Biogeosciences Discuss., 8, C5451–C5452, 2012 www.biogeosciences-discuss.net/8/C5451/2012/ © Author(s) 2012. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



BGD

8, C5451–C5452, 2012

Interactive Comment

Interactive comment on "Indications for a ubiquitous dissolved pigment degradation product in subsurface waters of the global ocean" by R. Röttgers and B. P. Koch

G. Kattner (Editor)

gerhard.kattner@awi.de

Received and published: 23 January 2012

Dear authors, Thank you for your comments on the reviews of your manuscript. The reviewers expressed considerable concerns on the novelty of your findings which they found is mostly just the use of SPE-DOM samples instead of direct measurements. They also see the need to combine the data with other general data. Although the manuscript will be part of a special issue it should be as complete to be understandable independently of the other publications. I agree that it is not possible to identify the compounds responsible for the substance(s) behind the absorption shoulder with the analytical possibilities of today. The question is then however, is the manuscript





innovative enough for publication in Biogeosciences?

Please also try to include and discuss the work of other authors as recommended by the reviewers. You should also think about expanding the paper as suggested by Ref. #2 to make the paper more substantially. As the manuscript stands now it is more or less a description of a shoulder in the absorption spectra found in this study but probably also worldwide in the oceans.

I see the need for major revisions on the manuscript according to the reviewer's comments. There are some suggestions where you disagree with the reviewers. I however see that you should consider their suggestions as I wrote above. Otherwise it might be difficult to accept a revised version. Because both reviewers were very similar in their concerns and suggestions the manuscript will be reviewed again by at least one of the reviewers.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 8, 10697, 2011.

BGD

8, C5451–C5452, 2012

Interactive Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

