

Interactive comment on “Rainfall patterns after fire differentially affect the recruitment of three Mediterranean shrubs” by J. M. Moreno et al.

Anonymous Referee #4

Received and published: 14 August 2011

This paper presents an in depth study of the variability of germination and recruitment after fire relative to rainfall. It presents important data with respect to one of the primary drivers of germination and recruitment success after fire and so gives insight into community dynamics. I agree with the other reviewers that it has strong merit but that clarity is a problem and the manuscript could benefit from revision. The manuscript should explicitly show were the precipitation over the course of the study falls with respect to long term variability in precipitation. As mentioned by referee #1, the authors reference Figure 1(a) to say that the precipitation reflects the long term variability but include only the long-term mean. It would be informative to know if some of the variability in germination is compensated for by density dependence in recruitment although it is not clear that the authors have sufficient data to address this. Minor comments – 1) A figure depicting the experimental layout would help clarify the experimental design.

C2468

2) Recommend changing the last sentence in the legend of figure 5 to say, “Each point is the mean of the three plots in each year-by-season treatment.”

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 8, 5761, 2011.