: a new map of life on Earth, Bioscience, 51, 933–938, 2001.
- Pardo, L. H., Hemond, H. F., Montoya, J. P., Fahey, T. J., and Siccama, T. G.: Response of the natural abundance of N-15 in forest soils and foliage to high nitrate loss following clearcutting, Can. J. For. Res., 32, 1126-1136, 2002.

Pardo, L. H., Templer, P. H., Goodale, C. L., Duke, S., Groffman, P. M., Adams, M. B., Boeckx, P.,

Discussion Paper Houlton, B. Z. and Bai, E.: Imprint of denitrifying bacteria on the global terrestrial biosphere, P. **BGD** Houlton, B. Z., Sigman, D. M., and Hedin, L. O.: Isotopic evidence for large gaseous nitrogen 8, 5935-5954, 2011 5 Johnson, D. W.: Progressive N limitation in forests: review and implications for long-term re-Nitrogen isotopes in Kahmen, A., Wanek, W., and Buchmann, N.: Foliar delta N-15 values characterize soil N cycling hardwood forests and reflect nitrate or ammonium preference of plants along a temperate grassland gradient, Discussion Paper K. K. McLauchlan and Kareiva, P., Watts, S., McDonald, R., and Boucher, T.: Domesticated nature: shaping land-J. M. Craine Luo, Y., Su, B., Currie, W. S., Dukes, J. S., Finzi, A., Hartwig, U., Hungate, B., McMurtrie, R. E., Oren, R., Parton, W. J., Pataki, D. E., Shaw, M. R., Zak, D. R., and Field, C. B.: Progressive nitrogen limitation of ecosystem responses to rising atmospheric carbon dioxide, Bioscience, **Title Page** Introduction McCarroll, D. and Loader, N. J.: Stable isotopes in tree rings, Quaternary Sci. Rev., 23, 771-Abstract Conclusions References **Discussion** Paper **Tables Figures** 14 Back Close **Discussion** Paper Full Screen / Esc **Printer-friendly Version**

Interactive Discussion



20

15

10

Boggs, J., Campbell, J., Colman, B., Compton, J., Emmett, B., Gundersen, P., Kjonaas, J., Lovett, G., Mack, M., Magill, A., Mbila, M., Mitchell, M. J., McGee, G., McNulty, S., Nadelhoffer, K., Ollinger, S., Ross, D., Rueth, H., Rustad, L., Schaberg, P., Schiff, S., Schleppi, P., Spoelstra, J., and Wessel, W.: Regional assessment of N saturation using foliar and root delta N-15, Biogeochemistry, 80, 143-171, 2006.

Pepper, D. A., Eliasson, P. E., McMurtrie, R. E., Corbeels, M., Agren, G. I., Stromgren, M., and Linder, S.: Simulated mechanisms of soil N feedback on the forest CO₂ response, Glob. Change Biol., 13, 1265–1281, 2007.

5

15

Savard, M. M., Begin, C., Smirnoff, A., Marion, J., and Rioux-Paguette, E.: Tree-ring nitrogen

isotopes reflect anthropogenic NO, emissions and climatic effects, Environ. Sci. Technol., 10 43, 604-609, doi:10.1021/es802437k, 2009.

Savard, M. M.: Tree-ring stable isotopes and historical perspectives on pollution - an overview, Environ. Pollut., 158, 2007–2013, doi:10.1016/j.envpol.2009.11.031, 2010.

Schimel, J. P. and Bennett, J.: Nitrogen mineralization: challenges of a changing paradigm, Ecology, 85, 591-602, 2004.

- Showalter, A. M.: Structure and function of plant cell wall proteins, The Plant Cell, 5, 9–23, 1993.
- Stoddard, J. L., Jeffries, D. S., Lukewille, A., Clair, T. A., Dillon, P. J., Driscoll, C. T., Forsius, M., Johannessen, M., Kahl, J. S., Kellogg, J. H., Kemp, A., Mannio, J., Monteith, D. T., Mur-
- doch, P. S., Patrick, S., Rebsdorf, A., Skjelkvale, B. L., Stainton, M. P., Traaen, T., van 20 Dam, H., Webster, K. E., Wieting, J., and Wilander, A.: Regional trends in aquatic recovery from acidification in North America and Europe, Nature, 401, 575–578, 1999.
 - Templer, P. H., and Dawson, T. E.: Nitrogen uptake by four tree species of the Catskill Mountains, New York: implications for forest N dynamics, Plant Soil, 262, 251–261, 2004.

