Biogeosciences Discuss., 8, C3725–C3726, 2011 www.biogeosciences-discuss.net/8/C3725/2011/

© Author(s) 2011. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



Interactive comment on "Above- and below-ground response to soil moisture change on an alpine wetland ecosystem in the Qinghai-Tibetan Plateau, China" by G.-L. Wu et al.

D. Zona (Editor)

donatella.zona@ua.ac.be

Received and published: 21 October 2011

I requested another revision. See below, reviewer's comment:

In their paper 'Above- and below-ground response to soil moisture change on an alpine wetland ecosystem in the Qinghai-Tibetan Plateau, China', Wu et al. study vegetation characteristics along gradient of soil moisture in alpine ecosystems. As far as I understand from their paper they measured soil moisture content only once, namely at the occasion of vegetation and soil sampling. I doubt that this approach gives any information on how the factor moisture affects vegetation. First, the authors did not study moisture change but soil moisture at different sites, making it impossible to relate

C3725

factor and response as many other factors such as global radiation, duration of snow coverage, management etc. which drive vegetation community and productivity may vary together with moisture. Second, they measured soil moisture only once. As soil moisture is one of the most variable soil properties reliable information on soil moisture characteristics should provide a high resolution in time with time series of at least 2-3 years and ideally also include soil water retention characteristics. Both information is missing here, minimizing the scientific value of the manuscript.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 8, 7141, 2011.