

***Interactive comment on “Effects of climate variability and functional changes on the interannual variation of the carbon balance in a temperate deciduous forest” by J. Wu et al.***

**G. Wohlfahrt (Editor)**

georg.wohlfahrt@uibk.ac.at

Received and published: 31 October 2011

The discussion phase of ms bg-2011-315 is ending on 4 November and because the paper received contrasting reviews around which a controversial discussion arose, I feel compelled to contribute an editor comment.

I do not follow the arguments and recommendations of reviewer #2 regarding an inappropriate model choice. Rather I agree with the reply of the authors to reviewer #2 in that the chose approach, even if empirical, is able to address the intended question. Given the discussion initiated by the comments of reviewer #2 I suggest the authors to turn this into a strength of the paper and pick up on this issue in the discussion section

C4030

of the ms and discuss the pros and cons of the chose approach (note that it is possible to cite the contributed reviewer and short comments).

My major concerns with the present version of the ms are along the lines of the comments of reviewer #1 and Werner Eugster in that the authors need to make a stronger case why their paper makes a significant contribution and not to simply repeat previous analysis at a different site. I thus suggest to considerably improve the paper in this regard - Werner Eugster made several useful suggestions to this end.

---

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 8, 9125, 2011.