Biogeosciences Discuss., 8, C2111–C2112, 2011
www.biogeosciences-discuss.net/8/C2111/2011/

Biogeosciences Discussions

Interactive comment on "Rainfall patterns after fire differentially affect the recruitment of three Mediterranean shrubs" *by* J. M. Moreno et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 21 July 2011

General comments The study shows interesting insights into germination and the recruitment success of Mediterranean species in response to rainfall variability between years. Such data are rare and thus the study approach and results are an important contribution in understanding successional changes in fire-prone plant communities. Therefore the manuscript should be presented in Biogeosciences. However, improvements are necessary. To avoid repeating, I strongly agree with the critics raised by referee #1. Although a sophisticated study design was used and described, it is hard for the reader to follow. Perhaps an additional graph would clarify and help to explain the design better. Many and difficult to read figures were used. Only figures that are necessary to understand the main message of the study should be left. Considerable attention must be paid to language improvement. For example, the term "much" is used too often. Consulting a native speaker is recommended before publishing. Spe-

cific comments A fire in the middle of the fire season could have helped to improve the experiment, without the study could just have measured "extreme" values. Some references mentioned refer to canopy-stored seed banks and not soil seed banks. However this is not highlighted in the manuscript. I disagree that fire season do not play a role in plant establishment (P5772 L14-20). Please see e.g. Whelan & York 1998 and Heelemann et al 2008 - their studies in areas with lacking or changing rainfall seasonality also show a change in best fire season for recruitment success. Fig. 1 shows a rainfall season with the impression that two rainfall peaks exist. Was there a change in rainfall seasonality in the last decades? Fig. 2 and 5 could just be explained within the text. Bar plots should also show variances. Figures could show all plots (18) instead of only 6 for the categories. Technical comments P5762 L19-20 Use dots for genus names P5770 L6 dependent P5770 L13 event-dependent P5772 L1 rewording "So, . . ."

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 8, 5761, 2011.