Discussion Pa	B(8, 5935–5	GD 954, 2011						
per	Nitrogen is hardwoo	Nitrogen isotopes in hardwood forests						
Discussion	K. K. McLa J. M. (K. K. McLauchlan and J. M. Craine						
Pape	Title Page							
er	Abstract	Introduction						
D	Conclusions	References						
iscussi	Tables	Figures						
on P	14	►I						
aper	•							
—	Back	Close						
Discu	Full Scre	een / Esc						
ssion	Printer-friendly Version							
) Pap	Interactive	Discussion						
ber	(

Table 1. Simple linear regressions between wood δ^{15} N and year of wood formation for eighteen trees sampled in Indiana, USA. The slope is since 1900. Tree diameter (diam) is based on the length of increment bore. First year is the earliest date for wood analyzed, not the pith date or year established.

Site	Species	First year (C.E.)	Diam (cm)	r ²	т	Р
Black Rock Barrens	Carya ovata	1943	26	0.91	-0.038	< 0.001*
	Quercus alba	1920	45	0.00	0.001	0.83
	Quercus alba	1938	22	0.33	-0.013	0.03*
Bryan Woods	Carya ovata	1872	44	0.37	-0.014	0.002*
	Acer saccharum	1948	30	0.71	-0.027	< 0.001*
	Quercus alba	1855	74	0.16	0.010	0.05*
Cumberland Woods	Carya ovata	1861	45	0.29	-0.011	0.05*
	Acer saccharum	1938	55	0.69	-0.017	< 0.001*
	Quercus alba	1881	19	0.01	0.002	0.68
McCormick Woods	Carya ovata	1872	80	0.61	-0.008	<0.001*
	Acer saccharum	1893	33	0.65	-0.017	<0.001*
	Quercus alba	1893	42	0.36	0.013	0.001*
Purdue Arboretum	Fagus grandifolia	1916	44	0.30	-0.015	0.01*
	Acer saccharum	1922	46	0.55	-0.011	< 0.001*
	Quercus alba	1939	46	0.55	0.028	< 0.001*
Rosebank Woodlot	Carya ovata	1856	74	0.66	-0.018	< 0.001*
	Quercus alba	1863	37	0.62	0.019	< 0.001*
	Acer saccharum	1953	33	0.62	-0.039	< 0.001*

BGD 8, 5935-5954, 2011 Nitrogen isotopes in hardwood forests K. K. McLauchlan and J. M. Craine **Title Page** Abstract Introduction Conclusions References Tables Figures 14 Close Back Full Screen / Esc **Printer-friendly Version** Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

Discussion Paper

Discussion Paper

Discussion Paper



Fig. 1. Locations of six study sites in Indiana, with interpolated N deposition from the National Atmospheric Deposition Program, ecoregions delineated by the World Wildlife Fund, and topography from the United States Geological Survey. On the lower panel, 1 is Cumberland Woods, 2 is Rosebank Woods, 3 is McCormick Woods, 4 is Black Rock Barrens, 5 is Purdue Arboretum, and 6 is Bryan Woods.





Fig. 2. Wood δ^{15} N over time standardized to the same mean (0‰) across sites for *Quercus alba* (solid circles) and three other hardwood species (*Carya ovata, Fagus grandifolia,* and *Acer saccharum,* open circles). Lines represent piecewise linear regression. Inflection dates are 1986 for *Quercus alba* and 1980 for the other species.





Fig. 3. Wood (N) over time. The thin line is a spline fit for *Quercus* wood, while the thick line is a spline fit for the three other hardwood species.





Fig. 4. Nitrogen characteristics of wood samples from each individual tree sampled. For each increment bore, solid circles indicate wood δ^{15} N, open circles are wood N concentrations, the solid line is 1900 C.E. and the dashed line is the heartwood-sapwood transition.

