

Interactive comment on “Effect of salinity induced pH changes on benthic foraminifera: a laboratory culture experiment” by R. Saraswat et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 11 October 2011

General comments: My main concern with this manuscript is the experimental design. Since pH and salinity co-vary in all treatments, it is not possible to distinguish between the effects of these two parameters. Thus, the authors' conclusions are not supported.

Specific comments: (1) Contrary to the authors' assumption, there are several papers available which describe the effect of ocean acidification on benthic foraminifera (at least one of these papers has been published in Biogeosciences) (2) pH was measured using an electrode. The authors need to provide details on how measurements were conducted, report precision of the measurements, and need to indicate which pH scale they used (see “Guide to best practices for ocean acidification research and data reporting”; Riebesell et al., 2010). (3) It would have been preferable if the authors had measured a second carbonate system parameter (see “Guide to best practices

C3546

for ocean acidification research and data reporting”; Riebesell et al., 2010) (3) Even though experiments were conducted in replicates, no statistical tests were performed (4) Results and discussion sections are very confusing

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 8, 8423, 2011.

C3547