

Interactive comment on “Paleofires and the dynamics of carbon cycling in Chinese Loess Plateau over the last two glacial cycles” by X. Wang and Z. L. Ding

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 7 July 2011

This letter constructs my review of the manuscript titled “Paleofires and the dynamics of carbon cycling in Chinese Loess Plateau over the last two glacial cycles” by X. Wang and Z. L. Ding for Biogeosciences Discuss.

The subject of this manuscript is a quantitative estimation of regional carbon release by paleofires over the last two glacial cycles, based on the vegetation specific emission factors and black carbon records in three loess sections along a south-north transect in China. I recognize that the subject of this manuscript is certainly interesting and that to clarify it is an important issue. However, very unfortunately, this manuscript has discussed it roughly and fuzzy very much. Particularly, although the authors have

C1840

said “quantitative estimation” in a number of places in the manuscript, they have never discussed about how much errors (e.g. precision and accuracy) include in the estimate for the proxies used in this study. Probably, many of readers of this manuscript want to know, for example, is a difference in the BBF/ANPP ratio between glacial and interglacial periods significant or insignificant? I feel that at least the authors need very careful consideration for potential error in all of proxies used in this study before making discussion. I feel significant revision it is necessary if this manuscript obtains the standard quality for publication in Biogeosciences Discuss.

Sincerely,

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 8, 4459, 2011.

C1841