Biogeosciences Discuss., 8, C315–C317, 2011 www.biogeosciences-discuss.net/8/C315/2011/ © Author(s) 2011. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



Interactive comment on "How accurately can soil organic carbon stocks and stock changes be quantified by soil inventories?" *by* M. Schrumpf et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 21 March 2011

Dear Editor,

In the submitted paper, Schrumpf and colleagues deal with a very important topic related to soil carbon studies i.e. the accuracy in determination of soil Organic carbon stock chages. The argument is well within the topics of BG. One very important topic adressed by the paper is the use of PTF and associated errors to estimate BG. To me this topic is very important and not discussed prevolusly elsewere. As demonstrated by the authors, considering or not the errors associated with the application of PTF can affect the ability to detect changes in soil C stocks. To me the reached results are sufficient to support the interpretations and conclusions. The methods are sound and

C315

the initial soil sampling design was accurately planned. The language is fluent and precise. Also the data seems to be correctly processed from the statistical poit of view.

In my opinion the paper is suitable for pubblication in BG.

Minor comments:

*It doesn't seem that you refer to data normality. Was it tested on the initial data and eventually accounted for in the statistical analysis? Usually soil-related parameters are non-normally distributed.

*Eq.(1): can you add a reference?

*Page 732, line 12: can you add a reference for PTF?

*Page 735, line 7: convert the data in kg/m2 since later it is so (page 740, line 5). Check that all the reported values have consistent units: i.e. stocks in kg/m2 and MDD in g/m2.

*Page 743, line 3: be aware that most literature reported PTF were developed for agricultural soils.

*Please also see Ellert, B.H., H.H. Janzen, and B.G. McConkey. 2000 (ref. below): they state that the equivalent soil mass technique should be applied to agricultural soils only. Can you comment on that?

I would suggest to add these additional references that could enhace and strenghten the paper itself:

Ellert, B.H., H.H. Janzen, and B.G. McConkey. 2000. Measuring and comparing soil carbon storage. p. 131–146. In R. Lal et al. (ed.) Assessment methods for soil carbon. Lewis imprint of the CRC Press, Boca Raton, FL.

Rodeghiero et al., Forest Ecology and Management, 259: 1093-1101.

Saby et al., 2008 – Will European soil-monitoring networks be able to detect changes

in topsoil organic carbon content? GCB, 14: 1-11.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 8, 723, 2011.

C317